



Kenton County School District | It's about ALL kids.

**THE KENTON COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION**

1055 EATON DRIVE, FORT WRIGHT, KENTUCKY 41017

TELEPHONE: (859) 344-8888 / FAX: (859) 344-1531

WEBSITE: [www.kenton.kyschools.us](http://www.kenton.kyschools.us)

Dr. Henry Webb, Superintendent of Schools

**KCSD ISSUE PAPER**

**DATE:**

08/05/19

**AGENDA ITEM (ACTION ITEM):**

Consider/Approve awarding of the HVAC Service Bid to Air Force One (Group A) and Peck, Hannaford, and Briggs (Group B) as indicated on the HVAC Service Bid Tabulation 2019 for the period of August 6, 2019 through June 30, 2020 with three optional mutually agreed upon annual renewals.

**APPLICABLE BOARD POLICY:**

Fiscal Management 04.32 AP.1

**HISTORY/BACKGROUND:**

An advertisement to accept sealed bids for HVAC Service was posted on the district website on June 5, 2019. Bids were publicly opened on June 18, 2019 at 2:00 pm est.

**FISCAL/BUDGETARY IMPACT:**

The evaluated amount is \$142,140.00. This is an estimated amount and will change based upon need.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Approval to award the HVAC Service Bid to Air Force One (Group A) and Peck, Hannaford, and Briggs (Group B) as indicated on the HVAC Service Bid Tabulation 2019 for the period of August 6, 2019 through June 30, 2020 with three optional mutually agreed upon annual renewals.

**CONTACT PERSON:**

David Lloyd

Principal

District Administrator

Superintendent

Use this form to submit your request to the Superintendent for items to be added to the Board Meeting Agenda.

Principal –complete, print, sign and send to your Director. Director –if approved, sign and put in the Superintendent's mailbox.

**Kenton County Board of Education**

Board Members: Carl Wicklund, Chairperson Karen L. Collins, Vice Chairperson Carla Egan Shannon Herold Jesica Jehn

"The Kenton County Board of Education provides Equal Education & Employment Opportunities."

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| <b>Item Description</b>         | <b>Air Force One</b> | <b>Comfort<br/>Systems USA</b> | <b>Debra<br/>Kuempel</b> | <b>Ivey<br/>Mechanical</b> | <b>Peck,<br/>Hannaford &amp;<br/>Briggs</b> | <b>Trane</b> |
|---------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|
| <b>Group A - Pricing</b>        | 72,340.00            | 63,520.00                      | 68,534.00                | 79,816.00                  | 60,882.00                                   | 162,380.00   |
| <b>Pricing Scores</b>           | 32.47                | 38.27                          | 34.97                    | 27.56                      | 40.00                                       | -26.69       |
| <b>Service Scores</b>           | 15.00                | 9.00                           | 18.00                    | 13.00                      | 17.00                                       | 6.00         |
| <b>Reference Scores</b>         |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Company A                       | 8.00                 |                                |                          | 9.90                       | 10.00                                       | 9.00         |
| Company B                       |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Company C                       |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Kenton County Schools           |                      | 8                              | 5                        |                            | 8.5   |              |
| Reference Scores                | 24.00                | 24.00                          | 15.00                    | 29.70                      | 27.75                                       | 27.00        |
| <b>Presentations/Interviews</b> | 19.00                | 13.50                          | 7.00                     | 12.00                      | 15.00                                       |              |
| <b>Total Score - Group A</b>    | 90.47                | 84.77                          | 74.97                    | 82.26                      | 99.75                                       | 6.31         |
|                                 |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| <b>Item Description</b>         | <b>Air Force One</b> | <b>Comfort<br/>Systems USA</b> | <b>Debra<br/>Kuempel</b> | <b>Ivey<br/>Mechanical</b> | <b>Peck,<br/>Hannaford &amp;<br/>Briggs</b> | <b>Trane</b> |
|---------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|
| <b>Group B - Pricing</b>        | 90,204.00            | 76,360.00                      | 83,214.00                | 96,116.00                  | 69,800.00                                   | 186,652.00   |
| <b>Pricing Scores</b>           | 28.31                | 36.24                          | 32.31                    | 24.92                      | 40.00                                       | -26.96       |
| <b>Service Scores</b>           | 15.00                | 9.00                           | 18.00                    | 13.00                      | 17.00                                       | 6.00         |
| <b>Reference Scores</b>         |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Company A                       | 8.00                 |                                |                          | 9.90                       | 10.00                                       | 9.00         |
| Company B                       |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Company C                       |                      |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Kenton County Schools           |                      | 8                              | 5                        |                            | 8.5   |              |
| Reference Scores                | 24.00                | 24.00                          | 15.00                    | 29.70                      | 27.75                                       | 27.00        |
| <b>Presentations/Interviews</b> | 19.00                | 13.50                          | 7.00                     | 12.00                      | 15.00                                       |              |
| <b>Total Score (Group B)</b>    | 86.31                | 82.74                          | 72.31                    | 79.62                      | 99.75                                       | 6.04         |

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| Item Description | Air Force One | Comfort<br>Systems USA | Debra<br>Kuempel | Ivey<br>Mechanical | Peck,<br>Hannaford &<br>Briggs | Trane |
|------------------|---------------|------------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------------------------------|-------|
|------------------|---------------|------------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------------------------------|-------|

**PRICING EVALUATION:**

|                 | Air Force One | Peck,<br>Hannaford, &<br>Briggs |
|-----------------|---------------|---------------------------------|
| Group A Pricing | 72,340.00     | 60,882.00                       |
| Group B Pricing | 90,204.00     | 69,800.00                       |

|                                   |            |
|-----------------------------------|------------|
| Air Force One Group A             | 72,340.00  |
| Peck, Hannaford, & Briggs Group B | 69,800.00  |
| Total                             | 142,140.00 |

|                                   |            |
|-----------------------------------|------------|
| Air Force One Group B             | 90,204.00  |
| Peck, Hannaford, & Briggs Group A | 60,882.00  |
| Total                             | 151,086.00 |

- Recommended as the best evaluated bid.

*Note: "It is the intention of the Board to award this contract to two potential bidders, one for Group A and one for Group B. If one bidder is best evaluated in both groups, the next best evaluated bidders will also be selected, and the two groups (A & B) will be awarded based upon what is in the best financial interest of the district." This occurred in Group B. In order to select two companies, the total dollars were evaluated based upon each group. Debra Kuempel was lower in Group A and Peck, Hannaford, & Briggs was lower in Group B.*

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| <b>Item Description</b>                          | <b>Air Force<br/>One</b> | <b>Comfort<br/>Systems USA</b> | <b>Debra<br/>Kuempel</b> | <b>Ivey<br/>Mechanical</b> | <b>Peck,<br/>Hannaford<br/>&amp; Briggs</b> | <b>Trane</b> |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|
| <b>Guaranteed Response Time (Hours)</b>          | <b>2</b>                 | <b>2</b>                       | <b>2</b>                 | <b>2</b>                   | <b>2</b>                                    | <b>2</b>     |
| <b>Labor</b>                                     |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Journeyman                                       | 85.00                    | 85.00                          | 96.80                    | 86.00                      | 85.00                                       | 135.00       |
| Apprentice                                       | 58.00                    | 55.00                          | 50.00                    | 66.00                      | 45.00                                       | 135.00       |
| 1-Week Assignment (40 hours/week,<br>Journeyman) | 3,400.00                 | 2,800.00                       | 3,600.00                 | 3,440.00                   | 3,060.00                                    | 5,400.00     |
| 1-Week Assignment (40 hours/week,<br>Apprentice) | 2,320.00                 | 2,400.00                       | 2,000.00                 | 2,640.00                   | 1,620.00                                    | 5,400.00     |
| Trip Charge                                      | 50.00                    | 0.00                           | 78.00                    | 0.00                       | 45.00                                       | 135.00       |
| <b>Materials</b>                                 |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Mark-Up (Parts under \$1,000)                    | 20%                      | 15%                            | 8%                       | 30%                        | 15%   | 25%          |
| Mark-Up (Parts over \$1,000)                     | 15%                      | 10%                            | 5%                       | 25%                        | 10%   | 25%          |
| <b>Air Cooled Screw Machines – Group A</b>       |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| River Ridge Elementary                           | 1,800.00                 | 2,560.00                       | 815.00                   | 988.00                     | 1,326.00                                    | 4,684.00     |
| Ryland Heights Elementary                        | 1,080.00                 | 980.00                         | 742.00                   | 612.00                     | 735.00                                      | 2,342.00     |
| Taylor Mill Elementary                           | 1,800.00                 | 2,560.00                       | 1,413.00                 | 988.00                     | 1,319.00                                    | 4,684.00     |
| White's Tower Elementary                         | 1,080.00                 | 980.00                         | 742.00                   | 612.00                     | 735.00                                      | 2,342.00     |
| Dixie Heights High School                        | 2,160.00                 | 3,540.00                       | 2,082.00                 | 1,036.00                   | 1,788.00                                    | 7,026.00     |
| Sub-Total  | 7,920.00                 | 10,620.00                      | 5,794.00                 | 4,236.00                   | 5,903.00                                    | 21,078.00    |
| <b>Air Cooled Screw Machines – Group B</b>       |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Scott High                                       | 720.00                   | 1,580.00                       | 742.00                   | 612.00                     | 773.00                                      | 2,342.00     |
| Kenton Elementary                                | 1,800.00                 | 1,660.00                       | 1,413.00                 | 988.00                     | 1,322.00                                    | 4,684.00     |
| Piner Elementary                                 | 1,080.00                 | 1,660.00                       | 742.00                   | 612.00                     | 773.00                                      | 2,342.00     |
| Simon Kenton High Field House                    | 920.00                   | 980.00                         | 742.00                   | 612.00                     | 2,015.00                                    | 2,342.00     |

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| <b>Item Description</b>                           | <b>Air Force<br/>One</b> | <b>Comfort<br/>Systems USA</b> | <b>Debra<br/>Kuempel</b> | <b>Ivey<br/>Mechanical</b> | <b>Peck,<br/>Hannaford<br/>&amp; Briggs</b> | <b>Trane</b> |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|
| Simon Kenton High School                          | 2,520.00                 | 3,140.00                       | 2,082.00                 | 1,036.00                   | 773.00                                      | 7,026.00     |
| Sub-Total   | 7,040.00                 | 9,020.00                       | 5,721.00                 | 3,860.00                   | 5,656.00                                    | 18,736.00    |
| <b>Air Cooled Reciprocating Chiller-Group B</b>   |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| R.C. Hinsdale Elementary                          | 1,800.00                 | 1,760.00                       | 2,668.00                 | 1,890.00                   | 1,360.00                                    | 4,684.00     |
| <b>Centrifugal Chiller (Water Cooled) Group B</b> |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Summit View Campus                                | 7,152.00                 | 4,160.00                       | 4,258.00                 | 1,890.00                   | 2,109.00                                    | 4,950.00     |
| <b>Cooling Tower Equipment – Group A</b>          |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Ft Wright Elementary                              | 720.00                   | 695.00                         | 1,500.00                 | 1,490.00                   | 1,035.00                                    | 1,782.00     |
| Woodland Middle                                   | 1,080.00                 | 695.00                         | 1,200.00                 | 1,490.00                   | 885.00                                      | 1,782.00     |
| Sub-Total   | 1,800.00                 | 1,390.00                       | 2,700.00                 | 2,980.00                   | 1,920.00                                    | 3,564.00     |
| <b>Cooling Tower Equipment – Group B</b>          |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Beechgrove Elementary                             | 720.00                   | 695.00                         | 1,200.00                 | 1,490.00                   | 1,035.00                                    | 1,782.00     |
| Summit View Campus                                | 1,080.00                 | 695.00                         | 1,200.00                 | 1,490.00                   | 1,035.00                                    | 1,782.00     |
| Sub-Total   | 1,800.00                 | 1,390.00                       | 2,400.00                 | 2,980.00                   | 2,070.00                                    | 3,564.00     |
| <b>Hot Water Boilers Maintenance – Group A</b>    |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Ft. Wright Elementary                             | 720.00                   | 700.00                         | 1,078.00                 | 2,106.00                   | 638.00                                      | 3,419.00     |
| River Ridge Elementary                            | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 1,007.00                 | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 3,419.00     |
| Ryland Heights Elementary                         | 980.00                   | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Taylor Mill Elementary                            | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| White's Tower Elementary                          | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Woodland Middle                                   | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Dixie Heights High                                | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 1,078.00                 | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Sub-Total   | 7,400.00                 | 4,900.00                       | 6,035.00                 | 14,742.00                  | 6,188.00                                    | 18,948.00    |

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVAC SERVICE BID TABULATION 2019**

| <b>Item Description</b>   | <b>Air Force<br/>One</b> | <b>Comfort<br/>Systems USA</b> | <b>Debra<br/>Kuempel</b> | <b>Ivey<br/>Mechanical</b> | <b>Peck,<br/>Hannaford<br/>&amp; Briggs</b> | <b>Trane</b> |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|
| <b>Hot Water Boilers Maintenance – Group B</b>                      |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Beechgrove Elementary   | 1,140.00                 | 700.00                         | 862.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Central Office South  | 720.00                   | 700.00                         | 862.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Kenton Elementary   | 1,140.00                 | 1,050.00                       | 933.00                   | 2,766.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Piner Elementary  | 980.00                   | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Summit View Campus  | 980.00                   | 1,400.00                       | 718.00                   | 3,426.00                   | 825.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| Turkey Foot Middle  | 0.00                     | 0.00                           | 0.00                     | 0.00                       | 0.00  | 2,422.00     |
| Simon Kenton High   | 980.00                   | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 2,422.00     |
| The Kenton County Academies   | 980.00                   | 700.00                         | 718.00                   | 2,106.00                   | 975.00                                      | 3,419.00     |
| Sub-Total   | 6,920.00                 | 5,950.00                       | 5,529.00                 | 16,722.00                  | 6,075.00                                    | 20,373.00    |
| <b>Thermal Solutions Hot Water Boiler<br/>Maintenance – Group B</b> |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| R.C. Hinsdale Elementary  | 1,340.00                 | 1,050.00                       | 1,293.00                 | 2,766.00                   | 1,200.00                                    | 3,419.00     |
| <b>Additional Labor Rates per Hour;</b>                             |                          |                                |                          |                            |   |              |
| Controls Technician   |                          | 110.00                         | 108.80                   |                            | 85.00                                       |              |
| Electrician   |                          |                                | 96.80                    |                            |   |              |
| Engineer  |                          | 95.00                          |                          |                            |   |              |
| HVAC Technician   |                          |                                |                          | 86.00                      |   |              |
| Mechanical Technician   |                          |                                |                          |                            |   | 135.00       |
| Pipe Fitter   |                          |                                |                          |                            | 85.00                                       |              |
| Plumber   |                          |                                | 96.80                    | 76.00                      |   |              |
| Sheet Metal Worker  |                          |                                | 96.80                    |                            | 82.00                                       |              |
| <b>Total Dollars for Group A (Assumes 2-years)</b>                  | 72,340.00                | 63,520.00                      | 68,534.00                | 79,816.00                  | 60,882.00                                   | 162,380.00   |
| <b>Total Dollars for Group B (Assumes 2-years)</b>                  | 90,204.00                | 76,360.00                      | 83,214.00                | 96,116.00                  | 69,800.00                                   | 186,652.00   |
| <b>Total Dollars for All Groups</b>                                 | 162,544.00               | 139,880.00                     | 151,748.00               | 175,932.00                 | 130,682.00                                  | 349,032.00   |

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT  
HVACC SERVICE BID TABULATION**

**Cost Calculation Explanation for Each Group**

(Journeyman x 60 misc. hours per year x 2 years) +

(Apprentice x 60 misc. hours per year x 2 years) +

(Journeyman Weekly Labor Rate (40 hours - complete week) x 2 years) +

(Apprentice Weekly Labor Rate (40 hours - complete week) x 2 years) +

(Trip Charge x 60 trips/year x 2 years) +

(Materials under \$1,000 for a total buy of \$10,000/year x Markup) x 1/2 for each group x 2 years +

(Materials over \$1,000 for a total buy of \$10,000/year x Markup) x 1/2 for each group x 2 years +

((Air Cooled Screw Machines+Air Cooled Reciprocating Chillers+Centrifigul Chillers+Cooling Tower Equipment+Hot Water Boilers) x 2)

= Total Dollars per Group