

**DATE:**

08/31/2023

**AGENDA ITEM (ACTION ITEM):**

Consider/Approve awarding of the Snow Removal & Salting Bid to A&A Lawncare, Brightview Landscapes, and HD Clemons Snow Removal as indicated on the Snow Removal & Salting bid tabulation, for the period of October 1, 2023 through April 30, 2024, with three mutually agreed upon annual renewals available; reject the proposed bids for ice melt and rock salt due to budget constraints and enter into competitive negotiations to secure these items.

**APPLICABLE BOARD POLICY:**

Fiscal Management 04.32 AP.1

**HISTORY/BACKGROUND:**

An advertisement to accept sealed bids for Snow Removal & Salting was posted on the district website on August 14, 2023. Bids were publicly opened on August 28, 2023 at 1:00 PM EST. This bid has three optional renewals. Due to budget constraints we are requesting to reject the proposed bids for ice melt and rock salt. On Friday, September 8, 2023, written communication was received from Malco Services to withdraw their proposal due to submitting wrong pricing. The request was approved. Any locations that were recommended to be awarded to Malco Services, are being recommended to the next best evaluated proposal.

**FISCAL/BUDGETARY IMPACT:**

Service will be provided based on weather conditions. For this reason, budget estimates are unable to be determined.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Approval to award the Snow Removal & Salting Bid to A&A Lawncare, Brightview Landscapes, and HD Clemons Snow Removal as indicated on the Snow Removal & Salting bid tabulation, for the period of October 1, 2023 through April 30, 2024, with three mutually agreed upon annual renewals available; reject the proposed bids for ice melt and rock salt due to budget constraints and enter into competitive negotiations to secure these items.

**CONTACT PERSON:**

Jennifer Weis-Smith

  
Principal/Administrator

  
District Administrator

  
Superintendent

Use this form to submit your request to the Superintendent for items to be added to the Board Meeting Agenda.  
Principal –complete, print, sign and send to your Director. Director –if approved, sign and put in the Superintendent's mailbox.

# Kenton County School District Snow Removal Services Bid Tabulation

	A&A Lawncare	Brightview Landscapes	HD Clemons	<del>Malco</del>	MP Services
<b>Beechgrove Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)	80.00	56.11		*Proposal Withdrawn	
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)	3.43	5.30			
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)	6.00	7.00			
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>	<b>89.43</b>	<b>68.41</b>			
<b>Cawwood/Turkey Foot Campus</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)	80.00	76.64			
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)	3.43	5.30			
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)	6.00	7.00			
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>	<b>89.43</b>	<b>88.94</b>			
<b>Dixie Heights High School</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00		*Proposal Withdrawn	
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)		7.00			
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>92.30</b>			
<b>Ft. Wright Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		20.32	80.00		
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30	6.90		
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)		7.00	9.00		
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>32.62</b>	<b>95.90</b>		
<b>Hinsdale Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)	80.00	39.45		*Proposal Withdrawn	
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)	3.43	5.30			
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)	6.00	7.00			
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>	<b>89.43</b>	<b>51.75</b>			
<b>Kenton/Simon Kenton Campus</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00			49.81
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			7.73
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)		7.00			7.00
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>92.30</b>			<b>64.55</b>
<b>Piner Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		41.78	80.00		
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30	6.90		
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)		7.00	9.00		
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>54.08</b>	<b>95.90</b>		

**Kenton County School District  
Snow Removal Services Bid Tabulation**

	A&A Lawncare	Brightview Landscapes	HD Clemons	Malco	MP Services
<b>River Ridge Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		41.78			
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)					
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>47.08</b>			
<b>Ryland Heights Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		16.82	80.00		
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30	6.90		
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)			9.00		
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>22.12</b>	<b>95.90</b>		
<b>Taylor Mill Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00			0.00
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			7.73
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)					7.00
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>85.30</b>			<b>14.73</b>
<b>Scott/Woodland Campus</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00			60.11
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			7.73
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)					7.00
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>85.30</b>			<b>74.85</b>
<b>Summit View Academy</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00			48.95
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			7.73
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)					7.00
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>85.30</b>			<b>63.69</b>
<b>Twenhofel Middle</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		80.00			37.42
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30			7.73
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)					7.00
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>85.30</b>			<b>52.15</b>
<b>Whites Tower Elementary</b>					
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)		17.01	80.00	*Proposal Withdrawn	
Quality of Service Score (10 Points Possible)		5.30	6.90		
Reference Score (10 Points Possible)			9.00		
<b>Total Score (100 Points Possible)</b>		<b>22.31</b>	<b>95.90</b>		



# Snow Removal Pricing

	A & A Lawncare							Brightview Landscapes							HD Clemons Snow Removal							Malco Services*							MP Services									
School	1.0"-1.9"	2.0"-4.0"	4.1"-7.0"	7.1"-10.0"	Salt Only	Total		1.0"-1.9"	2.0"-4.0"	4.1"-7.0"	7.1"-10.0"	Salt Only	Total		1.0"-1.9"	2.0"-4.0"	4.1"-7.0"	7.1"-10.0"	Salt Only	Total		1.0"-1.9"	2.0"-4.0"	4.1"-7.0"	7.1"-10.0"	Salt Only	Total		1.0"-1.9"	2.0"-4.0"	4.1"-7.0"	7.1"-10.0"	Salt Only	Total				
Beechgrove Elementary	\$ 1,320	\$ 1,320	\$ 1,510	\$ 1,510	\$ 750	\$ 6,410		\$ 1,055	\$ 1,477	\$ 2,216	\$ 2,880	\$ 696	\$ 8,324		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ -600	\$ -650	\$ -800	\$ -1,000	\$ -750	\$ -3,700		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)							80.00								56.11																							
Cawwood/Turkey Foot Campus	\$ 4,125	\$ 4,350	\$ 5,250	\$ 5,750	\$ 2,250	\$21,725		\$ 2,880	\$ 4,032	\$ 6,048	\$ 7,862	\$ 1,816	\$22,638		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)							80.00								76.64																							
Dixie Heights High School	No bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 1,510	\$ 2,114	\$ 3,171	\$ 4,122	\$ 920	\$11,837		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ -3,600	\$ -2,950	\$ -4,550	\$ -5,150	\$ -3,000	\$ -19,150		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																							
Ft. Wright Elementary	No bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 780	\$ 1,092	\$ 1,638	\$ 2,129	\$ 472	\$ 6,111		\$ 400	\$ 600	\$ 800	\$ 1,000	\$ 700	\$ 3,500		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															20.32								80.00															
Hinsdale Elementary	\$ 1,320	\$ 1,320	\$ 1,510	\$ 1,510	\$ 750	\$ 6,410		\$ 865	\$ 4,032	\$ 1,817	\$ 2,361	\$ 584	\$ 9,659		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ -600	\$ -750	\$ -900	\$ -1,050	\$ -750	\$ -4,050		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)							80.00								39.45																							
Kenton/Simon Kenton Campus	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 2,745	\$ 3,843	\$ 5,765	\$ 7,494	\$ 1,600	\$21,447		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid			No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 5,030	\$ 6,320	\$ 7,370	\$ 8,420	\$ 2,400	\$29,540				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																						49.81	
Pinet Elementary	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 650	\$ 910	\$ 1,365	\$ 1,775	\$ 472	\$ 5,172		\$ 400	\$ 600	\$ 800	\$ 1,000	\$ 700	\$ 3,500		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															41.78								80.00															
River Ridge Elementary	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 1,077	\$ 1,508	\$ 2,262	\$ 3,393	\$ 704	\$ 8,944		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																							
Ryland Heights Elementary	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 800	\$ 1,120	\$ 1,680	\$ 2,184	\$ 480	\$ 6,264		\$ 400	\$ 600	\$ 800	\$ 1,000	\$ 700	\$ 3,500		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															16.82								80.00															
Taylor Mill Elementary	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 800	\$ 1,120	\$ 1,680	\$ 2,184	\$ 472	\$ 6,256		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 2,275	\$ 2,800	\$ 3,273	\$ 3,683	\$ 1,225	\$13,256				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																						0.00	
Scott/Woodland Campus	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 4,386	\$ 6,140	\$ 9,211	\$ 11,974	\$ 2,488	\$34,199		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 7,700	\$ 9,100	\$10,500	\$ 11,900	\$ 3,500	\$42,700				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																						60.11	
Summit View Academy	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 2,360	\$ 3,304	\$ 4,956	\$ 6,443	\$ 1,488	\$18,551		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 4,330	\$ 5,390	\$ 6,440	\$ 7,490	\$ 2,100	\$25,750				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																						48.95	
Twenhofel Middle	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 2,135	\$ 2,989	\$ 4,484	\$ 5,829	\$ 1,368	\$16,805		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 4,330	\$ 5,390	\$ 6,440	\$ 7,490	\$ 2,100	\$25,750				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															80.00																						37.42	
Whites Tower Elementary	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	No Bid	\$ -		\$ 800	\$ 1,120	\$ 1,680	\$ 2,184	\$ 472	\$ 6,256		\$ 400	\$ 600	\$ 800	\$ 1,000	\$ 700	\$ 3,500		\$ -600	\$ -750	\$ -900	\$ -1,050	\$ -750	\$ -4,050		\$ 1,650	\$ 2,025	\$ 2,362	\$ 2,654	\$ 900	\$ 9,591				
Cost Score (80 Points Possible)															17.01								80.00															0.00

\* Malco Services withdrew their proposal on Friday, September 8, 2023 via written communication.

### Quality of Service

	A&A Lawncare	Brightview Landscapes	HD Clemons	Malco	MP Services
<b>1 Experience</b>					
Evaluator 1	3.00	4.00	8.00	8.00	10.00
Evaluator 2	7.00	4.00	7.00	7.00	5.00
Evaluator 3	0.00	0.00	9.00	7.00	8.00
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>3.33</b>	<b>2.67</b>	<b>8.00</b>	<b>7.33</b>	<b>7.67</b>
<b>Points Awarded (3 Points Possible)</b>	<b>1.00</b>	<b>0.80</b>	<b>2.40</b>	<b>2.20</b>	<b>2.30</b>
<b>2 Fleet</b>					
Evaluator 1	3.00	8.00	7.00	5.00	8.00
Evaluator 2	6.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	7.00
Evaluator 3	2.00	6.00	7.00	2.00	8.00
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>3.67</b>	<b>6.33</b>	<b>6.33</b>	<b>4.00</b>	<b>7.67</b>
<b>Points Awarded (3 Points Possible)</b>	<b>1.10</b>	<b>1.90</b>	<b>1.90</b>	<b>1.20</b>	<b>2.30</b>
<b>3 Staff Experience</b>					
Evaluator 1	2.00	2.00	8.00	8.00	8.00
Evaluator 2	7.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	7.00
Evaluator 3	2.00	5.00	9.00	2.00	8.00
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>3.67</b>	<b>4.00</b>	<b>7.33</b>	<b>5.00</b>	<b>7.67</b>
<b>Points Awarded (2 Points Possible)</b>	<b>0.73</b>	<b>0.80</b>	<b>1.47</b>	<b>1.00</b>	<b>1.53</b>
<b>4 Implementation Strategy</b>					
Evaluator 1	3.00	10.00	5.00	7.00	8.00
Evaluator 2	4.00	7.00	5.00	5.00	7.00
Evaluator 3	2.00	10.00	7.00	5.00	9.00
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>3.00</b>	<b>9.00</b>	<b>5.67</b>	<b>5.67</b>	<b>8.00</b>
<b>Points Awarded (2 Points Possible)</b>	<b>0.60</b>	<b>1.80</b>	<b>1.13</b>	<b>1.13</b>	<b>1.60</b>
<b>Total Points Awarded</b>	<b>3.43</b>	<b>5.30</b>	<b>6.90</b>	<b>5.53</b>	<b>7.73</b>

## References

**A&A Lawncare\***

**Brightview Services**

**HD Clemons\***

**Malco\***

**MP Services\***

REFERENCES					
Reference 1	6	7	9	9	7
Reference 2		7			
Reference 3					
<i>Average Score</i>	6	7	9	9	7
<b>Points Awarded</b>	<b>6.00</b>	<b>7.00</b>	<b>9.00</b>	<b>9.00</b>	<b>7.00</b>

**\* = The Kenton County School District was the sole reference for these companies**