## CLEANING SUPPLIES BID - TOILET PAPER RECOMMENDATION

A notice was posted to the district website on April 4, 2017 to accept sealed bids for "Cleaning Supplies". Sealed bids were opened and read on April 18, 2017, at 2:00 p.m. Toilet Paper with new dispensers were requested as a part of this bid. Bid prices were evaluated and two were selected for in-use tests at Kenton Elementary, Twenhofel Middle, and Simon Kenton High. The tabulation is enclosed.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Kenton County Board of Education accept the bid from All Pro as indicated on the Toilet Paper Evaluation Bid Tabulation.

THE KENTON COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
TOILET PAPER EVALUATION

| Item Description | All Pro | All Pro Murphy Supply Phillips Supply |  |  | Stigler Supply | Stigler Supply |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Toilet Tissue, White, 2 Ply, Facial Grade, 3" - 3.50" Wide Rolls per Case | 19.98 | 24.25 | 24.99 | 23.00 | 23.97 | 25.61 |
| Make \& P/N | Nittany | Nittany |  | Georgia Pacific | Nittany / | Nittany / |
| Make \& P/N | 5216 | 5216 | TP12021502 | Jumbo | Vondrehle | Vondrehle |
| Length of Sheet | 1,000 | 1,000 | 1,600 | 1,000 | 1,000 | 1,000 |
| Width of Sheet | 3.2500 | 3.2500 | 0.29583 | 0.2916 | 3.3125 | 3.3125 |
| \# of Sheets per Roll | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Roll Size in feet | 1,000 | 1,000 | 1,600 | 1,000 | 1,000 | 1,000 |
| Rolls / Case | 12 | 12 | 6 | 8 | 12 | 12 |
| Case Size | 12,000 | 12,000 | 9,600 | 8,000 | 12,000 | 12,000 |
| Annual Equivalent Cases | 1,108 | 1,108 | 1,385 | 1,662 | 1,108 | 1,108 |
| Total Annual Cost For Toilet Paper | 22,139 | 26,871 | 34,614 | 38,229 | 26,561 | 28,378 |
| Cost per Dispenser | 18.50 | 7.50 | 1.00 | 2.00 | 5.00 | 0.00 |
| Total Cost of Dispensers | 13,875.00 | 5,625.00 | 750.00 | 1,500.00 | 3,750.00 | 0.00 |
| Total Cost - Year 1 | 36,014.44 | 32,495.94 | 35,363.65 | 39,728.76 | 30,310.68 | 28,377.93 |
| Total Cost - Year 2 | 22,139.44 | 26,870.94 | 34,613.65 | 38,228.76 | 26,560.68 | 28,377.93 |
| Total Cost - Year 3 | 22,139.44 | 26,870.94 | 34,613.65 | 38,228.76 | 26,560.68 | 28,377.93 |
| Total Cost - Year 4 | 22,139.44 | 26,870.94 | 34,613.65 | 38,228.76 | 26,560.68 | 28,377.93 |
| 4-Year Total Cost | 102,432.75 | 113,108.76 | 139,204.60 | 154,415.04 | 109,992.71 | 113,511.72 |
| 4-Year NPV (i=2.50\%) | 96,824.58 | 106,575.59 | 130,947.36 | 145,279.02 | 103,579.12 | $\underline{106,757.04}$ |
| Price Score (50 Points Possible) | 50.00 | 44.96 |  |  | 46.51 | 44.87 |
| In-Use Quality Test (30 Points Possible) | 28.33 | 28.33 |  |  | 11.67 | 11.67 |
| Price Adjustment Scores (10 Points Possible) | 8.00 | 8.00 |  |  | 7.00 | 7.00 |
| Reference Scores (10 Points Possible) | 10.00 | 10.00 |  |  | 10.00 | 10.00 |
| Total Score (100 Points Possible) | 96.33 | 91.30 |  |  | 75.18 | 73.54 |
| Recommended as the lowest and/or best evaluated bid - |  |  |  |  |  |  |

