

HIGH SCHOOL

One year in, WIAA competitive balance plan unmitigated disaster that hurts public schools



Tom Dombek

Manitowoc Herald Times Reporter

Aug. 5, 2025, 3:00 a.m. CT

With football practices beginning across the state, another Wisconsin high school sports year is set to begin.

And for a second year, the Wisconsin Interscholastic Athletic Association's [competitive balance performance factor](#) is in place.

The plan penalizes teams in nearly all sports, swimming and diving and track and field are excluded, for simply winning.

I wrote about my thoughts when the plan was first announced over two years ago, and [I was not a fan](#).

Now that we've seen it in action, I'm even more convinced the plan is an unmitigated disaster and an utter failure.

Need a break? [Play the USA TODAY Daily Crossword Puzzle.](#)

Teams accrue points by being successful and if you have six or more during a three-year period and get bumped up a division in that sport.

Win a state title: 4 points.

Championship appearance: 3 points.

Reach state semifinals: 2 points.

State quarterfinal or sectional final appearance in non-football sports; Level 3 of 11-player football or Level 2 of 8-player football: 1 point.

I said two years ago, it teaches children that if things are too tough, just complain and the problem will go away.

Make no mistake, the WIAA was merely doing what the member schools wanted. Schools are tired losing to the same schools over and over, although the animosity is more geared towards the private schools such as St. Mary's Springs, Notre Dame and Catholic Memorial.

Ever since the plan has been approved and now implemented I have yet to hear one person say it's a good idea or has been beneficial.

There's usually a fair amount of language which isn't fit to print or really use around the players coaches and administrators are advocating for.

One year in, all the plan has done is water down the state tournaments and hurt schools that were never supposed to be in the plan's cross hairs to begin with.

The old adage about being careful what you wish for and all that.

More girls soccer: [Who made the 2025 Lakeshore Elite girls soccer team and was player of the year?](#)

At its core, high school sports is about teaching lessons that players will use for rest of their lives. But, as a by product, you want to see the best teams win.

Teams that exemplify all those lessons and ideals, instead those teams are now being punished for things many of them never even experienced.

Nowhere is this more evident than in girls sports, especially basketball and soccer.

The Laconia Spartans girls basketball team reached state three-straight years and won the Division 4 title in 2023 and 2024.

Laconia would have won it again in 2025, but instead were bumped up to Division 3 and lost a thrilling state semifinal to eventual champion Oostburg.

More girls sports: [Who will be the top girls athlete for 2024-25 in Manitowoc and Sheboygan? Vote here](#)

A likely three-peat was stopped — not by a team of the Spartans size — but one bigger and with three future NCAA Division I players.

In girls soccer, after long runs of success in Division 4 both the Kiel Raiders and Cedar Grove-Belgium Rockets were forced to play up in Division 3 this past spring.

Kiel defeated Cedar Grove-Belgium in the sectional finals, but the Raiders fell in the state semifinals.

Either of those two teams would have defeated eventual Division 4 state champion, and private school, Xavier.

Notice how I'm not mentioning private schools, but public, who are being denied opportunities for the simple reason of being too good?

Simply put, the best teams aren't winning while also punishing student-athletes from public schools.

That's an unmitigated disaster.

Contact Tom Dombeck at [920-686-2965](tel:920-686-2965) or ortdombeck@htrnews.com. Follow him on X, formerly known as Twitter, at [@Tom_Dombeck](https://twitter.com/Tom_Dombeck).