



Kenton County School District | It's about ALL kids.

Issue Paper

DATE:

7/26/2021

AGENDA ITEM (ACTION ITEM):

Consider / Approve the Bid Award with Graybach Construction for the White's Tower Elementary Addition and Renovations Project (BG 21-145) with Graybach Construction Contract.

APPLICABLE BOARD POLICY:

01.1 Legal Status of the Board; 04.31 Authority to Encumber and Expend Funds: 702 KAR 4:160

HISTORY/BACKGROUND:

White's Tower Elementary is in need of additional space and some renovations to existing spaces. The original BG-1 (Buildings and Grounds) Construction Application was approved by the Kenton County Board of Education on December 7, 2020. Bids were opened and read on Thursday, July 8, 2021 for the White's Tower Elementary Addition and Renovations Project. Seven (7) bids were received: Graybach, Century, Schrudde & Zimmerman, Morel, Radius, Perkins/Carmack, and Ashley. Graybach was the lowest and best evaluated bid including Bid Alternates 1, 6, and 8.

FISCAL/BUDGETARY IMPACT:

\$6,244,600.00

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the Bid Award with Graybach Construction for the White's Tower Elementary Addition and Renovations Project (BG 21-145) with Graybach Construction Contract.

CONTACT PERSON:

Rob Haney, Chief Operations Officer

Principal/Administrator

Rob Haney

District Administrator

[Signature]

Superintendent

**THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
WHITE'S TOWER ADDITION & RENOVATION (BG 21-145)
BID TABULATION**

BID (60 points Possible)						
Bidder	Base Bid	Alternate #1 <i>Laminated Glass</i>	Alternate #6 <i>HVAC Controls</i>	Alternate #8 <i>Door Hardware</i>	Total with Selected Alternates	Points Awarded
Century Construction	\$ 6,345,000.00	\$ 3,750.00	\$ 85,000.00	\$ 5,500.00	\$ 6,439,250.00	58.13
Graybach, LLC	\$ 6,198,000.00	\$ 4,400.00	\$ 37,100.00	\$ 5,100.00	\$ 6,244,600.00	60.00
Morel Construction	\$ 6,370,000.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 42,000.00	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 6,430,200.00	58.22
Schrudde & Zimmerman, Inc.	\$ 6,349,000.00	\$ 940.00	\$ 38,900.00	\$ 5,300.00	\$ 6,394,140.00	58.56

FIRM EXPERIENCE & QUALIFICATIONS (15 Points Possible)				
	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 3	Avg Score
Century Construction	10	12	13	11.7
Graybach, LLC	13	12	14	13.0
Morel Construction	14	13	14	13.7
Schrudde & Zimmerman	12	13	14	13.0
BUSINESS PRACTICE (10 Points Possible)				
	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 3	Avg Score
Century Construction	8	7	8	7.7
Graybach, LLC	10	9	10	9.7
Morel Construction	8	9	10	9.0
Schrudde & Zimmerman	10	8	10	9.3
REFERENCES (15 Points Possible)				
	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 3	Avg Score
Century Construction	9	12	11	10.7
Graybach, LLC	13	12	13	12.7
Morel Construction	13	13	14	13.3
Schrudde & Zimmerman	12	13	13	12.7

TOTALS (100 Points Possible)					
	BID	FIRM EXPERIENCE & QUALIFICATIONS	BUSINESS PRACTICE	REFERENCES	TOTAL POINTS
Century Construction	58.13	11.7	7.7	10.7	88.13
Graybach, LLC	60.00	13.0	9.7	12.7	95.33
Morel Construction	58.22	13.7	9.0	13.3	94.22
Schrudde & Zimmerman, Inc.	58.56	13.0	9.3	12.7	93.56

= Best Overall Evaluated Bidder



PCA ARCHITECTURE

2021.07.27

Dr. Henry Webb, Superintendent of Schools
The Kenton County School District
1055 Eaton Drive
Ft. Wright, KY 41017

Re: BG. No. 21-145
White's Tower Elementary Addition and Renovations
Bid Recommendation

Dear Dr. Webb:

On Thursday, July 8, 2021, bids were received for the White's Tower Elementary Addition and Renovations project. The following seven base bids were received:

Greybach, LLC.	\$ 6,198,000.00
Century Construction, Inc.	\$ 6,345,000.00
Schrudde & Zimmerman, Inc.	\$ 6,349,000.00
Morel Construction Co., LLC	\$ 6,370,000.00
Radius Construction Company, Inc.	\$ 6,422,969.00
Perkins & Carmack	\$ 6,900,000.00
Ashley Construction	\$ 6,998,000.00

We also received alternate bids for the following items:

- Alternate No. 1: Add laminated glass
- Alternate No. 2: Deduct masonry infill at cafeteria table pockets
- Alternate No. 3: Deduct prefabricated canopies at doors 190.2, 198.2, 199.2
- Alternate No. 4: Deduct metal canopy at door 159
- Alternate No. 5: Deduct OP/PT 172 & Speech 172A
- Alternate No. 6: Provide Tridium N4 HVAC Controls by Siemens

Alternate No. 7: Not Used

Alternate No. 8: Provide Owner preferred door hardware

We at PCA agree with KCSD's internal assessment and selection of alternates as follows:

Alternate No. 1	Accepted
Alternate No. 2	Declined
Alternate No. 3	Declined
Alternate No. 4	Declined
Alternate No. 5	Declined
Alternate No. 6	Accepted
Alternate No. 7	Declined
Alternate No. 8	Accepted

An internal meeting by KCDS was conducted Wednesday, July 14, 2021, to review the completeness of Graybach Construction's apparent low bid. The design team also conducted a review of Graybach's bid and believes the bid to be complete and in full compliance with the requirements of the bidding documents.

Alternate prices submitted by Graybach for accepted alternates are as follows:

Alternate No. 1	\$ 4,400.00
Alternate No. 6	\$ 37,100.00
Alternate No. 8	\$ 5,100.00

We recommend accepting the low base bid from Greybach including aforementioned alternates for a total contract value of **\$6,244,600.00**.

Sincerely,



Jim Kaiser, R.A.

PCA ARCHITECTURE ^{PSC}

Enclosed: Bid Tabulation

Bid No.	Bidder	Base Bid	Alternate #1 - ADD Laminated glass	Alternate #2 - DEDUCT masonry infill at cafeteria table pockets	Alternate #3 - DEDUCT prefabricated canopies at doors 190.2, 198.2, 199.2	Alternate #4 - DEDUCT metal canopy at door 159	Alternate #5 - DEDUCT OP/PT 172 & Speech 172A	Alternate #6 - Provide Tridium N4 HVAC Controls by Siemens	Alternate #7 - NOT USED	Alternate #8 - Provide Owner preferred door hardware		Total with accepted Alternates 1, 6, & 8.	Price Delta
1	Graybach	\$ 6,198,000.00	\$ 4,400.00	\$ (10,000.00)	\$ (6,700.00)	\$ (6,300.00)	\$ (5,300.00)	\$ 37,100.00		\$ 5,100.00		\$ 6,244,600.00	
2	Century	\$ 6,345,000.00	\$ 3,750.00	\$ (10,000.00)	\$ (12,575.00)	\$ (9,578.00)	\$ (5,000.00)	\$ 85,000.00		\$ 5,500.00		\$ 6,402,097.00	\$ 157,497.00
3	Schrudde Zimmerman	\$ 6,349,000.00	\$ 940.00	\$ (10,100.00)	\$ (20,300.00)	\$ (14,400.00)	\$ (4,100.00)	\$ 38,900.00		\$ 5,300.00		\$ 6,345,240.00	\$ 100,640.00
4	Morel	\$ 6,370,000.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ (10,000.00)	\$ (11,500.00)	\$ (8,700.00)	\$ (5,500.00)	\$ 42,000.00		\$ 17,000.00		\$ 6,394,500.00	\$ 149,900.00
5	Radius	\$ 6,422,969.00	\$ 3,497.00	\$ (10,300.00)	\$ (15,158.00)	\$ (11,766.00)	\$ (4,664.00)	\$ 37,616.00		\$ -		\$ 6,422,194.00	\$ 177,594.00
6	Perkins & Carmack	\$ 6,900,000.00	\$ 3,700.00	\$ (9,800.00)	\$ (22,000.00)	\$ (13,500.00)	\$ (10,000.00)	\$ 39,000.00		\$ -		\$ 6,887,400.00	\$ 485,303.00
7	Ashley	\$ 6,998,000.00	\$ 5,140.00	\$ (15,400.00)	\$ (18,994.00)	\$ (13,235.00)	\$ (12,341.00)	\$ 41,496.00		\$ -		\$ 6,984,666.00	\$ 740,066.00