8/1/2013 STATEMENT OF CONSIDERATION RELATING TO 704 KAR 3:303

Kentucky Core Academic Standards

Kentucky Department of Education

Not Amended After Comments

- 1. A public hearing was held on the above regulation on July 23, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the State Board Room, Kentucky Department of Education, 500 Mero Street, 1st Floor, Frankfort, Kentucky.
- 2. The following individuals attended this public hearing or submitted written or verbal comments:

Name and Title Agency/Organization/Entity/Other

Sheila Anderson Citizen
Todd Belcher Citizen

Blaine Ferrell Kentucky Academy of Science

Trent Garrison American Institute of Professional Geologists

Annice Milliner Citizen

Valerie O-Rear Retired Colonel/Parent

Dr. Don Patton Citizen

Daniel Phelps Kentucky Paleontological Society

Steve Shreeve Citizen
Reverend Matthew John Singleton Citizen

Dr. Tom Tretter University of Louisville

Paul Vincelli Citizen Annice Milliner Citizen **Gregory Gabbard** Citizen Phillip Woolery Citizen Deborah Smith-Seadler Citizen Ann Seling Citizen John H. Batte Citizen Dedra Gordon Citizen Annette Rudd Citizen Paul Fuller Citizen Kim Phillips Citizen Barbara [no last name provided] Citizen Kate Hinkle Citizen **Christopher Woods** Citizen **Brittany Slabach** Citizen Molly M. Boggess Citizen Cean Peevey Rosenthal Citizen Sandy Sasso Citizen Kathy Long Citizen Jennifer Connor Citizen Sarah Gutwirth Citizen David W. Anderson Citizen **Eloise Moor** Citizen Tammy Troxell Citizen **Anthony Hamilton** Citizen Mike Walton Citizen **Tracy Shipley** Citizen Citizen Ricky Wainscott Rabecca Gainey Citizen Larry Lewis Citizen Carol Redies Citizen Mandy Olivam Citizen Vernell Larkin Citizen Roberta Chase Citizen Walt Barlow Citizen Jennifer Parrish-Lamb Citizen Dennis [no last name provided] Citizen Todd Kleffman Citizen Richard Cowie Citizen Citizen Kerry Isham **Rose Bailes** Citizen Jeane Cole Citizen Sue Burch Citizen Citizen Angela Cobb Noreen Mason Citizen Michael Ramsdell Citizen Darrin L. Smith Citizen Ann Chapman Citizen Venita Mullins Citizen Ann Triebsch Citizen **Hunter Moseley** Citizen Donald E. Waters Citizen Heather Gallimore Citizen D'Arcy Batson Citizen **Bob Bickner** Citizen

Lindsay [no last name provided] Citizen Robin Allen Citizen Jennifer Birriel Citizen Ignacio Birriel Citizen **Becky Alley** Citizen Tracy Livingston Citizen Leonard Demoranville Citizen Debra Noem Citizen Sam Moore Citizen Karen Wood Citizen Nancy Aulbach Citizen Rex A. Sutton Citizen Dennis Kinkade Citizen Linda Matz Citizen Citizen Meredith Domurat Dallas A. Law Citizen Sandra Tattershall Citizen J. Meyer Citizen Herman Mays Citizen Citizen Neil Carey Michael Bellmore Citizen Irwin Cutler Citizen Mollie Suddeth Citizen Citizen Dorothy H. Schnare Jim Critchfield Citizen Lynda [no last name provided] Citizen Citizen David K Lindsey Andy P. Hudak Citizen Mike Moran Citizen Delia Thomson Citizen Sarah Nichols Citizen Nannez Williams Citizen Kim Fillmore Citizen Theresa Bierbauer Citizen Kaitlyn Reynolds Citizen Steve [no last name provided] Citizen Steven Goode Citizen **Sharon Cason** Citizen Linda Myers Citizen Lila Stambaugh Citizen Teresa Smith Citizen Anne Stambaugh Baker Citizen

Frank Tomeo Citizen
Bryan [no last name provided] Citizen
Thomas Stewart Citizen
Shilo Adams Citizen
Nicholas McLetchie Citizen
Mary Mckenna Citizen

Ryan Kelly Professor of Geography and Earth Science

Michelle Morad Citizen **Brian Robertson** Citizen Kerry A. Pickin Paumi Citizen Nagma Zafar Citizen Elena Diehl Citizen Valerie Brown Citizen **Bruce Gurley** Citizen Citizen Deborah Slone Citizen James Patrick Haynes Citizen George Heupel Karen Truman Citizen Les Waters Citizen Krista Johnson Citizen Barbara Fredrickson Citizen Sandi Joiner Citizen Nancy Garrett Citizen Natalie Stephens Citizen Jan Garrett Citizen Ron Thompson Citizen Susan Abbott-Jamieson Citizen **April Bowles** Citizen Brandi Bramblett Citizen Karen Duckwall Citizen Donna Workman Citizen Jan Hill Citizen Laura [no last name] Citizen **David Bowling** Citizen Dianne Bazell Citizen Reda Bianchi Citizen

Kristan Lennin Associate Professor of Chemistry

Bethany Bowling
Angela Anderson
Citizen
Jarrod Sherman
Citizen
Renee Muse
Citizen

Gina Kleinhelter

Citizen

David McBride Citizen Lindsay Blair Warren Citizen Cameron Lippert Citizen **Greg Cordier** Citizen Andrew Gardner Citizen Regina Wilson Citizen Suzanne La Rosa Citizen John Langley Citizen Joyce Tudor Pilling Citizen Nancy Velotta Citizen Emma Stow Citizen Paul Hime Citizen Jeannette [no last name provided] Citizen Jeanne Van Arsdall Citizen Citizen Raymond Wechman

Marcia Salisbury Former Teacher

Ann Fraley Citizen Louise Steidel Citizen **Justin Burgess** Citizen Stephen P. Kellerman Citizen Jill Rogers Citizen Jena [no last name provided] Citizen Jed Johnston Citizen Citizen Malinda McMurry Roger Ingram Citizen Frances Ball Citizen Citizen Bill Mattingly Don Moore Citizen William De Sanctis Citizen Cassandra Lyons Citizen Sandy Donlin Citizen Maeve McCarthy Citizen Vickie Williams Citizen Amy [no last name provided] Citizen Stephen Ellis Citizen Laura Webb Citizen Steven F. Stone Citizen Rosie Blackburn Citizen Cathy Wester Citizen Lial Thompson Citizen Steve Kerlin, Ph.D. Citizen Rebecca White Citizen

Leslie K. Russo Citizen Kristin Eppinghoff Citizen Jerry Roahrig Citizen Eleni Maroudas Citizen Justin Woodson Citizen Andrew Day Citizen Zaida Belendez Citizen Susan Odom Citizen Tony Maynard Citizen Louisa Woodson Citizen Ginger Rawe Citizen Shane Smith Citizen Dino Lucarelli Citizen Maurice LeFevre Citizen Karen Elder Citizen Liz Huffman Citizen Jonathan Hembree Citizen Sarah Emery Citizen Mitchell Harmon Citizen Brandon Franklin Citizen Jason Collett Citizen Patricia [no last name provided] Citizen

Timothy E. Dowling, Director Atmospheric Program at University of Louisville

Trish [no last name provided] Citizen George Wagner Citizen Liz [no last name provided] Citizen Steven Osborne Citizen Kathryn Niles Citizen **Judy Morris** Citizen Scott Mello Citizen Zach [no last name provided] Citizen

David A. Howarth Climate Scientist

Sherrie Lee Citizen Robert Hall Citizen Kathy Hodges Citizen Jennifer Yates Citizen Hope Reuschel Citizen Gregory A. Dahlem Citizen Kristen Kean Citizen Monica [no last name provided] Citizen Erik Jarvis Citizen Rita Kauffman Citizen

Jonathan Gore Citizen Michal Mello Citizen Joe Chewning Citizen Pam Ayer Citizen Jane Varakin Citizen Dave Serchuk Citizen Jeri Thomas Citizen **Betsy Martin** Citizen Todd Willard Citizen Henry A. White Citizen Robert Akin Citizen Penelope A Wong Citizen David Bowman Citizen Kristy Hopfensperger, Ph.D. Citizen Bess K. Douthitt Citizen Caroline McCoy Citizen Susan P Hendricks Citizen Craig Bentin Citizen Colleen Musinski Citizen Steve Goodwin Citizen Skip McCall Citizen Mike Harmon Citizen D.W. Swain Citizen Ron Saderholm Citizen Rhoden Streeter Citizen Nancy Pauley Citizen Shanin Lodhi Citizen Joel McRennary Citizen J. Anthony Stallins Citizen William Powell Citizen Citizen Doris Hensley Barbara Hicks Citizen Krys Lynam Citizen Citizen George Robertson Carrie Vittitoe Citizen Al Nelson Citizen Jerry Yeager Citizen Ross C. Clark, Ph.D. Citizen Vicki Downs Citizen Tim Griffith Citizen Eric O'Neil Citizen Stacy Padgett Citizen

Beverly Willman Citizen G. Dew Citizen Bruce Bohns Citizen Jeffrey L. Osborn Citizen Jeanne Osborne Citizen Beth Wallingford Citizen **Brent Garrett** Citizen Robert Mills Citizen Teresa Wurts Citizen **Beverly Strange** Citizen **Darius Shariaty** Citizen Diana Martin Citizen

Dawn Lynch Science Teacher

Ed Causey
Citizen
Dr. Ronald L. Fiel
Citizen
Julie Mills
Citizen
Mindy Jaffe
Citizen
Shirley Mayer
Citizen
Shauna Dunham
Citizen

John J. Metz, Director

Department of History and Geography, Northern

Kentucky University

Beverly Juett Citizen Ryan Boatwright Citizen Annie Gleason Citizen David White, Ph.D Citizen Alisha Lehew Citizen Joel Merlin Citizen Martin Brock Citizen Olivia M. Sprouse Citizen Al Fritsch Citizen Joseph Ray Citizen Casey [no last name provided] Citizen Amanda Gilliam-Rose Citizen Susan Shackelford Citizen Leann Scott Citizen Sara E. Greene Citizen Norma Craig Citizen Melissa [no last name provided] Citizen Andrea Drayer Citizen Daniel Lloyd Citizen Bob Smither, Jr. Citizen

Alan J Zemon

Citizen

Tracy Zaparanick Citizen Anna Boller Citizen Mike Turner Citizen Alice Neff Citizen Jonathan Busroe Citizen **Ruth Hendrix** Citizen Hannah Mills Citizen Kyle Burchett Citizen Nathaniel Haynes Citizen Charlotte Henderson Citizen Rachel Bongard Citizen **Bob Bruce** Citizen Amanda Fuller Citizen Theresina Greenwell Citizen Jamie Hale Citizen Betty [no last name provided] Citizen Janie Browning Citizen Charles H. Bennett, Ph.D. Citizen Ian Galbraith Citizen Marcia Pierce Citizen Laura Brestel Citizen Anne G. Woodhead Citizen Ierusha Martin Citizen Linda Wooten Citizen Caleb Mathis Citizen Christina Espinosa Citizen

Vivien McAninch Biology Teacher, Madison County

Linda Tribble Citizen Peter Mirabito, Ph.D. Citizen Christina Parrish Citizen Trish Sharp Citizen Cecilia Chauvin Citizen Jan Wertz Citizen Anes Kovacevic Citizen Jane Ann Blakeman Citizen Cynthia Isenhour Citizen Daniel Coe Citizen Bill Hardin Citizen Brenda Stokes Citizen Danna Morrison Citizen Joel Handley Citizen Ingrid Weiland Citizen

Mary Bridges Citizen Sherie Kendall, Ph.D. Citizen Mary Livingstone Citizen Phyllis VanMetre Citizen Roy Crawford Citizen Pamela W. Feldhoff, Ph.D. Citizen Dr. Justin Mog Citizen Ann Witherington Citizen **Kevin Beers** Citizen Nell F. Cox Citizen Lynn McFalls Citizen Wayne Willis Citizen Lauren Holtgrave Citizen Peter W Campbell Citizen Michael Cooper Citizen Conrad Shiba Citizen Citizen Megan Rhoads Rebecca Eggers Citizen Thom Kerby Citizen Brenna Tinsley Citizen Derick B. Strod Citizen Lynn M. Hamilton Citizen Leslie Potts Citizen **Daniel Douglas** Citizen Debra Jordan Citizen **Emily Moseley** Citizen Chris Trzepacz Citizen Sarah Taylor Citizen Stephen Wechman Citizen Sommer Johnson Citizen **Todd Yetter** Citizen Philip White Citizen Adrianne Gilley Citizen Matt Crawford Citizen Adam Bohannon Citizen Tiffany McFalls Citizen S. Rucker Citizen **Travis Robinson** Citizen **Tracey Goodlett** Citizen Kathy Glass Citizen Christopher Cansler Citizen John A. Spurlock Citizen

Deanna Brockman Citizen Rebecca Kellum Citizen Katherine Dyke Citizen Ashley Gibson Citizen Mary K. Whitson, Ph.D. Citizen Whitney Fields Citizen **Brian Sansbury** Citizen **Shelley Thomas** Citizen Verdie A. Craig, PhD Citizen Brian L. Rich Citizen Melissa L. Shirley, Ph.D. Citizen Erin [no last name provided] Citizen Signe White Citizen Victoria [no last name provided] Citizen Justin Kratovil Citizen David Moldoff Citizen Joe Wolf Citizen Nadezda Nikolova Citizen Janet K. Lumpp Citizen Citizen John C. Philley Meghan Knapp Citizen Pamela M Jett Citizen Marie Nydam Citizen Amanda LaFontaine Citizen Ann Bickel Citizen Julie Evans Citizen Citizen N.S. Hagans Barbara Solomon Citizen **Zachary Thomas** Citizen Amanda Bowman Citizen Glenda Marker Citizen Sarah Lovett Citizen Mark Blankenbuehler Citizen Ogo Onyiri Citizen Marcia Texler Segal Citizen **Bruce Mattingly** Citizen Jacqueline Dillard Citizen J. R. Robinson Citizen Sherri Brown Citizen Rachel Baldes Citizen

Virginia Ceesay Parent and Educator

Amanda Harrison Citizen

Kit Wesler Citizen Gary Adams Citizen Laura Gardner Heyrman Citizen Kelley M. Rule Citizen Pamela Dumm Citizen Ryan Huber Citizen Tracy Hodge Citizen Dr. Akhtar Mahmood Citizen Kelly Saderholm Citizen Lisa Nichols Citizen Zexia Barne Citizen Michelle Giedt Citizen M. Smith Citizen Ralph J. Knipp Citizen Citizen Carol Wymer Erin McCord Citizen **Terry Derting** Citizen Miranda Westbrook Citizen George Kaufman Citizen Nash Cox Citizen Blaine Ferrell Citizen Tammera Race Citizen Brian Rymond Citizen Janice Walker Citizen **Douglas Smith** Citizen Colleen Small Citizen Thomas Parker Citizen Dr. Mikhail Khenner Citizen Matthew Saderholm Citizen Jennifer Reed Citizen Rosanne Lorden Citizen Adrienne Gearheart Citizen Tom Bennett, Ph.D. Citizen Jennifer Wies Citizen John Volpe Citizen Honey Dozier Citizen Gaye Brewer Citizen Lina Tharsing Citizen Vonda Martin Citizen Syed Khundmiri Citizen Alexandre Martin Citizen Janet O'Connell Citizen

Linda Sheffield Citizen Dr. Ken Carstens Citizen Maiyon Park Citizen Richard L. Boyce, Ph.D. Citizen Walter Gearheart Citizen Ken Crawford Citizen John H Morgan Citizen Robert Pendygraft Citizen Judy Voelker Citizen Peter S. Fosl Citizen Robert H Biggerstaff Citizen Lori Wilson Citizen John Barry Sipple Citizen Charles Edward Allgeier Citizen Nancy Martin Citizen Nicolette Lawrence Citizen **Ann Garrity** Citizen Patricia J. Rhoten Citizen Katherine Weckman Citizen Sheena Puckett Citizen Scott Wilmoth Citizen Fred [no last name provided] Citizen John Griley Citizen Dave Cobb Citizen Richard Pryor Citizen Matthew Clarke Citizen Connie May Citizen William Martin Citizen **Timothy Belcher** Citizen **Daniel Williams** Citizen Katie Anderson Citizen Carol Edeloen Citizen Barbara Kacer Citizen Citizen Angela Taylor Melissa Hackorth Citizen Laura Malbasa Citizen Steve Ruth Citizen Lawrence Smith Citizen Kenn Minter Citizen Shane Thomae Citizen Allen Kirkwood Citizen Matthew Wells Citizen

Amelia Kirby Citizen **Sherry Loeser** Citizen Brian Moore Citizen Sherra Koshio Citizen Ali Blair Citizen Andreea McClintock Citizen Anna Bard Citizen **Emilie Hunt** Citizen Jeffrey F. Steele Citizen Catherine Caldwell Citizen Lindsey MacGregor Citizen Thomas Osborne Citizen Vickie Glass Citizen **Emily Beauregard** Citizen Susan Templeton Citizen Julia Richerson Citizen Atheana Meadows Citizen Amy Steele Citizen Michael Petty Citizen Maria Arroyo Citizen Michael Dawes Citizen Jane Vigor Citizen Judy Muehleman Citizen Derek Feldman Citizen Mary Keogh Citizen David Lautzenheiser Citizen Carol Detmer Citizen Kevin Schouweiler Citizen Lisa Weaver Citizen Janet Peterson Citizen Christopher Huelsman Citizen Thomas E. Comte Citizen Shanessa Littrell Citizen Ann All Citizen Citizen Misty Like Slavica [no last name provided] Citizen Carol Leow Citizen Christie Dunham Citizen Nancy Busroe Citizen Keith McAliley Citizen Stacie Huber Citizen Michele Jessie Citizen

Erin Doherty Citizen **David Farris** Citizen Robin Atwell Citizen Sharon Kopyc Citizen Elizabeth U. Natter Citizen Drew Musgrave Citizen Kim Cargo Citizen Norma Boyd Citizen M. Kiser Citizen **Bette Stearns** Citizen Alix Burke Citizen **Raymond Solomon** Citizen Carl Wieck Citizen Dan Winfield Citizen Citizen Brenda Brasher Paul Wigler Citizen Annette Hayden Citizen Bruce Hardesty Citizen Pamela Thompson Citizen Laurel Lamb Citizen Donna [no last name provided] Citizen Elise Hyder Citizen Cindy Murphy Citizen Citizen **Gregory West** Jeremy Puckett Citizen Kim Root Citizen Doris Anderson Citizen Kevin Hackworth Citizen **David Robinson** Citizen Victoria [no last name provided] Citizen Dawn [no last name provided] Citizen Nathan Bayne Citizen Sheri Depp Citizen Citizen Wayne Coffey Karen Carey Citizen Anne Authur Citizen Barbara Watts Citizen Glenn Gevedon Citizen Tammy Ubach Citizen Ellen Guyer Citizen **Bob Geiger** Citizen Janet A. Isenhour Citizen

Edward Ballinger Citizen Bonnie Avery Citizen Mina Davis Citizen James Watts Citizen Sandra Munn Citizen Alex Gerrish Citizen Sharesssa Bentley-Crovo Citizen Leslie Kulig Citizen Nan Harnice Citizen Whitney McKay Citizen Alex [no last name provided] Citizen Dean W. West Citizen Tommye Bell Citizen Donald Varakin Citizen Pam [no last name provided] Citizen Barbara Farley Citizen Aloma Dew Citizen James Calhoun Citizen Mary Ann Schultz Citizen Brandi Jarvis Citizen Karen Rossi Citizen Amy Baglan Citizen Jose Ubach Citizen Citizen Glenn Augenstein **Shayne Holsinger** Citizen Cheri Reed Citizen Esther Klaphaak Citizen Patricia Donohue Citizen Thomas Theodore Welborn Citizen Eileen James Citizen Rebecca Smith Citizen Mary C. Heist Citizen Mary Ann Baker Citizen Andrew [no last name provided] Citizen Jonni Marselle Citizen Zane Lockhart, Jr. Citizen Teresa Christmas Citizen Wendy Butler Burt Citizen April Morgan Citizen Michael Stephen Citizen Rick Brown Citizen Jeffrey L. Jones Citizen

Peggy Patrick Citizen Bonnie C. Plummer Citizen Melissa [no last name provided] Citizen Kate Mansfield Citizen **Toby Wilcher** Citizen Martina G. Yantis Citizen Sareva Moore Citizen Linda Cash Citizen Laradean Brown Citizen **Beverly James** Citizen Harley Morris Citizen Linda Trautwein Citizen Connie Priddy Citizen Shelley J. Lee Citizen

Tim D. Sullivan, Ph.D. University Professor

Carol Morris Citizen Carla Broecker Citizen Ellen Collins Citizen **April Browning** Citizen Patricia Collins Citizen Joanna Busrroe Citizen Stephanie Hamilton Citizen Susan Stopher Citizen Carroll Grossman Citizen **Trevor Rowe** Citizen Jennifer Kaminski Citizen Citizen Mary June Brunker Carol Savkovich Citizen Patricia Ricketts Citizen Alice Snider Citizen Josh Tillson Citizen Scott Graham Citizen Helene Steene Citizen Stephanie Breitmeyer Citizen Jeaneen Aldridge Citizen Joe Gallenstein Citizen Fred Davis Citizen **Donald Borders** Citizen Virginia Johnson Citizen Pam Kuist Citizen Jessica Loving Citizen Mark [no last name provided] Citizen

Margie Waflare Citizen John Thompson Citizen G. Pahler Citizen John Shackelford Citizen Mary Anne Reiss Citizen **Bonnie Barnette** Citizen Albert J. Sausville Citizen Kenny Griffin Citizen Amy Bosch Citizen James Cook Citizen Meghan Casper Citizen Keith Salyer Citizen **Roy Davis** Citizen Lori [no last name provided] Citizen Xyara Asplen Citizen Connie Evans Citizen Joanie Lukins Citizen Diana H. Munson Citizen Jeannie Taylor Citizen Citizen Laura Emery Linda Wagner Citizen L. Helm Citizen Donna [no last name provided] Citizen Thomas Creahan Citizen Patty Toth Citizen Edie McClellan Citizen Citizen **Dorothy Pitt** Marjorie Kohn Citizen E. Deane Palmer Citizen **Sharilyn Jones** Citizen Christopher Schardl Citizen Kelly Quade Citizen Lorah Palmer Citizen Elise Kalika Citizen Christine Wright Citizen Ivory Moore Citizen Carol E. Bastian Citizen Jill Hissom Citizen Ann Walthall Citizen Sandra [no last name provided] Citizen David G. Blackburn Citizen Claudia Reeves Citizen

Bruce Marchionda Citizen Janet Davis Citizen Hope Marchionda Citizen John Vornberger Citizen **Thomas Price** Citizen Nan B. Williamson Citizen Matthew Zook Citizen Cheryl Bensing Citizen Teresa Lanford Citizen Katherine Threatt Citizen Paul D Jett Citizen Ceclia Bandy Citizen Jane Wallace Citizen Randy Reynolds Citizen David Jett Citizen Linda Skaggs Citizen Scott Locks Citizen

Tammy E. Spinks Mother of two Kentucky teachers

Drew Foley Citizen Jim Mathis Citizen Jason Hatton Citizen Betty Goodman Citizen Kristin Burnside Citizen Charles Newell Citizen Miriam Woodhead Citizen Susan Reynolds Citizen Citizen Tony Bedel Patricia Hahn Citizen J.P. Fentress Citizen K.A. Owens Citizen Kent Gilbert Citizen Shannon [no last name provided] Citizen Carol Wittreich Citizen Traci Thompson Citizen Cassandra Lieder Citizen Mary Ann Bowman Citizen Paige Beichler Citizen J. Weber Citizen **Louis Peters** Citizen Kim Dixon Citizen **Sharon Rengers** Citizen **James Roberts** Citizen

Amy Spurlock Citizen Jen Walters Petry Citizen **Brent Williams** Citizen Armando J. Prats Citizen Teresa [no last name provided] Citizen Nell Whitman Citizen Dr. Don Osten Citizen Carlena Johnson Citizen Chuck Frasher Citizen Louis Moseson Citizen Glenn Prezocki Citizen Susan Byars Citizen Deborah Larkin Citizen Julia Barr Citizen Robert Preston Pipal Citizen Robert Gibson Citizen Deborah Larkin Citizen Lawrence Wasser Citizen Martin Solomon Citizen Linda Jasper Citizen **Charlotte Williams** Citizen Peggy Wray-Tolbert Citizen Meryl Becker-Prezocki Citizen Citizen Joan Gregory Fawn Whitley Citizen Amanda Riley Citizen Citizen Hervey Howell Desmon McMahan Citizen Citizen Cary Williams Josh Spencer Citizen John Scheibert Citizen Caleb [no last name provided] Citizen Elizabeth A. Kesterson Citizen Mary Ann Taylor-Hall Citizen Hilda Hamilton Citizen David Kobersmith Citizen Patricia Whitehead Citizen Christine M. Collier Citizen Ben Evans Citizen James Toy Citizen Corinne M. Luvisi Citizen Lynda Merz Citizen

W. R. Beard Citizen Jeremiah Floyd Citizen Denise Luellen Citizen Lori Pierce Citizen Cheryl Dee Morgan Scaggs Citizen Michael Miller Citizen Tama [no last name provided] Citizen Jeremy Wooldridge Citizen George Weems Citizen Stephanie Rommel Citizen Karl Wheeler Citizen Marilyn Willhoit Citizen Rachael Edmiston Citizen Tee [no last name provided] Citizen Monica Unseld, Ph. D Citizen James Edwards Citizen Carl R. Hausman Citizen Macenzie Brown Citizen Bob [no last name provided] Citizen Barbara Tuttle Citizen Keegan McGee Citizen Michaela L. Stanley Citizen Linda Powe Citizen Londa [no last name provided] Citizen Susan Laforge [no last name provided] Citizen Karena Patterson Citizen Marie Cassady Citizen Carolyn Humphrey Citizen Donna Rocchetti Citizen Jane Andrus Citizen David B. Williams Citizen Liang Liang Citizen David Lynch Citizen Mary Jo Hummeldorf Citizen Douglas C. Parish Citizen Michael Tague Citizen Ann Jay Bryan Citizen Margaret Bond Citizen Teresa Knifley Citizen Ron Robertson Citizen Octa Kellond Citizen Kathleen F. Ford Citizen

Jenny Watkins Citizen Nancy McLain Citizen Meghan Langley Citizen Carolyn Wilson Citizen Sabrina Childress-Lamson Citizen James Turner Citizen Timothy Goode Citizen Linda Siegrist Citizen Wendy Miller Citizen Elizabeth Gentry Citizen Stuart W Jones Citizen Alice Davis Citizen Jane Hope Citizen **Preston Miles** Citizen Richard D. Jewell Citizen Nita Ramsey Citizen J. F. Edwards Sr Citizen Mary Mulder Citizen Allie Lancaster Citizen James Ewen Citizen Jennifer Moylan Citizen Sarah Vahlkamp Citizen Donna Hancock Citizen Citizen Charlene Holloway Janice LeMaster Citizen Margaret Wells Teacher Citizen Susan [no last name provided] Chet Sygiel Citizen Citizen John E. Elliott Mary Hayes Citizen Citizen Virginia Meagher Joanna [no last name provided] Citizen Martha Emmons Citizen Geoff Corbin Citizen Peggy Simpson Citizen Helen C. Posey Citizen William Critchfield Citizen Allison Woodson Citizen Mathew Ballard Citizen Karen May Citizen Jeanine Scott Citizen Terry Wetherby Citizen

Marsha Andrews Citizen **Christian Huggins** Citizen Jeff Owens Citizen Brent W. Galloway Citizen Jody Baker Citizen Lisa Willner Citizen Barbara Steinbock Citizen Cristen Olson Citizen Jennifer Rowden Smith Citizen Patera Cook Citizen Penelope Louise Jones Citizen Anna Raines Citizen **Matt Brewington** Citizen Elizabeth Davis Citizen William Seckman Citizen E. B. Vance Citizen Leslie Travis Citizen Suzanne Froelich Citizen John Brown Citizen Loraine Hammerbeck Citizen Ted Michalik Citizen Peggy Ryker Citizen Kay Anne Wilborn Citizen Carissa Lenfert Citizen Kirk Hoskins Citizen Jim Combs Citizen Citizen Wendy Rowland Whitney Bennett Citizen Barbara Bickett Citizen Amanda Lillard Citizen Jen [no last name provided] Citizen Dana Marie Ward Citizen Kathy Bartlett Citizen Dr. Thomas Kerby Neill Citizen Karen Bright Citizen Jesse L. Weil Citizen Kenny Westerman Citizen Terry Ann Maciula Citizen Abe Rabiner Citizen Albert Plucknett Citizen Laura Lea Duckworth Citizen Nadia Rasheed Citizen

Melanie Shapiro Citizen Patricia J McCarty Grandparent Tim Curry Citizen Ella Stinson Citizen Guy [no last name provided] Citizen Jackquelyn [no last name provided] Citizen Carrie Ray Citizen William McClanahan Citizen Jane Pearson Citizen Linda Miller Citizen Frank P. Campisano Citizen Stephanie Choudhury Citizen Chandra Holman Citizen Elizabeth Kopras Citizen Dave Wagner Citizen Chelsea Hewitt Citizen Cynthia Ruder Citizen Nancy Adkins Citizen Nathaniel Scott Citizen Kenneth Partymiller Citizen Brenda Withrow Citizen Frank Howard Citizen Victor Kappeler Citizen Jessica L Hollis Citizen Roger Weller Citizen Elizabeth Thrasher Citizen Laura Reece Citizen

Marguerite Shulhafer Former Teacher-Bullit Co.

Citizen Maggie Cassaro **Bradley Stevenson** Citizen Yvonne Hileman Citizen Natasha Hughes Citizen W. David Klingman Citizen **Sherry Cornell** Citizen Brenda Rudolph Citizen Bridget Abernathy Citizen Crystal Adkins Citizen Elizabeth Glass Citizen Teresa Johnson Citizen Christopher [no last name provided] Citizen Teresa Balk Citizen

Joyce Ogden

Citizen

Anne Marie Regan Citizen Dennis Bender Citizen Sarah Chace Citizen Michael Cassaro Citizen Rachel [no last name provided] Citizen Donna Moore Citizen Bill Harrison Citizen Betty M. Wray Citizen Margret Collins Citizen Larry Marshall Citizen Shevawn Akers Citizen Sandra M. Almas Citizen Allyson Kale Citizen Richard Stahlbusch Citizen Greg Abernathy Citizen Mitchell Snider Citizen Pat [no last name provided] Citizen Tina Speight Citizen Maggie Volkering Citizen Sheila Potter Citizen Dr. Edward Roberts Citizen Jill Robinson Citizen Jeannette Bracken Citizen Citizen Tanja Eikenboom Cynthia Sue Timko Citizen **Craig Sowders** Citizen Vicki Stanley Citizen Psera Newman Citizen Fielden Willmott Citizen Catherine Barber Citizen Brandy Chamberlain Citizen **Steve Hess** Citizen Coneathea [no last name provided] Citizen Chelsea Agee Citizen Claire Batt Citizen Alice Waddell Citizen Anna Secor Citizen Michael Harrison Citizen Nick Swinford Citizen Angela Mimms Citizen Amanda Schott Citizen **Annie Williams** Citizen

Dennis Spetz Citizen Joan Hendrix Citizen Geordie Garatt Citizen Craig King Citizen James A Kemp Citizen Gwen [no last name provided] Citizen Julie Tucker Citizen Linda Roberts Citizen Lisa Lossner Citizen Julie Leppert Citizen Cherie Burrows Rodriguez Citizen Susan Wood Citizen Geoffrey Young Citizen John Mahorney Citizen Steve Makela Citizen Donna Kwon Citizen Diane Folllingstad Citizen Ron Flynn Citizen C. French Citizen Richard Becker Citizen Betty Vollman Citizen Mary Eloise Moore Citizen Ted Wathen Citizen James Haggie Citizen Sean Stevens Citizen Katherine Hoover, Ph.D Citizen Mike Diebold Citizen Dave Stadtmiller Citizen Sheryl K. Smith Citizen William Scott Hunt Citizen Lance De Long Citizen Cliff Jordan Citizen Alida Dance Citizen G.M. Koehler Citizen Ralph Glick Citizen Jeremy Stinnett Citizen David Caudill Citizen Carolyn Hagaman Citizen Daehyun Kim Citizen Laura Cuarta Citizen Mitch Harris Citizen Pamela Glaze Citizen

Dewayne Easter Citizen Louise McCoy Citizen Karah Stokes Citizen Mary Paolucci Citizen Stephen Wilkins Citizen Jeffrey Auxier Citizen Veronica Beavin Citizen Corey [no last name provided] Citizen Sally Welch Citizen Stephen Nance Citizen Wendy Becker Citizen Eric H. Plichta Citizen Amelia [no last name provided] Citizen Walter L Jones Jr. Citizen Jill Mohn Citizen **Ted Swirat** Citizen Kathleen Robinson Citizen Ahmad Hassan Citizen Connie R Ragsdale Citizen Citizen Lizabeth Berryman Naomi Hudson Citizen Franklin Snowden Citizen Joan Buchar Citizen Melissa Sullivan Citizen Wanda Meadows Citizen Thelma Jackson Citizen Citizen **Evelyn Pence** Citizen Ray Sutherland **David Adams** Citizen Akeel Zaheer Citizen Aaron Swafford Citizen Stephanie Baxter Citizen Sharon [no last name provided] Citizen Michael Daugherty II Citizen Sean McDonald Citizen Benjamin Singleton Citizen Jamie Green Citizen Avi Brisman Citizen

James Jahnz Teaching Assistant, University of Kentucky

David Miles Burkholder II Citizen
Ashli Zornes Citizen
Colleen Egan Citizen

Connie Smith Citizen Phyllis L. Robinson Citizen Laurence Kant Citizen Kelly Kessler Citizen Jennifer Cole Citizen Paul Homen Citizen Ronnie Marshall Citizen Janet French Citizen Helen Burkholder Citizen William D. Spalding Citizen Dana Kellerman Citizen Ruby Cox Citizen Amy Stemmle Citizen David J. Bruner Citizen Citizen John McQueary Rebecca Nimmo Citizen Leatha Kendrick Citizen Katherine Bullock Citizen Virginia Smith Carter Citizen Zina Merkin Citizen **Dominique Olbert** Citizen Marjorie [no last name provided] Citizen Jennifer Hubbard-Sanchez Citizen Anne Gaunder Citizen Alan Krome Citizen Lois Ward Citizen Deborah Wilson Citizen Gloria Weigle Citizen Claudia Reeves Citizen Cynthia Miner Citizen

Jane Aaron Professor, Western Kentucky University

June Cantrell Citizen Citizen Loy Rush Christa Simmons Citizen J. Childers Citizen Angela Lacy Citizen Charlene Thompson Citizen Deneys Van Der Westhuyzen Citizen Laura Resnick Citizen Dana Tackett Citizen Sue Draper Citizen Lornita Swain Parent

Bobby Taylor, Jr. Citizen Heide North Citizen Mary S. Albet Citizen Blake Bennett Citizen Lynn and Daniel Langmeyer Citizens Theodore Bundy Citizen Tylene Garrett Citizen Dave Rodgers Citizen Alice Turkington Citizen John Baker Citizen Marian T. Call Citizen Linda K. Miller Citizen Robyn Bourgois Citizen Heather Mullican Citizen Racheal Mullins Citizen Jerry Reeder II Citizen Rich Schein Citizen Nancy Woods Citizen Cynthia Bowling Citizen Marita Frazier Citizen David Vaughn Citizen Pat Cooper Citizen Marilyn Motsch Citizen Addie Stokley Citizen Zac Wray Citizen Suzanne Dunne Citizen Citizen **Douglas Darling Holly Raines** Citizen **Edward Reeves** Citizen Edward M. Brown, Jr. Citizen James Stapleton Citizen Larry Scott Citizen Susan Gill Citizen **Trevor Creamer** Citizen Barbara Gail Howser Citizen Jennifer [no last name provided] Citizen Katharine Griswold Citizen Ron Knorpp Citizen Jerry Duvall Citizen David Rosenberg Citizen Lauren Bishop Citizen Sarah Ridley Citizen

Krisia Rosa Citizen Tom Hammons Citizen Holly Callaghan Citizen Denis C. Lester Citizen **Tony Armstrong** Citizen Miranda Spinks Citizen Lacy Matzner Citizen Kristin Gerton Citizen Jerry M. Chaney II Citizen Allison T. Urzuablaul Citizen Sue Larison Citizen Kate Lindsay Citizen Rev. Dr. Thomas D. Minton Citizen **Catherine Simmons** Citizen Michelle Carnes Citizen Ilse Apestegui Citizen Barbara Emmons Citizen Jo Ann Dale Citizen Elizabeth Matera Citizen Nate Brewer Citizen **Shannon Shields** Citizen Sara Smith Citizen Bernice Reynolds Citizen Savannah Marlow Citizen Carol Roderick Citizen John & Suzanne Brandt Citizens Jackie [no last name provided] Citizen Arlene [no last name provided] Citizen Felitia Y. Deer Citizen Leslea Townsend Cronin Citizen Tim Brock Citizen Heaven Bachschmid Citizen C.R. Smith Citizen John Burke Citizen Judith Turner Citizen Gerry Lykins Citizen Sonia DeMoss Citizen Lois MacGregor Citizen Judith Mize Citizen Heather Warren Citizen **Aaron Collins** Citizen Jane [no last name provided] Citizen

Eileen Herkert Citizen **Anthony Smith** Citizen Rebecca G. Barnes Citizen Joanne Paul Citizen John McAllister Citizen Frank Hamon Citizen R. Edward Owen Citizen Henry B. Buchenberger Citizen **Suzy Peers** Citizen Gail Zitelli Citizen Laura Zimmerman Citizen Stephanie Thompson Citizen Tammy Embleton Citizen Allan Mitchell Citizen Mike McLean Citizen Citizen Mary Montgomery Terri Berish Citizen Michael Best Citizen Citizen Robert Tapp Citizen Cheryl Paul-Brien Suanne Loveless Citizen David Hornback Citizen Donna Hacker Citizen Kathryn L Bomar Citizen Jim Sullivan Citizen Mollie Weisberg Citizen Citizen Leana Cottone Ruth Greenberg Citizen Mary E. Lanser Citizen Catherine Jydstrup Citizen Jonna Shaffor Citizen Megan Mezera Citizen Elise Mandel Citizen Citizen Craig MacInnes Ann Walsh Citizen Judith Babcock Citizen Tom Little Citizen Bill Hay Citizen Sue Lund Citizen Andy Cobb Citizen Sue Foster Citizen Stefanie Zoeller Citizen

Ashley Tucker Citizen Lindsey Rankin Citizen Susan Mallette Citizen Sandra Baird Citizen Marsha Bailey Citizen Lisa Rittenhouse Citizen Sylvia Ives Citizen Patricia Jackson Citizen Bruce Gruber Citizen Gail Matter Citizen Albert Westerman Citizen Nikki Buckman Citizen Danielle Jones Citizen Geraldine Lenzi Citizen Adrianne Underhill Citizen Richard Duglin Citizen Diane Robellard Citizen Mike Horyn Citizen Alice Jones Citizen Jane Harrod Citizen M. Warminski Citizen Rebecca Maluenda Citizen Paul Magee Citizen Kathrene Lewis Citizen Andy Johnson Citizen Ruth Ann Paynter Citizen Anne G. O'connor Citizen Julia Clinkenbeard Citizen Jacqueline DeAngelis Citizen Deanna Sergel Citizen Larry Treadway Citizen Michael Holian Citizen Gina Yeargan Citizen Citizen Kym Garcia Steven Warner Citizen John Zink Citizen Reva Williams Citizen Joel Fischer Citizen Douglas Barker Citizen Cheryl Willis Citizen John Bills Citizen Gerry Barker Citizen

Rebecca Gay Citizen Esther White Citizen Lyndia Elder Citizen Jen Ledford Citizen Debbie Steele Citizen Christy McCoy Citizen Coleman Taylor Citizen Diana Stuart Citizen Grace Carswell Citizen Rebecca Elliott Citizen Sheila [no last name provided] Citizen Claudia [no last name provided] Citizen Richard Perry Citizen Melissa Morgenson Citizen Maria Martinez Citizen Elizabeth Wilson Citizen Citizen Karen C. McHugh Michele Turner Citizen **Greg Stubbs** Citizen Joann Feltus Citizen Sandra Kleinberg Citizen Peter Moore Citizen Kim Venn Citizen Jerri Martin Citizen Edward Winiarczyk Citizen Kimberly DeZarn Citizen Jonathan Phillips Citizen William McAuliffe Citizen Therese Hildebrand Citizen Phillip Delaney Citizen **David Hobbs** Citizen Jeff Bowersox Citizen Kyle [no last name provided] Citizen Hal Baumann Citizen Paquita Shoupe Citizen Catherine M. Lauzon Citizen Phil Gerwe Citizen Calvin R. Minton Citizen Reverend Jim Oxyer Citizen Janet Overman Citizen Sarah Griffin Citizen Elizabeth Robert Citizen

Claude Purvis Grandparent Christopher Cencia Citizen **Sharon Davis** Citizen Gregory [no last name provided] Citizen Yolanda Morris Citizen Mary Buckley Citizen Karl Heidtbrink Citizen Lavitta McCarley Citizen John Woloch Citizen Jamie Sanchez Citizen William M. Munn, Jr. Citizen Jack Sorrell Citizen Eric S Parrish Citizen Dr. Andrew Deane Citizen Cecil Pearson, Jr. Citizen Lisa Gabbard Citizen Citizen Izak Mckenzie Rev. Alfred Hougham Citizen Lisa Gillham Citizen Rachel Jones Citizen Donna Spangler Citizen Susan J. Scollay Citizen Shawn Tucker Citizen **David Holmes** Citizen Cathy Rager Citizen **Holly Erwin** Citizen Citizen Paul Bachschmid Emanuel P. Rogers Citizen Citizen Carolyn S. Bratt Kristin Studle Citizen **David Salisbury** Citizen Hamid [no last name provided] Citizen Alycia Ware Citizen **Robin Broyles** Citizen Shirl Atwell Citizen Jeffrey Burns Citizen **Shelby Bevins** Citizen Ernestine Sharelle Lyons-Goodwin Citizen Joni Tyler Citizen Nathaniel Koerber Citizen George Rasmussen Citizen Nora Lindsey Citizen

Jordan Cole Citizen Jason Powell Citizen Manju Ahuja Citizen **Doug Carter** Citizen Ann Miller Citizen Mary Alford Citizen Paula Baker Citizen Gail Reece Citizen **Todd Curtis** Citizen Hilarie Bratset Citizen **Brett Martin** Citizen David Wilcoxson Citizen Wendy Hatfield Citizen Charles Gibson Citizen Barry Brunson Citizen Whitney [no last name provided] Citizen Myron McLain Citizen Pamela J. Rollings Citizen Cara Cashor Citizen Citizen Susan Taylor Justin David Miracle Citizen Peggy Tope Citizen Judy Schroeder Citizen Citizen Joyce Mosher Edgar Lopez Citizen Peter [no last name provided] Citizen Stephanie Weber Citizen Citizen Edgar Lopez Laura White Citizen W. B. Bickel Citizen **Shannon Ellis** Citizen Citizen Gaylia Bond Dean Ward Citizen Kristyn [no last name provided] Citizen Terri Bessette Citizen Rosemary Purdy Citizen Philip Mallott Citizen

John Mateja, Ph.D.

Physicist, Former Dean of The College of Science-

Murray Sate

Terry Fontenot Citizen
Jacob Butler Citizen
William E. Smith Citizen

Janette McCabb Citizen Jenny Thrasher Citizen **Daniel Ewing** Citizen Tara Blomquist Citizen William Brown Citizen Jane Peters Citizen **Katie Spires** Citizen Vicki Schopmeyer Citizen Jennifer Leslie Citizen Bill McCoy Citizen Caitlin Sparks Citizen Gae Broadwater Citizen Jenny Townsend Citizen Linda Horvay Citizen Steve Loy Citizen George Perkins Citizen Alban Wheeler Citizen Melanie Hamilton Citizen H. Mullins Citizen Kimberly Kincaid Citizen Kim Kincaid Citizen Nancy Huffstutter Citizen Tracy Hill Citizen Courtney Brooks Citizen William Eddy Citizen Glenn Russelburg Citizen **Edward Miller** Citizen Mark Armstrong Citizen **Torian Murphy** Citizen Jeremy Jarratt Citizen Amy Meadows Citizen P.T. Dixon Citizen Roy M. Phillips Citizen Citizen Anita Dennis Miriam Silman Citizen Gary R. Thies Citizen Wendy Simpkins Citizen Charles R Shanks Citizen Doug Penrod Citizen Olivia Ph.D. Citizen Reverend Beverly Lewis Citizen George Ferry Citizen

Janice Ph.D. Citizen Mary Brouse Citizen Benjamin Clark Citizen Terry Allen Citizen Jack B. Wood Citizen Kathy Doyle Citizen Maria Bordt Citizen Diane M. Moody Citizen Kevin Wyatt Citizen Michele Curry Citizen Mandy Clarke Citizen Marilyn Robie Citizen Margie Fry Citizen Jim Logan Citizen Tim Petersime Citizen Lisa C. Campisano Citizen Citizen A. Allen Roy Reid Citizen Richard Blish Citizen Laura Rice Citizen Tracey Boyer Citizen Kenny Smith Citizen William M. Doom Citizen James Whittinghill Citizen Esse Hodge Citizen Cindy Yeager Citizen Citizen Tracy Irwin **Tammy Bennington** Citizen Maria Marchal Citizen Virginia Delaney Citizen Claudia Collins Citizen Lane Boldman Citizen Denise Bradshaw Citizen Anwen Dutson Citizen Jeff Sharp Citizen Julie Minor-Hackworth Citizen Treva T. Duffy Citizen Sally Hattemer Citizen Ryan Merickel Citizen Catherine Hillerich Citizen Sandy Spears Citizen Carmine Giglio Citizen

Robert D. Moreland Citizen Ellen Kelley Citizen Roger Guffey Citizen Pat Osborn Citizen Charles Thompson Citizen Mary Schleifer Citizen Marvin McCoomer Citizen Nancy Rowles Citizen Judy Munro-Leighton Citizen **Steve Forbes** Citizen Dorothy Kennedy Citizen Michael W. Harper Citizen Lorin Rockwell Citizen **Timothy Davis** Citizen Alex Phillips Citizen James Deep Citizen **David Smith** Citizen Janet Graham Citizen Anne MacFie Citizen Citizen Joseph Burke Gwendolyn Haver Davis Citizen Annette Redd Citizen Joe Oldham Citizen Don Pratt Citizen Teresa White Citizen Bill Bowman Citizen Citizen **Dustin Wygant** Rodney Ashby Citizen Jerry Sykes Citizen Raymond Barry Citizen Alice Harris Citizen **Enoch Harding** Citizen Shannon [no last name provided] Citizen Dave Starke Citizen Anette Engel Citizen Judith Niles Citizen Mary Kasarskis Citizen Brenda K. Fauber Citizen Kathy Wolfson Citizen Alison Meehan Citizen Teresa Osborne Citizen Anthony Slone Citizen

Rachel D. Gati Citizen Karen Levy Citizen Katherine S. Goetz Citizen James [no last name provided] Citizen Gerald Glover Citizen Richard Barnett Citizen Joan Georgick Citizen Jason D. Gati Citizen Hannah Helm Citizen James Kimbrough Citizen Amber Wilson Citizen Wanda Perkins Citizen Maureen Gregory Citizen Christine Zickel Citizen Citizen Margaret L. Fleming Jason Feddersen Citizen Jenny Minier Citizen Janet Falcone Citizen Vivian M. Mosley Citizen Citizen Katie French M. Doug Gerrard Citizen Dr. Margaret Readdy Citizen Julie Pease Citizen Citizen Sherry Stillwell Lina Brackett Findlay Citizen Robin W. Strey Citizen Susan Lear Citizen Kelly Ryan Citizen **Zachary Pfeiffer** Citizen James Burton Citizen Tim Dalton Citizen **Justin Embry** Citizen Alan L. Snodgrass Citizen Clinton Johnson Citizen Jonathan Sarfin Citizen Chris Heinz Citizen Oraib Yacoub Citizen David L. Runge Citizen Sherba Nelson Citizen Carolyn Biggs Citizen Robin K Bagley Citizen Cynthia Warner Citizen

Lois Vpn Nostitz Citizen Matthew Strey Citizen Lucy Stoll Citizen Dan [no last name provided] Citizen Linda Boggs Citizen Michael B. Rhea Citizen Delilah [no last name provided] Citizen Lois Gaines Citizen Melissa Embry Citizen Gwen McDyer Citizen Monica [no last name provided] Citizen Jennifer White Citizen Bonnie Lash Freeman Citizen Marjorie Guyon Citizen Bryan Flanery Citizen Jack Kleier Citizen **Judy Goldsmith** Citizen Robert Campbell Citizen David M Butler Citizen Larry J. Spivey Citizen David Ludden Citizen Charlie [no last name provided] Citizen **Ned Smith** Citizen Monique Morton Citizen Gretchen Milliken Citizen Russell Moore Citizen Judy Richardson Jett Citizen Rada [no last name provided] Citizen Lisa [no last name provided] Citizen Jeanette Coufal Citizen Joan Tokarz Citizen Peggy Helm Citizen Phyllis [no last name provided] Citizen Keith Bond Citizen Judith Olson Citizen Donna Blue Citizen Jennifer Van Winkle Citizen Barb Sherman Citizen **Brian Bottom** Citizen John P. Lonneman Citizen **Denise Davis** Citizen Scott Hodge Citizen

John [no last name provided] Citizen Tim York Citizen Christopher Hofmann Citizen Sheila Hardaway Citizen Ann Sharp Citizen Carol Brodeur Citizen Gene and Liz Givan Citizens Typh Hainer Merwarth Citizen Deborah Greenberg Citizen **Greg Tichenor** Citizen Kamala Thompson Citizen Greg Miller Citizen Claire Fuller Citizen Robert Wilson Citizen Cynthia Robinson Citizen Samantha [no last name provided] Citizen Rebecca Rumery Citizen John Youngblood Citizen Donnie Duncan Citizen Mary Kroncke Citizen Amanda Sorrell Citizen David Watson II Citizen

Ed [no last name provided] Director, Kentucky Env. Ed. Projects

Stephanie [no last name provided] Citizen Deborah L Reese Citizen Jean Cravens Citizen Blair Boden Citizen Citizen Ron Wagoner Tina Davis Citizen Joseph Wathen Citizen Thomas H. Pike Citizen Carol Held Citizen Suzann O'Koon Citizen Richard [no last name provided] Citizen Helen Jones Citizen Patricia Hawkins Citizen Maleva Chamberlain Citizen Bruce Schulte Citizen Connie [no last name provided] Citizen Julie Hansen Citizen Julie [no last name provided] Citizen Adam Casson Citizen

Susan C. Brown Citizen Patrick King Citizen Patricia Gailey Citizen Mary Kerestesy Citizen Silver Hamlin Citizen Elizabeth Dansberry Citizen Donna Clontz Citizen Ashley Butler Citizen Katherine Andrews Citizen Gloria Hanlon Citizen Dona Renfro Citizen Vahid Salehi Citizen Danica V. Meredith Citizen **Denis Burton** Citizen Carrol [no last name provided] Citizen Mary J. Hart Citizen Citizen Anne Hosking Gavin Moles Citizen Bill Best Citizen Mary O'Shea Citizen Ronald DeChristoforo Citizen Guy Futral Citizen Lisa Hollander Citizen Selva Calderon Citizen Maggie Frozena Citizen Rex Lyons Citizen Citizen Carmen Edington John Maruskin Citizen Citizen Dennis L. Chapman John Kowynia Citizen Tom Miller Citizen Deb [no last name provided] Citizen Leon Pauley Citizen Diane Danckert-Jinks Citizen Vi Ligenza Citizen David Vicari Citizen Nan Willis Citizen Almeda J. Haskins Citizen Paul R. Blackburn Citizen Else K. Bolotin Citizen Pam Massey Citizen Gina Piecoro Citizen

Mellanie Clayton Citizen Gayla Gilbert Citizen Patricia Ayers Citizen Lora Hillerich Citizen Brian Clark Citizen Linda Woolridge Citizen Joseph Baust Citizen Donna Puckett Citizen Dee Atkinson Citizen Julie Reynolds Citizen Rachel Kennedy Citizen Betsy Adler Citizen **Sharyl Emberton** Citizen Albert Sinks Citizen Kandy Fear Citizen Heather [no last name provided] Citizen Kenneth Zegart Citizen Amy Coe Citizen Linda Young Citizen Cheryl Nowling Grandparent Citizen Sonya Jackson Anthony Bailey Citizen Karen Chinetti Citizen Jen Shean Citizen Jennifer Shean Citizen Randa McPherson Citizen **Sharon Crawford** Citizen Peggy Watson Citizen Brandi Warren Citizen Ollie Preece Citizen Faith McCoomer Citizen Kathy Steinmetz Citizen Ron Spangler Citizen Charlie Perkins Citizen Raellyn Hatter Citizen William Bennett Citizen Norm Strobel Citizen Rosann Effron Citizen Mary [no last name provided] Citizen Judy Johnson Citizen Erika Ravenscraft Citizen Georgiana W. Strickland Citizen

Rick Straus Citizen Mona Lahner Citizen Norm Strobel Citizen Phyllis Manners Citizen **Grant Short** Citizen Marcia [no last name provided] Citizen Sean Prónay Citizen Stella Gibson Citizen Susan M. Bentley, MD, PhD Citizen Andrea Autry Citizen Sherri M. McGee Citizen Barbara Schwabe Citizen Chris Miller Citizen Ed O'Connell Citizen Citizen Kelsey Forren Barbara Cambron Citizen Carole Gahm Citizen Jeffnye Strey Citizen John Wesley Humphries Citizen David Shroyer Citizen Carlos Palomino Citizen Jenny Stephenson Citizen Anna [no last name provided] Citizen Rosemarie [no last name provided] Citizen Joe Brackett Citizen Melanie Wyatt Citizen Citizen **Judy Stice** Mark Steiner Citizen Jackson Reese Faust Citizen Billy Hunt Citizen Elizabeth Coleman Citizen Loyal Jones Citizen **Edward Colley** Citizen

David Underwood-Sweet Former Teacher

Phyllis England Citizen **David Gilmour** Citizen Nashia Fife Citizen Nathan Womack Citizen Jeanne Marie Hibberd Citizen Cheryl Shuffitt Citizen Tiffany Vair Citizen Victoria Arnett Citizen

Christina Stephenson Citizen Debra Beckmann Citizen Deborah Raftery Grandparent Greg Drake Citizen Anne Roberts Citizen Thomas Geoghegan Citizen Naomi Schulz Citizen Nancy Adams Citizen Drexel Greene Citizen Delphine Le Dorze Citizen Joe Drury Citizen Ben [no last name provided] Citizen Jane Fink Citizen Lauren Ashcraft Citizen **Ronald Byars** Citizen Elizabeth Perkins Citizen Citizen Leslie Compton Elizabeth Baber Citizen Kathy Williams Citizen Sr. Adrian Hofstetter O.P. Citizen Marilyn Roach Citizen Larry [no last name provided] Citizen Laci Osborne Citizen Patricia Metcalf Citizen Ellen Woods Ramey Citizen Phyllis Florman Citizen Maria Vansickle Citizen Missi Baker Citizen Joanna Loomis Citizen Barbara J. Gardner Citizen Bixler W. Howland Citizen Jennifer L. Click Citizen Dory Hudspeth Citizen Jennie L. Stanley Citizen Marcy Allen Citizen Andrew Castle Citizen Ellen Burt Citizen Rene Thompson Citizen Toni Meriah Kruse Citizen Joe Gorsick Citizen Molly Newman Citizen Keith Brown Citizen

David Svetich Citizen Fonda Butler Citizen Thomas Johnston Citizen Sara [no last name provided] Citizen Ann Hoenscheid Citizen **David Gentry** Citizen **Grant Randall** Citizen **Constance Dorval** Citizen Gail P. Cleveland Citizen Jessie Noble Citizen Nahtanha Hering Citizen Dona Wells Citizen Tom Musgrave Citizen Shawn Jones Citizen Katy Coleman Citizen Ivonne Rovira Citizen **Keith Jones** Citizen Carla Baumann Citizen Robin Lancaster Citizen Citizen Mary S. Fulk William Jackson Citizen Denny Longsworth Citizen Gary Boggess Citizen Jeff Garretson I Citizen D. Catherine Miller, MD Citizen Dorene Burke Citizen James Parson Citizen Lisa Harris Citizen **Emily Boone** Citizen Barbara Rathmann Citizen John Mccarty Citizen Adam Kenter Citizen Nancy Caudill Citizen Bob [no last name provided] Citizen Debra Ezzell Citizen Sofia Jozefowicz Citizen Louis Larson Citizen **Delores Eisenbeis** Citizen Roberta Burnes Citizen B. Briggs Citizen Sean Detisch Citizen Virginia Kutak Citizen

Misty Haas Citizen Casey Hinds Citizen Brandon M. Sergent Citizen Kenny [no last name provided] Citizen Teresa O'Connor Citizen **Edward Hughes** Citizen Razia Husain Citizen Jan Marshall Citizen Denise Fletcher Citizen Dierdra Thompson Citizen **Shelby Livers** Citizen Marian D. Willard Citizen Doris [no last name provided] Citizen Andrew [no last name provided] Citizen Dawn Butler Citizen Edward Zaragoza Citizen Jeff [no last name provided] Citizen Rose W. Garden Citizen Arnita Booth Citizen Charlotta Norby Citizen Tim Blair Citizen Karen Gauthier Citizen Tova Shinall Citizen Citizen JoAnn Borntrager Cheryle [no last name provided] Citizen Patricia Alexander Citizen **Dorita Stinnett** Citizen **Todd Florence** Citizen William Fowler Citizen Ken Bowman Citizen Citizen Traci Taylor Jane A Miller Citizen Kelly Cline Citizen Robert Hartz Citizen Kerri Raymer Citizen Tom Wallace Lyons Citizen Andy Wild Citizen Francesca Rogier Citizen Delmer Lay Jr Citizen Kim Glindmeyer Citizen Gil Fauber Citizen Charles Wiley Citizen

Lee Torabi Citizen Barbara Hood Citizen Vicki Terrell Citizen Jan Scherrer Citizen Sarah [no last name provided] Citizen Kathy Werking Citizen Tom Wanner Citizen Lesley Lusher Citizen Mary Fletcher Citizen Julie Pauly Citizen Judy Mason Citizen Fannie Madden-Grider Citizen Thomas Herrick Citizen Paul [no last name provided] Citizen Nick Moore Citizen Delvan Ramey Citizen Carmel Wallace, MD Citizen Cynthia Hoskin Citizen Scott Clark Citizen Diane Chase Citizen Sue Mize Citizen Amy Beth Able Citizen Jerry Barnaby Citizen Christine Shikenjanski Citizen Jessica Muncy Citizen Matthew Fraider Citizen Citizen Tammy Gray Roger Givens Citizen Tyler Sanslow Citizen **Brad Barr** Citizen Mindy Antonchak Citizen Bernard Steinhoff Citizen Margaret Burge Citizen Citizen David A. Browning Roger Perrone Citizen Jacqueline Cober Citizen Kimberly Colley Citizen Mary E. O'Dell Citizen **Bonnie Lucas** Citizen Sheila Wulf Citizen Sue Holloway Citizen Keiron O'Connell Citizen

Mindy Miller Citizen Steve Henry Citizen Sune Frederiksen Citizen Lucy Arthur-Paratley Citizen Nedra Lundberg Citizen Max Wineinger Citizen Cynthia Dunn Citizen Scott Whitlow Citizen Sara Talbot Citizen Kim Sunseri Citizen Susan Sampson Citizen Helene Chlopan Citizen Leslee Hellmann Citizen Bill Flarsheim Citizen **Annilee Perkins** Citizen Jan Sharpe Citizen Arthur Hardin Citizen Michele Hulsey Citizen Jeff Wiles Citizen Citizen Susan Curry Amy Menze Citizen K.L. Sallee Citizen Gaines Hall Citizen Roger Akers Citizen Mary T. Terlau Citizen **David Sampson** Citizen Tonya [no last name provided] Citizen James Dowell Citizen Susan Hughs Citizen Jacqueline Harrison Citizen Gerald Mcpherson Citizen Gary Cooper Citizen Hunt Helm Citizen Citizen Gary Green Cynthia Showalter Citizen **Greg Stamper** Citizen Beverly Byrum Citizen Steven McCulloch Citizen Leslie Sims Citizen Charles Suddeth Citizen Elizabeth Gail Adam Citizen Madelaine Enochs Citizen

Randall Wright Parent Rich Wilkinson Citizen Jean Christensen Citizen Ed Eastridge Citizen Joan Mcgregor Citizen Janna Unger Citizen **Beverly Martin Daly** Citizen Courtney Hart Citizen Shannon G. Abbott Citizen Betsy Wiley Citizen **Hunter Bradley** Citizen Gail Allen Citizen Mary Ann Stenger Citizen Michele Reilly Citizen Citizen LaVonne Fingerson Loren Townsend Citizen Roger Pearson Citizen Randy Smith Citizen Charles Wheatley Citizen Letitia Ross Citizen Matthew Wagner Citizen Judy Hutchison Citizen Kathleen Maguire Citizen Marcia McDermott Citizen Rodford E. Smith Engineer Camille Norman Citizen Rosa Halcomb Citizen Emma Engelman Citizen Maxye S. Henry Citizen **Judith Prats** Citizen Ben Yandell Citizen Monica Turner Citizen Rebecca [no last name provided] Citizen Citizen Ashley Hogue Laura Whiting Citizen Jaine Novosel Citizen Ann W. Olson Citizen Deborah Roig Citizen Elizabeth Packard Citizen Marlon Linton Citizen Phil Taylor Citizen Caitlin G Myron Citizen

Margaret Crowder Citizen Steve Sweeney Citizen Chris [no last name provided] Citizen Priscilla Diamond Citizen Jed Turner Citizen Tabitha Hodges Citizen **Bridget Shen** Citizen Vaughn Plummer Citizen Robert Valentive Citizen Thomas Donohue Citizen Leslie Jancovich Citizen Sandy W. Wolford Citizen Chris Shaffer Citizen Len Press Citizen Kimberly Mohammed Citizen Sondos Al Sad Citizen Julie Dinwiddie Citizen Kathleen Davis Citizen Samantha Duncan Citizen Mary Caric Citizen Donna Anderson Citizen Joe Phelps Citizen Joseph D. Chappell Citizen Citizen Holly Vincent Sheila Coughlin Citizen Deb Shoss Citizen Virginia Madison Citizen David [no last name provided] Citizen Joey Stevenson Citizen Kerry Zack Citizen James L Dickinson Citizen Eric Ferguson Citizen Jean Sparrow Citizen Sharon Halligan Citizen Fiona Young-Brown Citizen **Emily Bingham** Citizen Robert Thrun Citizen Mike Kenney Citizen Ann Murphy Citizen Carl Lee Citizen Dean [no last name provided] Citizen Michael Minter Citizen

Kristina [no last name provided] Citizen John Spence Citizen Kathleen Davis Citizen Pamela Parrott Citizen **Dwight Billings** Citizen Timothy Krzywisseau Citizen **Robin Hollis** Citizen Roma Prindle Citizen Samantha George Citizen Meredith S. Grider Citizen Sabra Crockett Citizen Keith Deaton Citizen Deborah Vollbracht Citizen Erica Pantalion Citizen Rebecca [no last name provided] Citizen Barbara Slater Citizen Jimmy Blankenship Citizen Elli Pace Citizen Stacey Wagoner Citizen Corrie McClain Citizen Rosalie Kleopfel Citizen Sharon Mc Donogh Citizen Sheila Hoffman Citizen Nina Doan Citizen Stephanie Frazure Citizen Jamie [no last name provided] Citizen **Terry Terry** Citizen **Bill Bowling** Citizen Steve [no last name provided] Citizen Lauren Mauser Citizen J.D. Lester Citizen Jim Schmitz Citizen James Norton Citizen Tyler Wilham Citizen Ben Clay Citizen Cannon Applegate Citizen BJ Carpenter Citizen Katie Kneislev Citizen Deborah Haggard Citizen Helga Gilbert Citizen Catherine Clement Citizen Blair Gibeau Citizen

Sharon Mofield-Boswell Citizen Greta Ratliff Citizen Joel Royalty Citizen Eliza Petzinger Citizen **Emaline Gray** Citizen Don Jones Citizen Kathleen Lesperance Citizen Julie Daniels Citizen Debi Wells Citizen George Kolbenschlag Citizen Stephanie Wing Citizen John Randolph Citizen Amanda Mussetter Citizen Amy Gower Citizen Cathy Vigor Citizen Susan Boggs Citizen Barbie Hutcherson Citizen Thomas E. Gaston Citizen Kayla Roach Citizen Susan M. Crosswait Citizen Judy Tyler Citizen Kate Wheeler Citizen Sonja Mather Citizen **Emily Victoria Williams** Citizen Alan Alsup Citizen Dana J. Brown Citizen Citizen Myles Marcovitch Jayme Haslam Citizen Jody Cofer Citizen Susan Stempel Citizen Allison [no last name provided] Citizen Morgan Phillips Citizen Karima Abdullah Citizen Nick Taylor Citizen Paula Lachapelle Citizen William Wilkinson Citizen Libbie Sherman Citizen **Todd Gilmet** Citizen Kathy [no last name provided] Citizen Ken [no last name provided] Citizen Sean Smith Citizen **Chad Brambley** Citizen

George Ella Lyon Citizen Julia E. Lewis Citizen Georgia Doukas Citizen Katie Bush Citizen Sarah O'Koon Citizen Christina Bronaugh Citizen Jill Lauroesch Citizen Linda [no last name provided] Citizen **Brad Houck** Citizen Linda [no last name provided] Citizen Sherman Robert Partin Citizen Joseph D. Smith Citizen Amy Marshall Citizen Amy Kirk Citizen **Chris Robbins** Citizen **Eve Hiatt** Citizen Pattie Stivender Citizen Bobby Ray Citizen Jeremy Rogers Citizen Rebecca Holbert Citizen Diane Lewis Citizen Teri Corson Citizen Ken Oliver Citizen Citizen Stacey Mills Lisa [no last name provided] Citizen Molly Tackett Citizen Karen Dobson Citizen Steven Katz Citizen Larry [no last name provided] Citizen Leeann Bernier Citizen Nathan Meyer Citizen Will Connell Citizen Katie Jarrett Citizen Lucy [no last name provided] Citizen Mark Romanelli Citizen Joe Knoepfler Citizen Pat Whitlow Citizen Charles McCoy Citizen Citizen J.L. Parsons Mary Ann Conlon Citizen J. Manning Citizen Randy Bailey Citizen

Carl Root Citizen Louis Leslie Citizen Amanda Kilmer Citizen Catherine Sherron Citizen Matthew Heath Citizen Heather Lyons Citizen Brenda Clay Citizen Doris [no last name provided] Citizen Don Weber Citizen Jodi Lees Citizen John Engelman Citizen Barbara Combs Citizen Mary Welp Citizen Henry Hendrix Citizen Mary Ellen Hackman Citizen Joan Duncan Citizen Gordon [no last name provided] Citizen Jennifer Havens Citizen Elisia Cohen Citizen David Seidenfaden Citizen **David Stewart** Citizen **Ruth Gehres** Citizen Barbara Haller Citizen Tina Stith Citizen Loys Mather Citizen Thomas Reed Citizen Citizen Joyce Henderson Ann Olsen Citizen Abbey Poffenberger Citizen **Aaron Richards** Citizen Loretta Howard Citizen Erica Roth Citizen John Metzler Citizen Bev Metzler Citizen J.B. Johnson-Allen Citizen Paul Downs Citizen Lois McWhorter Citizen Margaret Coyne Citizen Donna Becher Citizen Paul Schrader Citizen Eleanor Forsythe Citizen Raquel [no last name provided] Citizen

Karamy Renfrow Citizen Ted Zaragoza Citizen Tracy Peck Citizen Georgia [no last name provided] Citizen Jacquelyn Thompson Citizen Marge Keller Citizen Suzanne Meeks Citizen Barbara W. Simmons Citizen Kyle Bocko Citizen Michael Maier Citizen Delores Snellen Citizen Bill Fath Citizen Paul Tincher Citizen Susan Fangman Citizen Citizen Betty Weaver J.C. Adams Citizen Michael Gramling Citizen Mike Polak Citizen Catharine Gibson Citizen Brad [no last name provided] Citizen Joanna Faber Citizen Tom Schmitt Citizen Kenneth Napper Citizen **Hobe Withers** Citizen Michelle Adaway Citizen Gina McGraw Citizen Lisa Lyford Citizen Sandra Wardwell Citizen Mary Newton Citizen Erica O'Brien Citizen John Niehaus Citizen Beau Irving Citizen Jennifer Bell Citizen Tara O'Donnell Citizen Ed Swain Citizen Rick Hughes Citizen Sonya Worthington Citizen Robert Clark Citizen Mary Fehrenbacher Citizen James Locke Citizen Randall Eades Citizen Jeffrey Segal Citizen

Matilda Scott Citizen Kay [no last name provided] Citizen Angie Guion Citizen William Sariego Citizen Cindy Mcknight Citizen Richard Naas Citizen Joann Ray Citizen Craig Oliver Citizen

Michael Cunningham University Educator

Dale Johnson Citizen **Candace Jones** Citizen Jesus Hazas, B.Sc., Physics Citizen Bob and Phyllis Terrell Citizens Josh Griggs Citizen Anne Stiene-Martin Citizen L. S. Campbell Citizen Ann Broadhurst Citizen Sandy Pike Citizen Cheri Eskridge Citizen William G. Degen Citizen Citizen Lisa Pettrey Dean Hite Citizen Karen Seidler Citizen K. Worthen Citizen Rose Lege Citizen Christina Thomas Citizen Citizen Eugene Knapp Connie N. Paynter Citizen Betty Rudder Citizen Lee Fletcher Citizen Citizen Perry Moore Alice Newman Citizen Andrew Brown Citizen Landra Lewis Citizen Sarah [no last name provided] Citizen Jeremy Grizzle Citizen Cynthia Star Citizen Lisa Sons Citizen Mary Rust Citizen Richard LeMaster Citizen Michael G. Christerson Citizen Mary Kirkman Citizen

Tracey Meyers Citizen Sandra Grossl Citizen Laurie [no last name provided] Citizen Patricia W. Oliver Citizen Doug Cottrell Citizen Lisa Goldberg Citizen **Noelle Smith** Citizen Heather Adamkiewicz Citizen Rebecca Wren Citizen Janet Apple Citizen Robert Wooldridge Citizen James A. Wille Citizen Agatha Rigdon Citizen John [no last name provided] Citizen **Audrey Morrison** Citizen Mason Newman Citizen Jacqueline Dickerson Citizen Carmen Carter Citizen Scott Whitehair Citizen Susan Bell Citizen Jamie Edwards Citizen Ezra Haggard Citizen Jeremy [no last name provided] Citizen Latricia Riley Citizen Ann W. Diego Citizen Benjamin R. Senninger Citizen Carole Fair Citizen Adam Taylor Citizen Marcia [no last name provided] Citizen John Swindells Citizen Linda Connolly Citizen Ashlea L. Shepherd Citizen Karlyn Schnapp Citizen Kelly Wilkins Citizen Vicki Morgan Citizen Clair Schaub Citizen Rose Moore Citizen Bill Deatherage Citizen Edwina S. Nelson Citizen Elizabeth Lorch Citizen **Beverly Jones** Citizen Sherrie Davison Citizen

Kathie Burden Citizen Alan Golding Citizen Carol Huber Citizen Heather Huber Citizen Lauren Bridges Citizen Janet New Citizen Theresa Ambs Citizen Dana Conway Citizen Dana Hees Citizen Richard Murc Citizen Mary K. Faulhaber Citizen Esther Murphy Citizen Mary Mohr Citizen Megan McCoy Citizen Citizen Rick Johnson **Donald Sands** Citizen Patricia Swearingen Citizen Danise Newton Citizen Matthew Penn Citizen Mary Freitag Citizen John T. Feris Citizen Joelyn Prather Citizen Tana Wright Citizen Charlesann Garrett Citizen Frank F. Coffey Citizen Shannon Bear Citizen Lisa Black Citizen Margie D. Lannum Citizen Robert Lorch Citizen M. Scott Adams Citizen Anne Storey Citizen Ruth Webb Citizen Rick [no last name provided] Citizen Hannelore Goldberg Citizen De Sledge [no other name provided] Citizen Julie Watts-Baker Citizen **David Contarino** Citizen John S. Lowry Citizen Citizen Crystal Gosto Jeanne Kalvar Citizen Walter Hill Citizen **Sherry Turner** Citizen

Tiffany Madison Citizen Chasati McCowan Citizen Glenye Oakford Citizen James A. Williams Citizen Peter Bodnar Citizen Jan Weber Citizen Michael Hildreth Citizen Dorothy Poppe Citizen James Kanan Citizen Karen Simms Tolson Citizen Karen Marks Citizen Keith Frazier Citizen T.J. Thomas Citizen Rita Swan Citizen Citizen Matthew Falk Nancy Fouser Citizen Rick Tabb Citizen **Kevin Graves** Citizen Deidre [no last name provided] Citizen Citizen Belinda Stanley Jason Thierbach Citizen Joye Spinks Citizen Missy Luckett Citizen Ashley Joyner Citizen Ann Snider Citizen Andrew Jameson Citizen Citizen **Greg Crabb** Richard Carlson Citizen John Timm Citizen Bonnie Mack Citizen Anita Stamper Citizen Veeko Lucas Citizen Arlene Tuttle Citizen Saima Ritchie Citizen Andy Mead Citizen James Roach Citizen Maureen Saxon Citizen Tiya Todd Citizen Citizen Jack Holley Dionne [no last name provided] Citizen Ana Rodriguez Citizen Andrea Mitchell Citizen

Dana Duncan Citizen Kurt [no last name provided] Citizen Amy McCorkle Citizen Melissa Kelley Citizen Mariam Levy Citizen Elizabeth Lemerise Citizen Leah Pigram Citizen William Slone Citizen Melanie Mills Citizen Gary W. Potter Citizen Stephanie Britt Citizen Ian Ellis Citizen John Hettinger Citizen Kyle Brewer Citizen Citizen Michael Trover Jeff Pierson Citizen Citizen Michele Wright Dave Melendy Citizen Kathryn Eckert Citizen Amy Wernette Citizen Susannah Woodcock Citizen Elise Baucum Citizen Florence Saltzman Citizen Citizen April Baker LouAnn Kruse Citizen Mary Marquardt Citizen Nicholas Miller Citizen Catherine Morton Ward Citizen Ada skillern Citizen Aimee Thornton Imes Citizen Wayne Fowler Citizen Richard Horn Citizen Anetha Ratliff Citizen Kimberly Ann Valentine Citizen Wayne Bonnett Citizen Weston Worthington Citizen Christopher Seidler Citizen **Barry Tonning** Citizen Barbara Skinner Citizen Jason Reid Citizen Kelly Wright Citizen Jim Clarke Citizen

Rebecca Perry Citizen William Bailey Citizen Jennifer Schwab Citizen Alison Valentine Citizen Terry Harney Citizen Kim Vonder Haar Citizen Walker Yanarella Citizen Art Skinner Citizen Ian Mcgee Citizen Lorand Sarna Citizen Rachel Sanders Citizen Mel [no last name provided] Citizen Joe Cinquina Citizen Michael Taylor Citizen Citizen Erin Smith Milenia [no last name provided] Citizen Brian A. Williams Citizen Jamae Fusilier Citizen Marie Shafe Citizen William Floyd Citizen Frances O'Connor Citizen Lora Unthank Citizen M. Coates Citizen Linda Leeser Citizen Ronald Kestler Citizen

Tammy L. Bright Substitute Teacher

Donna Tyus Citizen Cecilia Watkins Citizen Jennifer Monarch Citizen Jackie Rubin Citizen Jackie Rubin Citizen C. Michael Nelson Citizen Debbie Barber Citizen Tim Evans Citizen **David Tufts** Citizen Nathan Link Citizen Kathi Clayton Citizen Sam Sloss Citizen Kelli Bennett Citizen Roger Noe Citizen Jan Wise Citizen Catherine Mekus Citizen

Sherwood Thompson Citizen Bill Young Citizen Jay Brandt Citizen Eric T. Morrow Citizen Amy Hunley Citizen Patricia Pointer Citizen Pat Tully, Jr Citizen Joseph Riehm Citizen M.B. Hyden Citizen Jack Ashworth Citizen Ryan Holliday Citizen Jennifer Lawrey Citizen Ed Waggemer Citizen Levetta Perry Citizen Sharon Suddeath Citizen Amanda Proietti Citizen Neha Angal Citizen Rick Freeman Citizen Renae Duncan Citizen Zenolia Miller Citizen Beverly Rockwell Citizen Joe Anne Overstreet Citizen Melvia Means Citizen Teresa George Citizen Hilary Jarvis Citizen Alfred Shapere Citizen Betty [no last name provided] Citizen William Wharton Citizen Jennifer Ray Citizen Suzanne Wooldridge Citizen Barbara A. Fiehn Citizen Dana Grothaus Citizen Sue Bione-Grevious Citizen Wilma Osborne Citizen Michael Van Leeuwen Citizen Christine R. Conley Citizen Don Shepherd Citizen Chris Keyser Citizen Ben Overgaauw Citizen Nick Bierman Citizen Tink Boord-Dill Citizen Lindsay Slack Citizen

Joshua [no last name provided] Citizen Michelle [no last name provided] Citizen Stephanie Reynolds Citizen Gail Keam Citizen Laura Thiemann Citizen J. Patrick Citizen Donald A. Seeger Citizen Steven Fife Citizen Kathleen Logan Citizen Jennifer Mick Citizen Mary Keltner Citizen John Russ Citizen William Deines Citizen Terry Foreman Citizen Martha Keen Citizen Melody Nutt Citizen Jerry Farris Citizen Mr. David Floyd Baker Citizen John Cronin Citizen Greg Cardwell-Copenhefer Citizen Jennifer Wilkins Citizen Tyler Mayfield Citizen Stewart S. Farrar Citizen **Barry Griggs** Citizen Kathy Thomason Citizen Teri Kimbro Citizen Susan Mann Citizen Myra Lewis Citizen Sheila Welsh Citizen Sharon Holder Citizen Citizen Ross E. Murray Jessica Farquhar Citizen Donna Pearson Citizen Vicki Evans Citizen Stanley Devoogd Citizen Sarah Franklin Citizen Linda Heck Citizen Claire [no last name provided] Citizen Jennifer Thierman Citizen Angela Jones Teacher

Madison Moore Future Science Teacher

E. Stewart Citizen

Megan Poole Citizen Jerry Hacker Citizen Nancy Back Citizen Jeremy Krueger Citizen Gene Lege Citizen Holly Brown Citizen Ray Sabbatine Citizen Laura Hays Citizen Theresa Crocker Citizen Melba Smith Citizen **James Norris** Citizen Elizabeth Turley Citizen Jules Arnold Citizen Kyle Rinne Citizen Citizen Stephanie Hlavacek **Scott Evans** Citizen Carla Bevins Citizen Alicia Vertrees Citizen Joyce Minkler Citizen Amanda [no last name provided] Citizen John Mulligan Citizen Julia Teague Citizen William Pitts Citizen Francis Roberts Citizen Melissa Stewart Citizen James Stewart Citizen Billy R. Paxton Citizen Kurtis Kerr Citizen Rich Williams Citizen **Tom Tomlinsons** Citizen James Carrico Citizen Melissa Vandenberg Citizen Larry Lannum Citizen Adrian Columbia Citizen George Herring Citizen David Crawford Citizen Jeanne Doom Citizen Paul Dendy Citizen Jennifer Clark Citizen John Wilkins Citizen Barb Wiedeman Citizen Brenda Bartella Peterson Citizen

James [no last name provided] Citizen **Sharon Thomerson** Citizen Austin Reed Citizen Rochelle Zegart Citizen Joseph Black Citizen Stacy Stark Citizen Melissa Moorer Citizen Michael [no last name provided] Citizen Paul H Jones Citizen Mary Kay Fleming Citizen Ann Kersker Citizen William Rosenbaum Citizen Theresa Shoup Citizen Nancy Givens Citizen Laurel Armar Citizen Lora Cox Citizen Bettina Morrish Citizen Louise Malone Citizen Matt Dearmond Citizen Patricia Schiller Citizen Martin Schiller Citizen Judy Hanekamp Citizen Joan Lindop Citizen David Lynn Citizen Paul D. Simmons Citizen Kay F. Armstrong Citizen Citizen **Robert Bevins** Jill R Doty Citizen Carol Trainer Citizen Gary Verst Citizen **Kevin Stinson** Citizen P. Sullivan Citizen Glenna Harris Citizen Citizen Jerry Sumney Matt Lowerys Citizen Chaz Bush Citizen Gary L. Criswell Citizen Marlisa Deaton Citizen Dr. Daniel Kirchner Citizen Clarence and Mary Barton Citizens Elmer Maggard Citizen Kim Watkins Citizen

Debra Harlan Citizen Jane Charmoli Citizen Richard Allison Citizen Henrietta Kemp Citizen **Kay Enlow** Citizen Rob Markham Citizen Pauline Keene Looney Citizen George Sales Citizen **Harold Trainer** Citizen Allan Upchurch Citizen James Grubola Citizen Margaret Romeril Citizen Geoff Ruscoe Citizen Ruth Burger Citizen Tanya Ebersohl Citizen Rona Hopper-Quiggins Citizen Crystal Collins-Camargo Citizen Margaret A. Chowning Citizen Dana Wallingford Citizen Thomas Houchin Citizen William E. Parker Citizen Linda Griffin Citizen **Becky West** Citizen Citizen Dan Gosser **David Weatherly** Citizen Debra Simpson Citizen Sara Settimi Citizen Helen [no last name provided] Citizen John Perkins Citizen Jane Roth Citizen Stephanie Kingston Citizen Karen Kidwell Citizen Colleen Ambrose Citizen James Hunte Citizen Carol Ann Robrahn Citizen Barbara Baker Citizen Mollie Bowers Citizen Shane O'Bryan Citizen Sharon Bohannon Citizen Ian Schill Citizen Susan Tomlin Citizen Philip Prenzel Citizen

Cynthia F Denney Citizen **Evalynne Elias** Citizen Ben Murphy Citizen Michael Wilhelmus Citizen James P. Casteel Citizen Valerie Bock Citizen Marge Fitzgerald Citizen Anthony Elam Citizen Julia Risen Citizen Laura Engelman Citizen John Howie Citizen **Daniel Collins** Citizen Megan Russell Citizen Lawrence Gettleman Citizen Tom Kelly Citizen Thornton Bryan Citizen Amanda Mefford Citizen Janet Holland Citizen Crystal L. Dean Citizen Soreyda Benedit-Begley Citizen Thomas Ray Citizen Joseph R Berger, MD Citizen Tad Mutersbaugh Citizen Citizen Rachel Tugon Debbie Bogenschutz Citizen Peggy Reeves Citizen Rob Yoder Citizen Elmer Craig Citizen **Bobbie Martin** Citizen Carmella Esarey Citizen Jean Tate Citizen Marcellia Lother Citizen Joan Cochran Citizen Citizen Angel Martinez Bill Newsome Citizen Carol Scott Citizen Joshua Bowman Citizen Catherine Bell Citizen Andrew Spencer Citizen Richard S. Levine Citizen **Smetana Family** Citizen Laura Dennis Citizen

Kay Alexander Citizen Renbin Yan Citizen Marcella Floyd Citizen Nancy Thompson Citizen Rachelle Henson Citizen Charlotte Lakers Citizen Suzanne Beams Citizen Mary Lou Young Citizen Robert Young Citizen Mark Morrow Citizen Blake Sugarman Citizen Beverly Johnson-miller Citizen Gloria Kemper-O'Neil Citizen Judith Lyons Citizen M. A. Carletta Citizen Jackie Lenahan Citizen **Betsy Bennett** Citizen Marc Leibson Citizen **Bob Smart** Citizen Cheryl Johnson Citizen Geoffrey Brooks Citizen Desiree Collins Citizen **Polly Coombs** Citizen Vonnell Tingle Citizen Estella (Genie) Mixson Citizen Ann W. Kummer Citizen Annette Mtangi Citizen Mark Feather Citizen James Rentschler Citizen George Karem Citizen Cindy Zeller Citizen Elaine Digges Citizen Mary Osborne Citizen Linda Nesbitt Citizen Ron Morrison Citizen Ann Bowe Citizen Teresa Dreckman Citizen Frank Domurath Citizen Janet Bass Smith Citizen Donna Key Citizen Carol Barbee Citizen Joan Kleine Citizen

Jen B. Adams Citizen Marilyn Tudor Citizen Robert Campbell Citizen Jon Paul Love Johnson Citizen Richard E. (Dick) Shore Citizen Robert Osborne Citizen **Kevin Stokes** Citizen Diana Citizen Paul Evans Citizen Billie Stockton Citizen John Hayes Citizen Daryl Owens Citizen Jessica Case Citizen Mike Gatton Citizen K. Mac Citizen Keith Roe Citizen Connie Farmer Citizen David Wrede Citizen Sarah Lynn Cunningham, PE Citizen Bev Furnish Citizen Diane Stokes Citizen Rick Clewett Citizen Misty Litton Citizen Citizen Sharon Vaughn J. Michael McCoy Citizen David Regneri Citizen Citizen Kathleen Regneri Pam Berger Citizen Sharon Deatz Citizen Paul Amick Citizen Justeen Beeles Citizen Mona L. Dean Citizen Joe Skelton Citizen Citizen Nancy B. Adams Citizen Mary Geralds Rebecca Blankenship Citizen Jeanne Nakazawa Citizen Tim Brown Citizen Steve Kavka Citizen Clyde David Burberry Citizen Teresa R. Miller Citizen James Owen Citizen

Emily Pruett Citizen Ann Fothergill Citizen Jerry Yeager Citizen Gary Smith Citizen Randall Conforti Citizen Lynn Wright Citizen Margaret Box Citizen **Constance Story** Citizen Amy Pemberton Citizen Charlene W. Mills Citizen Thomas Boland Citizen Jordan Engel Citizen Dan Delaney Citizen Donna Fort Citizen David Vislisel Citizen Susan Vislise Citizen Rex Evans Citizen K. John Morrow, Jr. Citizen **Aaron Tornes** Citizen Rick Walts Citizen Nancy Weber Citizen Terry Sundy Citizen John Turack Citizen Rosellyn Hamblen Citizen A. Mobley Citizen Susan McGee Citizen Eric Lambert Citizen Joe Ratterman Citizen Laura Starck Citizen Robert Campbell Citizen Irwin Nahinsky Citizen Cara Cooper Citizen Teresa Gray Citizen Sheila Fields Citizen Lewis Meyer Citizen **Raymond Peters** Citizen Gayle Sprague Citizen Susan Dunaway Citizen Mary Touray Citizen Karen Habenstein Citizen Marilyn Schleyer Citizen Jack McKinney Citizen

Deanne Cooper Citizen Lisa Warmbrodt Citizen Christian Henkel Citizen Janice Austin Citizen Mark Bertram Citizen Frances Wortham Citizen cindy foshee Citizen David Wilson Citizen Leslie Bebensee Citizen Donna Hoffman Citizen Judith Inge Citizen Adam Parez Citizen Noelle Tennis Gulden Citizen Joni Burtner Citizen Citizen Melody Hollis Dorothy B. Cassada Citizen Ellen Leichtman Citizen **EK Prewitt** Citizen Jude Ferring Citizen Ben Culbertson Citizen Xenia Culbertson Citizen Jack D McKinney Citizen Billie Davenport Citizen Citizen Ron Napier Russ Kroncke Citizen Charles H. Wilson Citizen Keith Fannin Citizen Dr. Richard Fouse Citizen Mary K. Leffel Citizen Sandra Jull Citizen **Greg Singlust** Citizen Camille Skubik-Peplaski Citizen Acton Ostling, Jr. Citizen Janet Markland Citizen William Baldwin Citizen **Doris Taylor** Citizen Jerry M. Lowe Citizen Josephs [no last name provided] Citizen Mike Kasbaum Citizen Julie Cox Citizen Mary Chan Citizen Judith R Greene Citizen

Becky Griffin Citizen
Sarah R. Morrison Citizen
Frederic Harned Citizen
Virgil [no last name provided] Citizen

Karl Lietzenmayer Former Science Teacher

Linda Williams Citizen Robert Shepard Citizen Krystal Moore Citizen Sherry [no last name provided] Citizen **Donna Counts** Citizen **Bob Stewart** Citizen Jeff Dycus Citizen Ray Crider Citizen Sandra Broadus Citizen Citizen Lana Chaney Melissa Spears Citizen Karen Hudson Citizen Thomas Filbin Citizen Richard M. Duncan Citizen Mary Ann Burch Citizen Puspito Walson Citizen Jerome Strange Citizen Phyllis Jones Citizen Gina Marquardt Citizen Bill Franck Citizen Ed Councill Citizen Citizen William John Moody Citizen **Katy Carlson Bruce Horner** Citizen

Ilona Sego Teacher, Parent of Meteorologist

Gayle Sprague Citizen David Dockstader Citizen Sheila Denison Citizen Catherine Quillen Citizen Geremy Wallen Citizen Kate Wood Citizen Frances Mican Citizen Alan Fryar Citizen M. Judith Broadus Citizen Claire Drucker Citizen Rachel Cronin Citizen

Charles Sego

Citizen

Karen [no last name provided]	Citizen
Lowell Fletcher	Citizen
Dennis C. Blain	Citizen
George Schuhmann	Citizen
David Fry	Citizen
Rebecca [no last name provided]	Citizen
Deb Amchin	Citizen
John Freer	Citizen
Susan Burberry	Citizen
Judith Sharp	Citizen
Rev. Albert M. Pennybacker	Citizen
Elizabeth Kleppinger	Citizen
Sarah Tobergta	Citizen
Claudia Runge	Citizen
Joshua W	Citizen
Pat Goodman	Citizen
Krista Kimmels	Citizen
Mindy Murphy Eve Lee	Citizen
	Citizen
Edelgardetker [no other name provided] Cherie Todd	Citizen
	Citizen
Barbara Ankeny	Citizen
Allison Soult	Citizen
Brenda Black	Citizen
Katherine Schaefer	Citizen
Alan Wallace	Citizen
Kimb Penley	Citizen
Patricia R Palms	Citizen
Craig MacInnes	Citizen
Patty Stocker	Citizen
Roni Gilpin	Citizen
Tyler Offerman	Citizen
Ann Ellerkamp	Citizen
Bob Fieberg	Citizen
Mary Joyce Moeller	Citizen
Cordie Steadmon	Citizen
Barbara Steadmon	Citizen
Michelle Harr	Citizen
Kathryn Heggs	Citizen
Andy Washington	Citizen
Sharon K. Williams	Citizen
Sam Norgren	Citizen

Martha Bartlett Citizen Philip Curd Citizen Tanya Stewart Citizen Bonnie Donoho Citizen Sunnye Sherman Citizen Debra Abukwaik Citizen **David Roberts** Citizen Melissa McCreary Citizen Vernon R. Wiehe, Ph.D. Citizen **Judy Roberts** Citizen Patricia Nazzaro Citizen **Duane Beachey** Citizen Gloria Beachey Citizen Sarah S. Broomfield Citizen Citizen Nancy Henly Vicki Doukas Citizen Citizen Kay Gill Mary Lou Ryant Citizen Donna J Redwine Citizen Margaret Coe Citizen Jim Patrick Citizen FranK Schwartz Citizen Dennis Thompson Citizen Charles Burdsal Citizen P.J. Cook Citizen Retta Folsom Citizen Jeanie Wolfson Citizen **Robert Rogers** Citizen Sean Flaherty Citizen

Warren Van Wyck Science Teacher

Stephen Dutschke Citizen Mark Butler Citizen Marilou Couch Citizen Dianne Shuntich Citizen Katherine Miller Citizen Michael Fogler Citizen Kyrie Fowkes Citizen Kimberly Humble Citizen Wanda Fulks Citizen Phillip Sammons Citizen Shirley Wilson Citizen J.T. Netherland Citizen

Judy Pollard Citizen Thomas North Citizen Ed Stodola Citizen Julie Rothwall Citizen David Clark Citizen Sr. Margaret Hofstetter Citizen Michael Mansfield Citizen Maria Bongo Citizen Mark Gamble Citizen Ben Cleinmark Citizen Dan Roller Citizen David Ambs Citizen Brenda Kemp Citizen Ronald K Shull Citizen Jana Jacobson Citizen Gail Minotti Citizen Deborah Knittel Citizen E. Joy Arnold Citizen Tamera Collins Citizen Joan Shanahan Citizen Laura Manges Citizen Cathi Lyninger Citizen Jim Grissom Citizen Nancy Zanzucchi Citizen Brent Rummage Citizen Larry Frederiksen Citizen Citizen Cheryl Cooper Kathleen Filkins Citizen Jacqueline Vance Citizen Megan Rosenblatt Teacher John Walker Citizen Dale Warren Citizen Sian Versweyveld Citizen Jonathan Sarfin Citizen Zoe Drake Citizen Melissa Lucas Citizen Cecile Schubert Citizen Rebecca Sivert Citizen Laura Knight Citizen Mr. Leroy Joseph, Jr. Citizen Mrs. Leroy Joseph, Jr. Citizen Mary Young Citizen

Marlene Rust Citizen **Robert Gwaltney** Citizen Sean Parkin Citizen Sue Speed Citizen Margaret Houck Citizen Lee Kampf Citizen Amanda Velez Citizen Marie Tychonievich Citizen Mike Gatton Citizen **Curtis Rowe** Citizen Joanne Cybulski Citizen John Birkimer Citizen Katy Schneider Citizen Shelly Van Lanen Citizen William Andrews Citizen Cherie Mutersbaugh Citizen Linda Porter Citizen Michael Kelly Citizen Ronald Thompson Citizen Citizen Cheri Casey Jonathon Hubbert Citizen Susan Gilliami Citizen Fred Gilliami Citizen Melanie Johnson Citizen Kathy Musser Citizen **Patsy Carruthers** Citizen Thomas F. Moffett Citizen Alvin Goldman Citizen Kathy Pyles Citizen Neil Petersen Citizen Kiersten [no last name provided] Citizen Jodie Leidecker Citizen Frances Hall Citizen Vickie McQueary Citizen Daniel K. Boyd Citizen Citizen Henry Walters Lance Brunner Citizen Diane Spurlock Citizen Citizen Ellouise Shepherd Farah [no last name provided] Citizen Evelyn B Laux Citizen Anita Whelan Citizen

Janet Yers Citizen Trent Taylor Citizen Wanda E. DeSpain Citizen Robert Bagley Citizen Allison Crawford Citizen Ralph Brown Citizen Anne Deidesheimer Citizen Elizabeth Crowe Citizen Tom Shearin Citizen Kathleen Schings Citizen Michael Hall Citizen Terry Anne Wiebe Citizen Charles M. Houk MD Citizen Abby Yelton Citizen Katherine Hammons Citizen Barbara sutherland Citizen Rachelle Bombe Citizen Susan Brown Citizen John Hendon Citizen Dawn Heinecken Citizen Rebecca Begley Citizen Jeanie Embry Citizen Larry Hovekamp Citizen Citizen Carly Cavitt Mayla McKeehan Citizen John Schmitt Citizen Citizen Jimmy Phelps Barbara Wade Citizen Kim Gersony Citizen Kenna Smith Citizen Kristina [no last name provided] Citizen Charles Cusumano, PA-C, DFAAPA Citizen **Jeff Sames** Citizen William D. Rumsey Citizen Ronald Atwood Citizen Roshan Nikou Citizen Larry Robertson Citizen Barbara Robertson Citizen Sandra Kryst Citizen Michael Bell Citizen Lori Dabney Citizen June Sandercock Citizen

Jama Watts Citizen Denise Jones Citizen Connie S. Courts Citizen Richard Humke Citizen Leslie Lehman Citizen Marina Sams Citizen Vicki Hines-Martin Citizen Marie Wathen Citizen Cynthia Hamilton Citizen Susan Smith-Sargent Citizen Barb Campbell Citizen Sandra Munn Citizen Debbie Maden Citizen Eric Mount Citizen Citizen Sally Davis Citizen Leanne Clark Flint Foster Citizen Jeanne Groene Citizen Marie Miller Citizen Elizabeth Nelson Citizen Jonathan Corey Blanton Citizen Steve Wagner Citizen Maggie Murphy Citizen Judith Cumbler Citizen Sydney Smith Citizen Barbara Robbins Citizen Shaden [no last name provided] Citizen David Dunn Citizen Citizen Carl Wallace Kathy Pratt Citizen Alan Rosedale Citizen Ann Hardman Citizen Marjorie Kiefer Citizen Curt Tweddell Citizen Kathy Pepper Baczek Citizen Laurel Miller Citizen Dr. Michael T. May Citizen Kristin Cook Citizen Anne Bucalos Citizen Robert Craycraft Citizen Cathryn Wasson Citizen Ronald H. Skees Citizen

Amberlee Douglas Citizen Jen Bolger Citizen Bettie Griffin Citizen Maggie Noffke Citizen Richard Koster Citizen Gregory Waldrop Pastor Carolyn Dennis Citizen Randal Lanham Citizen Nelda Moore Citizen Nathan Shuler Citizen **David Henry** Citizen Ron Russell Citizen Dean Bucalos Citizen S. Lee Ware Citizen Judy P Berger Citizen Kate Cunningham Citizen L.J. Cassity Citizen Timothy Holland Citizen Nicholas Alan Johnson Citizen Elizabeth Thomas Citizen Carrie [no last name provided] Citizen Jami Pelini Citizen Bethany Brickley Citizen **Charlotte Stites** Citizen Trudi Kubik Citizen Jeff Brickley Citizen Richard Burden Citizen Ann Ford Citizen Dorothy [no last name provided] Citizen Melissa Eden Citizen Colin Keefe Citizen Melissa Rhodus Citizen Ben Goldenberg Citizen Mark Meade Citizen Loren Drzal Citizen Donna Boyce Citizen Anna [no last name provided] Citizen Eliot Walter Citizen Terry Julian Citizen Linda Haydon Citizen Joseph Michael Satterlee Citizen Greg Moore Citizen

Herbert Phillips Citizen Sally Di Giovanni Citizen Linda Corbin Citizen Isabella Christensen Citizen Lisa Shroyer Citizen C. J. Robinson Citizen Donna McGee Citizen John Hammond Citizen Linda [no last name provided] Citizen Myrtle Bingham Citizen Don Robinson Citizen Anne Weaver Citizen Pat Lenzo Citizen **Robin Helfers** Citizen Stephen Webb Citizen Sandra C. Bailey Citizen Dorothy Poppe Citizen Ivan Mayes Citizen Wallace McMullen Citizen Carol [no last name provided] Citizen Lynn Matlock Citizen Michael Hannan Citizen Karen McCoy Citizen Anne Marie de Zeeuw Citizen Jenni Ward Citizen Gerald Glover Citizen Karma Duff Citizen Malcolm Watts Citizen Lucy Yelton Citizen Lori Hitchcock Citizen Leslie [no last name provided] Citizen Stephen Board Citizen Wilma Bennett Citizen Citizen **Betsy Coffey** Scott Metcalf Citizen Juan Rodriguez Citizen Joe Wilson Citizen John E. Fischer Citizen Lee Amundsen Citizen Nancy Underwood Citizen Preston Elrod Citizen Betsy Osoffsky Citizen

Rick Meadows

Mark Shale

Citizen

Judith T. Owen

Citizen

Billy Ping

Citizen

Anna Gayle Parke

Jo Staggs-Neel

Citizen

Citizen

Ryan R. Riddle Science Teacher

F. James Holler Citizen Patricia Supplee Citizen Suzanne Tallichet Citizen Karen Schwartz Citizen James M. Samuel Citizen Henry Southgate Citizen Don Glass Citizen Robert W. Abrams Citizen Teena Blackburn Citizen Terry Hancock Citizen Arnold Weiner Citizen Carol Bischoff Citizen Beth Redwine Citizen Melissa M. Howard Citizen Mike Ackerman Citizen Andrew Walker Citizen Stephanie Parkin Citizen Philip Blades Citizen Jeffrey Hampton Citizen Richard Knittel Citizen Mary Wilson Citizen Citizen Debbie [no last name provided] Bill Deatherage Citizen Annie Adams Citizen John Wiggins Citizen William Snedegar Citizen William T. Thoeny Citizen Ann Hicks Citizen Charles Davis Citizen Lisa Kriner Citizen Ronald DeChristoforo Citizen Judy Egan Citizen Jamie Jacobs Citizen Tammy Russell Citizen Katherine Ogles Citizen

Judy Spears Citizen Mary Knight Citizen George Bebensee Citizen Deborah Madison Citizen Julie Thompson Citizen John Vessels Citizen Sara Porter Citizen

Dave Porter College Professor

Candice Miller Citizen D. Leslie Hill Citizen Pam Martin Citizen Pamela Brashear Citizen C. L Beahan, PhD. Citizen Dieter C. Ullrich Citizen Citizen Tom Boyd, Ph.D B. J. Bentley Citizen Joseph Donohew Citizen Joseph Brill Citizen Shawn Hadley Citizen Mary McDaniel Citizen Jill Dew Citizen Sara Green Citizen Linda Jennings Citizen Citizen J. Eddy Pat Cooper Citizen Terry Anderson Citizen Charles Noyes Citizen Leanna Slusher Citizen Katey Ward Citizen Kathleen Drury Citizen Lavece Hughes Citizen Tanya Mount Citizen Karen Riggins Citizen Judy Munro-Leighton Citizen Rick Ader Citizen Eileen [no last name provided] Citizen Josh Piper Citizen Violet Harmon Citizen Ivy Brashear Citizen Melissa Shown Citizen Neil O'Brien Citizen Philip Wakeman Citizen

Tobias Harris W. Citizen Jennifer Dugert Citizen **Buffy Sexton** Citizen Deanna Katko Citizen Larry Devine Citizen James Wheeler Citizen Ronald E Dean Citizen Laurie J. Oldham Citizen Carla Gilbert Citizen Achille Biagi Citizen Eileen Biagi Citizen Nancy Bayens Citizen Craig Clere Citizen Diana Hallman Citizen Arkadiy Medvedovskiy Citizen Diane Kahlo Citizen Peter Pearlman Citizen Ruth Bamberger Citizen James [no last name provided] Citizen Scott [no last name provided] Citizen Bruce Spencer Citizen Catherine Aponte Citizen Katherine Kruska Citizen Lenae Price Citizen Jennifer Keats Citizen Mike Fryman Citizen Citizen **Kay Grubols** Patricia Layton Citizen L. Beth Stone Citizen Donna Strauss Citizen Mark Taylor Citizen Mary Ellen Buning Citizen **Ruby Layson** Citizen Pamela Gray Parent Maureen Spencer Citizen Thomas S. Meacham Citizen **Ernie Lewis** Citizen Beth Gaunce Citizen Rachel A Mendoza-Newton Citizen Susan Fangman Citizen **Donald Walters** Citizen Fairleigh Roman Citizen

David Nickell Citizen
Lisa Schmoetzer Citizen
Kelley Greene Citizen
Stephen Breeden Citizen

Elisa Owen Ordained Pastor

G. Reynolds Citizen Chuck Miller Citizen Catherine Johnson Citizen Bill Bowman Citizen Jenny Poole Citizen Barbara Hopewell Citizen Shifa Podikunju Citizen Michael Mills Citizen Charles Waller Citizen Marion Dobbs Citizen Janet Snow Citizen Lauren Niemann Citizen Jennifer Kearns Citizen Rosalie Felfle Citizen Holly Adams Citizen Stephanie Van Stee Citizen Mark Miceli Citizen Charlie Lanter Citizen Linda Hill Citizen Stephanie Hughes Citizen Shirlee Yassney Citizen Heather Shearn Citizen Michelle Weisgrau Citizen Blake Price Citizen John Stone Citizen Robert Daniel Citizen Tricia Houston Citizen Karen Knowles Citizen Lauren Rosenman Citizen George Herring Citizen Connie [no last name provided] Citizen **Thomas Crothers** Citizen David Musser Citizen Angie Carlson Citizen Ellen Roberts Citizen Bettye H Grissom Citizen Felicia Messer Citizen

Gayle Bourne Citizen Melanie Martin Citizen Roberta Guthrie Citizen Clay Gaunce Citizen Anne Mitchels Citizen Aaron H. Shuford Citizen Reanah Tongate Citizen James Preslar Citizen Betsy Ruhe Teacher Jacqueline Newman Citizen James Smith Citizen Beth Handelman Citizen Juliet Neary Citizen **Brad Zimmerman** Citizen Citizen William Eddy Citizen M. Hettinger Ed Crockett Citizen Lisa Ruble Citizen Rollin Tarter Citizen Melinda Newman Citizen Sonya Combs Citizen Gene R. Graves Citizen Gretchen LaGodna Citizen Paulette Fiehrer Citizen **Donna Schiess** Citizen James Crowden Citizen Melanie Smith Citizen **Timothy Calvert** Citizen **Nancy Carrington** Citizen David G. Hunter Citizen James Vrancic Citizen Russell Byrd Citizen Robert Stone Citizen Pamela ward Citizen Tisha Belme Citizen George Smith Citizen Asri Mumpuni Citizen George Zack Citizen Tim LeMaster Citizen Francis Hennessee Citizen Susan L. Smith Citizen Kelli Reno Citizen

Lisa Mo Citizen David Adler Citizen Teresa Brolley Citizen Dr. Terry L. Singer Citizen **Dwight Baugt** Citizen Darrell Riffe Citizen Matthew Stone Citizen Elaine Camerota Citizen Will Kinnaird Citizen Greg Elliott Citizen Patrick Kirby Citizen Tricia F Lister Citizen Marian [no last name provided] Citizen Linda Parker Citizen Cathi Kise Blair Citizen Roy Sachleben Citizen Ian Schill Citizen David [no last name provided] Citizen Joyce Basil Citizen Yvette Evans Citizen Christina Randall Citizen David Edberg Citizen Jeremy Jarratt Citizen Lee Gantz Citizen John Justice Citizen W. Napier Citizen Citizen **Toby Troffkin** Susan Vogt Citizen **Edmund August** Citizen Marguerite West Citizen Stan Holsclaw Citizen Lora Malloy Citizen Jacob Barrett Citizen Citizen Phyllis Hawkins **Larry Fleming** Citizen Cynthia Wainscott Citizen Barbara Hausman-Smith Citizen **Carol Dines** Citizen Teresa Warren Citizen Patricia Sisk Citizen **Ethan Hattendorf** Citizen T.A. Wineland Citizen

Midge Tuley Citizen Anisa Willis Citizen Shelly Whitehead Citizen Robert Mayton Citizen **Howard Stovall** Citizen Marcia Sparks Citizen **Beverly Watkins** Citizen David Reber, Ph.D. Citizen Debra Patterson Citizen Adrielle Camuel Citizen Nathan Jacobs Citizen Daniel del Vecchio Citizen **David Sickbert** Citizen Stewart Kelley Citizen **Bert Thomas** Citizen Roberta Erena Citizen Gary McIntyre Citizen Kristen Hayden Citizen **Ray Perkins** Citizen Citizen Liz Dugan Harue Marquardt Citizen John Christopher Citizen **Daniel Storch** Citizen Jamie Mullans Citizen Anna Cropper Citizen Hal Harned Citizen Jennifer Passoni Citizen Nancy Pererson Citizen Rene Hales Citizen Monica Marcum Citizen C.A. Graham Citizen Laurene Clark Citizen Gary Baker Citizen Maria Ward Citizen Tony Menechella Citizen Robert Mitchell Citizen Ken Nelson Citizen **April Robbins** Citizen Christina Malone Citizen Angel Suarez Valera Citizen Maggie Ashmore Citizen Irma Bennett Citizen

Debra Gash Former	Teacher
-------------------	---------

Dustin Kavich Citizen Beth Ratliff Citizen Gary Leaf Citizen **Paul Thoms** Citizen Bruce England Citizen Michael J Denis Citizen Bruce Wilkinson Citizen David M. Wimsatt Citizen Allie Secor Citizen Luke Barlowe Citizen **Robin Maley** Citizen Dr. Daniel Gatlin Citizen Myrisa Christy Citizen Carrie Holstrom Citizen Robert Urekew Citizen Eileen Arnold Citizen Dr. David Bliss Citizen Andre Faul Citizen Kathleen Gregg Citizen Barbara Clewett Citizen David Aaron Hiles Citizen Deborah Denenfeld Citizen William Farley Citizen Ed Redmon Citizen Darlene Mazzone Citizen Citizen Vicky Parler Jesse L. Ashcraft Citizen Rachel Klein Citizen Susan Davis Citizen Lynette Rollyson Citizen Jeffrey [no last name provided] Citizen Kevin Bolser Citizen Richard Grossbohlin Citizen Pamela Slowkowski Citizen Dannette Cook Citizen David Gale Citizen Dan Davis Citizen Gary Parish Citizen Luann Davis, RN Citizen Eric Russell Lynch Citizen Simone Salomon Citizen

Donna Back Citizen Shelly Skees Citizen Joe Ann Auslander Citizen Gary Bowen Citizen Andrew B. Bryan Citizen Molly McMasters Citizen Darlene H Libbey Citizen Harry McNally Citizen Anne Mckune Citizen Gay Holcomb, Ph.D. Citizen Billie Lynn Denzik Citizen Anna Imber Citizen **Casey Jones** Citizen Lloyd Doering Citizen Walter Grover Citizen Michael Alt Citizen Christopher White Citizen Ron Spann Citizen Richard Mondy Citizen Citizen Matt Reno Brenda Jones Citizen Fran Taylor Citizen Rod Huber Citizen Nancy Givens Citizen Thomas Avery Citizen Ruth [no last name provided] Citizen Citizen Mary O'Neill Adam Taylor Citizen Randall Robinson Citizen Barbara Arch Citizen Citizen Scott Meyer Leslie McColgin Citizen Nancy K Noble Citizen Elizabeth Drake Citizen Sean Stanley Citizen Joshua Castlen Citizen Ted Withrow Citizen Dr. Ouida Meier Citizen Susan Heustis Citizen Lydia Bond Citizen Paul Brinegar Citizen Stella Godbey Citizen

Greg Chinn Citizen Abigail Byrnes Citizen Debbie August Citizen Jennifer Cox Citizen Sister Rosemary Keough Citizen Paula Schoenhoff Citizen Susan Crook Citizen Carmen Ramirez Walker Citizen **Patty Coomes** Citizen Sarah Murphy Citizen Catherine Jenkins Citizen Roger [no last name provided] Citizen Keith Smith Citizen Dirk May-Fitzgerald Citizen Clyde Sams Citizen Matthew Carr Citizen Heath Eric Citizen Sandra Rippetoe Citizen Charles R. III Honce Citizen Mike Greenwell Citizen LaVerne Waldrop Citizen Erica Bricking Citizen Dave Luckens Citizen Citizen Kathleen Myers

Carolyn Campbell Former Teacher

Lon Coleman Citizen Zana Lummus Citizen William Beasley Citizen Hagen Kirk Citizen Karen Conley Citizen Carie Ernst Citizen Wesa-Asgaya K Sweeney Citizen John Hampton Jr. Citizen **Curtis Morrison** Citizen Citizen Mary Love Mikell Grafton Citizen Garry Shane Baldridge Citizen Kayla Rodgers Citizen Tim Fleischer Citizen Berry Craig IV Citizen Melinda Craig Citizen

Berry Craig III Professor Emeritus of History, Western Kentucky

Community Technical College

Troy Richard Citizen Renee Boss Citizen Lori McDonald Citizen Alex Moore Citizen Justin Schulte Citizen Daniel Mason Citizen Dawn Hale Citizen Annette Bricca Citizen Bert Bruce Citizen Peggy Smith-Puckett Citizen Angie Reed Garner Citizen Frances Englander Citizen Dr. Dave Robinson Citizen Leigh Furches Citizen Chy'anne Krugler Citizen James Frank Citizen Peter Mcchesney Citizen Leslie Leidelmeijer Citizen Robert A. Daniel Citizen Merry Jones Citizen Richard Ralston Citizen **David Sumrell** Citizen Malinda [no last name provided] Citizen Richard Cales, MD Citizen Terry Olson Citizen **Bill Thomas** Citizen Grandmother Linda Heath Mary Swinford Citizen Kelley Paterno Citizen M. Ratledge Citizen Jim Reeves Citizen Edith Belcher Citizen Margaret Snyder Citizen Ruth Roberson Citizen Jeff Keyes Citizen David Harden Citizen

Denise [no last name provided]

Aaron Martin

Chris Joy

Kathy Loebbrown

Michael J. Seidler

Citizen

Citizen

Citizen

Citizen

Citizen

Amanda [no last name provided] Citizen Arnold Johnston Citizen Gayle Pille Citizen Kevin Lloyd Citizen JoEllen [no last name provided] Citizen Ginny Smith Teacher Marcia Hopkins Citizen A. Weingardt Citizen Michael Bryant Citizen Robin K Moody Citizen Stephen Kappeler Citizen Carol Goodin Citizen Diana [no last name provided] Citizen R. Brown Citizen Citizen Melody Nutt Theresa Scherf Citizen Andrea Knarr Citizen Marlana White Citizen Jane Brantley Citizen JP Brantley Citzen Joshua San Miguel Citizen JoAnne Sykes Citizen Dr. Richard A. Weber Citizen Steve Flora Citizen Larry Kruse Citizen Marci Coots Citizen Citizen **Bridgit Boggs** Soma Bose Citizen Stephanie Frank Citizen Markeeta Buntin Citizen Kyle Fannin Citizen Joseph Bugess Citizen Jieun K. Han Citizen Don E. Crisp Citizen Mike Chmilewski Citizen Mary Landrum Citizen Andy Frueh Citizen Barbara Hollar Citizen Sam Johnson II Citizen Sandra Ochs Griggs Citizen Barry Richardson Citizen Sabrina McIlwrath Citizen

Rev. Belinda M Curry Citizen Erik [no last name provided] Citizen Jean Christensen Citizen Gary McCoy Citizen Eric Bredemeyer Citizen Natalie Hoffman Citizen Wade McCallum Citizen Jennifer Goetz Citizen Jamie Godby Citizen

L. J. Alquizola Parent of Student

Martin Z. Kasdan Jr Citizen Trent Rogers PhD Citizen Tami Brucato Citizen John Ivie Citizen Citizen David [no last name provided] Citizen Kristin Hix Frank Doring Citizen Thomas J. Reece Citizen Derek Obrochta Citizen Angela [no last name provided] Citizen Julie Bucknam Citizen Ellen Glatman Citizen Dr. Karen N Janssen Citizen Jon Hardy Citizen Keith Rouda Citizen **Derrick Singletary** CPA Sarah Reddick Citizen Ann Kidder Citizen Brian Jackson Citizen Kathy Stauss Citizen Citizen Lydia Fuller Citizen Naomi Hodges Glenda Grace Citizen Citizen Virgil Ridings Joel Woltz Citizen Donna Hazelwood Citizen Samantha Tucker Citizen Vickie Hatton Citizen Citizen Jeff Whittinghill Joan Tighe Citizen **Edward Prigge** Citizen Ronnie Trogden Citizen

Candace Granstaff Citizen Allan Smith Citizen Jim Nation Citizen Sarah Grayson Citizen Citizen R. Wesley Pace Citizen Joe Armstrong Brigette Reed Citizen Citizen Amanda Bifone William Bishop Citizen Randall Lamb Citizen John Rice Citizen **Brian Slone** Citizen Mike Alexander Citizen Genevieve Apodaca Citizen Citizen Claudia Hargrove Jacuelin Burchett Citizen Colleen Crigler Citizen **Teddy Williams** Citizen Citizen Teresa Smith Citizen Spencer Skaats Angela Armato Citizen Craig Newman Citizen Jerome Lawson Citizen Citizen Stephanie Ramey David Foushee Citizen Citizen Patrick McCamish Citizen Danny Fletcher Dennis Stafford Citizen James Roark Citizen Citizen Judy Roark Billie Stafford Citizen Linda Rose Citizen Citizen Helen Bloodworth Naomi Webb Citizen Anna Reeder Citizen Ella Lonas Citizen **Tammy Skaats** Citizen Citizen Cheryl Sadler Citizen Angie Christensen Jay Bond, Sr. Citizen Diane Diggles Citizen Linda Bryant Citizen

Citizen Charlotte Purcell Donald Inks Jr. Citizen Rita Isham Citizen Erin Seaman Citizen Citizen Jay Dargan Jim McHale Citizen Tim Boll Citizen **Sherry Gaines** Citizen Brenda Kabler Citizen Steve Flinchum Citizen William Marvel Citizen Citizen Gary Rogers Citizen Randy Riblet Johnny Evans Citizen Dedra Smith Citizen Marvin Oliver Citizen Citizen **Terry Sears** John Sparks Citizen Citizen Eileen Serke Frank Simon Citizen Mary McClendon Citizen Gary Buckley Citizen Beverly Buckley Citizen Roberta Dorsey Citizen Velma Newsom Citizen Citizen Steve Rudy Jaunita Schick Citizen **Tammy Stewart** Citizen Colin Bruner Citizen Linda Horback Citizen Steven Shick Sr. Citizen David Bartsch Citizen Citizen Shirley Mayrand Robert Couvillon Citizen Michelle Truitt Citizen Sharon Almquist Citizen

Elsie Hall Citizen
Glenda Cogan Citizen
Kimberly Wood Citizen
JoAnn Davis Citizen
Steve Lorimer Citizen

Bobby Alexander Citizen Citizen Florance Molnar **Esther Whitley** Citizen Kim Houlihan Citizen Citizen Regina Smith Citizen James Champ Ralph Hawkins Citizen Ken Collins Citizen JoeAnn Collins Citizen Citizen Regina Eckle **Becky Schimdt** Citizen Citizen **Amy Meadors** Sherian Tingle Citizen Citizen Pam Yancy Citizen Stephen Secchio Angela Rankin Citizen Paul Gross Citizen **Rob Jones** Citizen Karl Dolson Citizen Citizen Jennifer Dolson Citizen Nancy Carol Fryer

Joseph P. Straley University of Kentucky

Richard G. Innes Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions

William (Clint) Hardy Citizen

Nick Brooks, President Kentucky Science Teachers Association

Donnie Wilkerson Teacher
Adrienne Gilbert Citizen
Shannon Buzard Parent
Aaron (Chad) Erhardt Minister
David Robinson Citizen

Maureen Erickson Parent/Grandparent

James DonaldsonCitizenMaureen CarmanCitizenDena Stewart GoreParentTim WhalenCitizenWill KnappCitizenMartin CothranCitizen

Elizabeth Schmitz, Executive Director Kentucky Environmental Education Council

Herman Cummings Georgia Resident

Delores Vowels Citizen
Henry Jackson Citizen

Scott Blome Citizen Janie Blome Citizen Citizen Ryan Lawson Citizen Haley Lawson Stephanie Evitts Citizen Misty Pack Citizen Shannon Alexander Citizen RR [no name given] Citizen RP [no name given] Citizen John Brice Citizen Citizen Trivida Embry Marvin Embry Citizen Chad Erhardt Citizen Ronald Tucker Citizen Citizen Cindy Tucker Maureen Erickson Citizen Citizen Phyllis Slaughter Cindy Rausch Citizen Sandra Stotsky Professor Florence Molnar Citizen **Becky Schmidt** Citizen Sondra Cook Citizen

Amanda Underwood

David Helm

Kentucky Science Teachers Association

National Science Teachers Association

John Walker, PhD Teacher Elizabeth Powers Citizen

Dr. Victoria Carr Arlitt Child & Family Research & Education Center

Paul Aud Citizen
Keith L. Hautala Citizen

Roberta Burns Educator and parent

Ashley Hoffman Kentucky Association for Environmental Education

Malicia T. Hitch Protection and Advocacy Staff Attorney

Joan Perkins Citizen

3. The following people from the promulgating administrative body attended this public hearing or responded to the written comments:

Name and Title

Kevin C. Brown, General Counsel/Associate Commissioner, Office of Guiding Support Services Amy Peabody, Assistant General Counsel, Office of Guiding Support Services David Wickersham, Assistant General Counsel, Office of Guiding Support Services Tracy Herman, Legislative Liaison, Office of Guiding Support Services Robin Chandler, Policy Advisor, Office of Next Generation Learners Sean Elkins, Consultant, Division of Program Standards Christine Duke, Consultant, Division of Program Standards Melinda Curless, Consultant, Division of Program Standards Chad Collins, General Counsel, Kentucky High School Athletic Association

Summary of Comments and Responses

- (1) Subject Matter: Support for the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS)
 - (a) Comment: Commenters stated that the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards would be beneficial for Kentucky children.

Commenters stated that Kentucky students deserve the most up-to-date science education, and that an up-to-date science education includes learning about climate change.

Commenters stated that the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards will help prepare Kentucky students for the challenges and opportunities they will face later in the 21st Century.

Commenters stated that the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science reflect the state of modern, mainstream science.

A commenter stated that university science professors expect incoming students to know the climate change standards contained in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science and that students learning under those standards would be well-prepared for careers in fields that require knowledge of science, technology, engineering, and mathematics.

A commenter endorsed the adoption of the standards, stating they are research-based, grounded in inquiry, rich in content, and internationally benchmarked. The commenter expressed confidence in the process by which the standards were developed.

A commenter asked that the standards be implemented as presented, stating that much intellectual capital was expended in their development. The commenter also stated that

the Next Generation Science Standards represent the best pedagogical knowledge for teaching science, and that picking and choosing individual standards would harm their coherence and value.

A commenter strongly encouraged the full adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards.

A commenter stated that the Kentucky section of the American Institute of Professional Geologists unanimously supports implementing the standards as written.

A commenter stated that adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards will be a foundation for improving the quality of science education in Kentucky.

A commenter stated that including evolution and climate change in state standards protects teachers from being bullied into teaching creationism or bad science, and that opposition to science is an attack on liberty.

A commenter praised the progression of topics and the emphasis on evidence promoted by the standards. This commenter asked that the standards be adopted as written, without alterations.

A commenter stated that the standards will be beneficial for students who struggle with disabilities because they will be able to engage with science concepts as they move from abstract paper and pencil concepts into exploration.

A commenter recommended that Kentucky adopt and implement the Next Generation Science Standards as an effective, research-based way to transform science education.

A commenter stated that adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards would ensure that Kentucky students are well prepared to compete with their peers, both nationally and internationally, for educational and career opportunities.

A commenter expressed admiration for the Kentucky Department of Education for taking a leadership role in the development of the standards.

Another commenter expressed a hope that the Next Generation Science Standards will be fully adopted with no omissions or compromise. The commenter stated that the proposed standards will make hands-on learning a greater part of the education process, and moves learning to be more student centered and less rote.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards encourage active learning through the use of modeling, investigation, and the application of the student's knowledge.

Those speaking or providing written comments in support of the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards were: Blaine Ferrell (Kentucky Academy of Science),

Tom Tretter (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Daniel Phelps (Kentucky Paleontological Society), Trent Garrison (American Institute of Professional Geologists, Kentucky Section), Rick Clewett (Climate Parents), Robert Bevins (Kentuckians for Science Education), David Robinson (Citizen), Joseph Straley (University of Kentucky), Donnie Wilkerson (Citizen), Elizabeth Schmitz (Kentucky Environmental Education Council), Scott Blome (Citizen), Janie Blome (Citizen), Henry Jackson (Citizen), Ryan Lawson (Citizen), Haley Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Evitts (Citizen), John Brice (Citizen), Sheila Anderson (Climate Parents) [who submitted comments in the form of a petition signed by three thousand eight hundred ninety-four (3,894) individuals], Nick Brooks (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Amanda Underwood (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), David Helm (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Sherry Fox (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Clara Fulkerson (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Rita Jane Shelton (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Sondra Cook (Citizen), David L. Evans, PhD (National Science Teachers Association), John Walker, PhD (Teacher), Dr. Victoria Carr (Arlitt Child & Family Research & Education Center), Roberta Burns (Educator and parent), Ashley Hoffman (Kentucky Association for Environmental Education), and Keith L. Hautala (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes will be made in response to comments in support of the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. The agency has determined that, in addition to these commenters, other individuals, organizations, and businesses have publically supported the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards. Those individuals, organizations, and businesses include: American Chemical Society, American Meteorological Society, American Physical Society, American Society of Plant Biologists, Association of Presidential Awardees in Science Teaching, Association of Public and Land Grant Universities, National Association of Gifted Children, Bruce Alberts (Stanford University / Past President, National Academy of Sciences), Andy Anderson (Michigan State University), Wolfgang Bauer (Michigan State University), Rodolfo Dirzo (Stanford University), James Paul Holloway (University of Michigan), Jonathan Osborne (Stanford University), Helen Quinn (Stanford University), Carl Wieman (Stanford University / Nobel Laureate), Battelle Memorial Institute, Bayer Cooperation, Carolina Biological Supply Company, Chevron, CISCO Systems, Comcast, Corning, Inc., Dell Inc., Dupont, Eaton, Eli Lilly, IBM, and the Microsoft Corporation.

The agency has determined that the comment recommending that Kentucky adopt and implement the Next Generation Science Standards as an effective, research-based way to transform science education was provided by the President of the National Science Teachers Association on behalf of over 55,000 members consisting of science teachers, science supervisors, administrators, scientists, business and industry representatives, and others involved in and committed to science education.

- (2) Subject Matter: General opposition to the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: Commenters requested that the agency not adopt the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for science and that the agency not adopt any common core standards.

Those speaking or offering written comments opposing the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science and the adoption of common core standards were: Sarah Reddick (Citizen), Ann Kidder (Citizen), Brian Jackson (Citizen), Kathy Strauss (Citizen), Lydia Lynne Coates Fuller, (Citizen), Naomi Hodges (Citizen), Glenda Grace (Citizen), Virgil Ridings (Citizen), Joel Woltz (Citizen), Donna Hazelwood (Citizen), Samantha Tucker (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Angela Rankins (Citizen), Jeff Whittinghill (Citizen), Joan Tighe (Citizen), Edward Prigge (Citizen), Ronnie Trogden (Citizen), Candace Granstaff (Citizen), Allan Smith (Citizen), Jim Nation (Citizen), Sarah Grayson (Citizen), R. Wesley Pace (Citizen), Joe Armstrong (Citizen), Bridgett Reed (Citizen), Amanda Bifone (Citizen), William Bishop (Citizen), Randall Lamb (Citizen), John Rice (Citizen), Stephen Secchio (Citizen), Brian Slone (Citizen), Pam Yancy (Citizen), Sherian Tingle (Citizen), Mike Alexander (Citizen), Genevieve Apodaca (Citizen), Claudia Hargrove (Citizen), Jacqueline Burchett (Citizen), Colleen Crigler (Citizen), Teddy Williams (Citizen), Teresa Smith (Citizen), Spencer Skaats (Citizen), Angela Armato (Citizen), Craig Newman (Citizen), Jerome Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Ramsey (Citizen), David Foushee (Citizen), Patrick McCamish (Citizen), Amy Meadors (Citizen), Danny Fletcher (Citizen), Dennis Stafford (Citizen), James Roark (Citizen), Judy Roark (Citizen), Billie Stafford (Citizen), Linda Rose (Citizen), Helen Bloodsworth (Citizen), Naomi Webb (Citizen), Anna Reeder (Citizen), Ella Lonas (Citizen), Becky Schmidt (Citizen), Tammy Skaats (Citizen), Cheryl Sadler (Citizen), Angie Christensen (Citizen), Jay Bond, Sr. (Citizen), Diana Diggles (Citizen), Linda Bryant (Citizen), Charlotte Purcell (Citizen), Regina Eckle (Citizen), Donald F. Inks, Jr. (Citizen), Rita Isham (Citizen), Erin Seaman (Citizen), Jay Dargan (Citizen), Jim McHale (Citizen), Tim Boll (Citizen), Sherry Gaines (Citizen), Brenda Kabler (Citizen), Steve Flinchum (Citizen), William Marvel (Citizen), Gary Rogers (Citizen), Randy Riblet (Citizen), Johnny E. Evans (Citizen), Debra Smith (Citizen), Marvin Oliver (Citizen), Terry Sears (Citizen), John Sparks (Citizen), Eileen Serke (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Mary McClendon (Citizen), Gary Buckley (Citizen), Beverly Buckey (Citizen), Roberta Dorsey (Citizen), Velma Newsom (Citizen), Steve Rudy (Citizen), Ken Collins (Citizen), JoeAnn Collins (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Elsie R. Hall (Citizen), Esther Whitley (Citizen), Florence Molnar (Citizen), Regina Smith (Citizen), Bobby Alexander (Citizen), Steve Lorimer (Citizen), JoAnn Davis (Citizen), Kimberly Wood (Citizen), Glenda M. Cogan (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Sharon Almquist (Citizen), Rob Jones (Citizen), James Champ (Citizen), Ralph Hawkins (Citizen), Stephan Schick Sr. (Citizen), Linda Horback (Citizen), Colin Bruner (Citizen), David Bartsch (Citizen), Delores Vowels (Citizen), Kim Houlihan (Citizen), Shirley Mayrand (Citizen), Michelle Truitt, (Citizen), Aaron Erhardt (Citizen), Trivida Embry (Citizen), Marvin Embry (Citizen), Ronald Tucker (Citizen), Cindy Tucker

(Citizen), Maureen Erickson (Citizen), Phyllis Slaughter (Citizen), Nancy Carol Fryer (Citizen), Dr. Don Patton (Arkansas resident), and Paul Aud (Citizen).

- (b) Response: No changes have be made in response to comments opposed to the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science or in opposition to the adoption of common core standards. The Next Generation Science Standards are not a part of the Common Core State Standards initiative. The Next Generation Science Standards were developed through a different process than the Common Core State Standards. The Next Generation Science Standards have been under development for two years and meet the statutory mandates of SB 1 (2009). Kentucky joined 25 states to develop the Next Generation Science Standards through a collaborative process. About 40 Kentuckians, including P-12 science teachers, state science and policy staff, administrators, higher education and faculty, scientists, and engineers were involved in the development process. The standards focus on topics and content, required as a pre-requisite by colleges science courses. The agency has determined that the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards is necessary and appropriate, to ensure college and career readiness for Kentucky students.
- (3) Subject Matter: Removal of evolution from the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: Commenters objected to the continued inclusion of evolution in the science standards and stated that the teaching of evolution will lead to a variety of negative social consequences, including the negation of religious belief, the marginalization of students with religious beliefs, the promotion of socialism and resulting genocide and murder, drug abuse, suicide, hopelessness, the limitation of personal freedom, and the belief that might makes right.

A commenter expressed concerns that humans are classified with primates because primates have four hands, not two.

A commenter stated that the science curriculum should not include Darwinism.

A commenter stated that asking educators to teach evolution would violate the educators' right to exercise their moral and religious beliefs.

A commenter stated that outsiders are imposing the elitist and rich man's religion of evolution on the families of public school students, taking away the right to worship God.

Commenters stated that if evolution is in the standards, and taught, they will remove their children from the public schools and homeschool their children.

Those speaking or offering written comments seeking the removal of evolution from the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science were: Annice Milliner (Citizen), Matt Singleton (Citizen), Dena Stewart-Gore (Citizen), Maureen Erickson (Citizen), James Donaldson (Citizen) Valerie O'Rear (Citizen), Kim Houlihan (Citizen), Delores Vowels

(Citizen), Chad Erhardt (Citizen), James Donaldson (Citizen), Joe Armstrong (Citizen), and Kathrene Lewis (Citizen), RR (Citizen), RP (Citizen), and Ralph Hawkins (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments requesting the removal of evolution from the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. Biological evolution is the fundamental, unifying theory that underlies all the life sciences. It has formed the basis of productive research for over a century. Few scientific theories have had as transformative and widespread impact on their respective fields as has evolution. This is why evolution is universally accepted among professional biology researchers. According to the Association of College and University Biology Educators (ACUBE), knowledge of evolutionary theory is essential for success in every biology course of study. There is no significant ongoing debate within the scientific community regarding the legitimacy of evolution as a scientific idea.

Comments regarding the negative societal impact of teaching evolution appear to be based on personal opinion.

Evolution is a scientific theory, and is not a religion. Nothing in the Next Generation Science Standards restricts the religious freedom of Kentucky families or educators.

The agency notes that the concept of evolution already exists in the current version of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science, and has been assessed since those standards were adopted in 2006. In fact, the Next Generation Science Standards contain a decreased number of standards related to biological evolution, compared to the standards currently in place.

The decision to homeschool a child rather than sending that child to public school is an individual parental choice and is beyond the scope of this regulation.

- (4) Subject Matter: Support for the continued inclusion of evolution in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that evolution is thoroughly supported by many decades of scientific research.

A commenter stated that including evolution and climate change at the level of state standards protects teachers from being bullied into teaching creationism or bad science.

A commenter stated that meaningful debate on evolution has ceased and that there are observed examples of evolution.

Commenters stated that evolution and climate change are controversial topics, but the controversy is political, and not scientific.

A commenter stated that learning about evolution in high school would have been beneficial. The commenter stated that a lack of knowledge of evolution was a disadvantage when competing with other students entering the medical field.

Those speaking or offering written comments supporting the continued inclusion of evolution in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science were: Paul Vincelli, Ph.D. (Citizen), Robert Bevins (Citizen), Regina Smith (Citizen), Elizabeth Power (Citizen), Roberta Burns (Educator and parent) and Keith L. Hautala (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments in support of the continued inclusion of evolution in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. The theory of evolution is included in Kentucky's present Core Academic Standards for Science, and has been assessed since the standards were adopted in 2006. The agency has determined that the theory evolution continues to be universally accepted among professional biology researchers and other scientists.

Biological evolution is the fundamental and unifying theory that underlies all of the life sciences. It has formed the basis of productive research for over a century. Few scientific theories have had as transformative and widespread impact on their respective fields as has evolution. The reasoning that underlies the development of the theory of evolution exemplifies the process of science, which process is fundamental to all scientific disciplines. Students should continue to be given the opportunity to examine the logical process and scientific evidence that led to the development of this foundational scientific idea. Students with a thorough grounding in all areas of science are better equipped to compete for careers and selective college admission. Scientific literacy is essential for success in the twenty-first century, especially in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics-related careers.

- (5) Subject Matter: The inclusion of creationism and intelligent design, without supernatural or theological explanations, in the Next Generation Science Standards.
 - (a) A commenter requested that creationism and intelligent design be included in the standards, but through a secular approach, free from supernatural or theological explanations.

A commenter stated that it is a good idea to discuss intelligent design from both a secular and a religious viewpoint.

Those speaking or offering written comments on the inclusion of creationism and intelligent design, free from supernatural or theological explanations were: William Hardy (Citizen) and Dena Stewart-Gore (Citizen).

(b) Response: No change has been made in response to these comments. The agency has determined that the omission of creationism and intelligent design from the standards was based primarily on overwhelming scientific consensus. The agency has determined that the overwhelming majority of scientists do not consider creationism and intelligent

design as scientific theories. Accordingly, their omission from the Next Generation Science Standards reflects the consensus view among professional scientists and science educators. Even if it were possible to reword the basic ideas of creationism to exclude a theological or supernatural creator, or to discuss intelligent design without discussing the identity of the hypothesized designer (thus avoiding the legal objection), those ideas would still lack meaningful scientific support.

Additionally, courts have repeatedly declared unconstitutional the teaching of creationism and intelligent design on the basis that such teaching violates the Establishment Clause of the First Amendment to the United States Constitution. See, for example, <u>Tammy Kitzmiller</u>, et al. v. Dover Area School District, et al., 400 F. Supp.2d 707 (M.D.Pa. 2005) and <u>Daniel v. Water</u>, 515 F.2d 485 (6th Cir. 1975).

The Next Generation Science Standards do not attempt to explain the origin of life. Creationism and intelligent design attempt to explain the origin of life. Evolution does not conflict with creationism or intelligent design because the ideas do not attempt to explain the same things.

- (6) Subject Matter: Additional revision of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science.
 - (a) Comment: Commenters asked that additional revision be made to the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science for the purpose of refuting evolution and climate change.

Commenters requested the addition of: epigenetic factors, the improbability of random mutation as a driving factor in genetic change, the ideas of the Altenberg 16 in opposition to evolution, Flavius Josephus' study of the accuracy of scripture, the observations of Moses, the existence of man-made metal spheres in the Precambrian, canopy theory, dynamic decay theory, the hydro-plate theory, research on the effect of solar flares on the earth's magnetic field, and other ideas not contained in the proposed science standards.

Commenters requested that intelligent design be added to the standards.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards do not reflect the most recent research on evolutionary theory.

A commenter stated the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards would violate KRS 158.6451 because the standards do not provide for instruction in different theories on such topics as climate change and evolution.

A commenter provided a DVD titled *Confronting Evolution*, containing a creation seminar promoting a curriculum critical of evolution, as an example of how the proposed science standards should teach evolution.

Those speaking or offering written comments requesting additional revision to the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science were: Todd Belcher (Citizen), Matt

Singleton (Citizen), Adrian Gilbert (Citizen), Sarah Reddick (Citizen), Ann Kidder (Citizen), Brian Jackson (Citizen), Kathy Strauss (Citizen), Lydia Lynne Coates Fuller, (Citizen), Naomi Hodges (Citizen), Glenda Grace (Citizen), Virgil Ridings (Citizen), Joel Woltz (Citizen), Donna Hazelwood (Citizen), Samantha Tucker (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Angela Rankins (Citizen), Jeff Whittinghill (Citizen), Joan Tighe (Citizen), Edward Prigge (Citizen), Ronnie Trogden (Citizen), Candace Granstaff (Citizen), Allan Smith (Citizen), Jim Nation (Citizen), Sarah Grayson (Citizen), R. Wesley Pace (Citizen), Joe Armstrong (Citizen), Bridgett Reed (Citizen), Amanda Bifone (Citizen), William Bishop (Citizen), Randall Lamb (Citizen), John Rice (Citizen), Stephen Secchio (Citizen), Brian Slone (Citizen), Pam Yancy (Citizen), Sherian Tingle (Citizen), Mike Alexander (Citizen), Genevieve Apodaca (Citizen), Claudia Hargrove (Citizen), Jacqueline Burchett (Citizen), Colleen Crigler (Citizen), Teddy Williams (Citizen), Teresa Smith (Citizen), Spencer Skaats (Citizen), Angela Armato (Citizen), Craig Newman (Citizen), Jerome Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Ramsey (Citizen), David Foushee (Citizen), Patrick McCamish (Citizen), Amy Meadors (Citizen), Danny Fletcher (Citizen), Dennis Stafford (Citizen), James Roark (Citizen), Judy Roark (Citizen), Billie Stafford (Citizen), Linda Rose (Citizen), Helen Bloodsworth (Citizen), Naomi Webb (Citizen), Anna Reeder (Citizen), Ella Lonas (Citizen), Becky Schmidt (Citizen), Tammy Skaats (Citizen), Cheryl Sadler (Citizen), Angie Christensen (Citizen), Jay Bond, Sr. (Citizen), Diana Diggles (Citizen), Linda Bryant (Citizen), Charlotte Purcell (Citizen), Regina Eckle (Citizen), Donald F. Inks, Jr. (Citizen), Rita Isham (Citizen), Erin Seaman (Citizen), Jay Dargan (Citizen), Jim McHale (Citizen), Tim Boll (Citizen), Sherry Gaines (Citizen), Brenda Kabler (Citizen), Steve Flinchum (Citizen), William Marvel (Citizen), Gary Rogers (Citizen), Randy Riblet (Citizen), Johnny E. Evans (Citizen), Debra Smith (Citizen), Marvin Oliver (Citizen), Terry Sears (Citizen), John Sparks (Citizen), Eileen Serke (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Mary McClendon (Citizen), Gary Buckley (Citizen), Beverly Buckey (Citizen), Roberta Dorsey (Citizen), Velma Newsom (Citizen), Steve Rudy (Citizen), Ken Collins (Citizen), JoeAnn Collins (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Elsie R. Hall (Citizen), Esther Whitley (Citizen), Florence Molnar (Citizen), Regina Smith (Citizen), Bobby Alexander (Citizen), Steve Lorimer (Citizen), JoAnn Davis (Citizen), Kimberly Wood (Citizen), Glenda M. Cogan (Citizen), Sharon Almquist (Citizen), Rob Jones (Citizen), James Champ (Citizen), Ralph Hawkins (Citizen), Stephan Schick Sr. (Citizen), Linda Horback (Citizen), Colin Bruner (Citizen), David Bartsch (Citizen), Shirley Mayrand (Citizen), Michelle Truitt (Citizen), Maureen Carman (Attorney), and Dr. Don Patton (Arkansas resident).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments requesting the additional revision of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. The Next Generation Science Standards include only ideas that are widely supported within the scientific and science education communities and represent core disciplinary ideas that have wide utility for students. The agency has determined that many of the ideas proposed for inclusion are not widely recognized. In scientific fields as large as biology and paleontology, there are many thousands of individuals engaging in research. It would be virtually impossible for scientists to agree upon every minute detail of every scientific concept. The fact that a small number of scientists present ideas contrary to the widely accepted scientific consensus does not automatically give their ideas equal weight and

credibility. If those ideas gain wide support within the scientific and scientific education communities, it is more likely that they will be included in future revisions of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. Only scientific ideas are eligible for inclusion in science standards. A number of the ideas suggested for inclusion (canopy theory, for one example) are not accepted as scientific theories by the scientific community and are, accordingly, not included.

The Next Generation Science Standards do not attempt to explain the origin of life. Creationism and intelligent design attempt to explain the origin of life. Evolution does not conflict with creationism or intelligent design because the ideas do not attempt to explain the same things. Ideas, theories, hypotheses, or beliefs concerning the ultimate origin of life are not included in the Next Generation Science Standards.

The standards represent a 'floor' in terms of content students are required to master, not a 'ceiling'. Every school and district has the freedom to supplement the standards to create curricula appropriate for their students, and to add additional topics as they see fit.

The agency has determined that the proposed standards are consistent with KRS 158.6451, which requires the agency to prepare and disseminate a model curriculum framework, and requires the agency, pursuant to KRS 158.6453, to make revisions to the content standards that shall:

Focus on critical knowledge, skills, and capacities needed for success in the global economy;

Result in fewer, but more in-depth standards to facilitate mastery learning; Communicate expectations more clearly and concisely to teachers, parents, students, and citizens;

Be based on evidence-based research;

Consider international benchmarks; and

Ensure that the standards are aligned from elementary to high school to postsecondary education so that students can be successful at each education level.

Different theories on such topics as climate change and evolution may be selected, by a local district, as the district exercises its control over curriculum, or may be included in revisions to content standards as those different theories withstand the scientific scrutiny applied to screen the present content of the standards.

While the agency appreciates the submission of the DVD presentation, the instructional presentation it contains is an example of a science curriculum. Since curriculum is a local decision, this submission falls outside the scope of the regulation under consideration.

- (7) Subject Matter: Evolution is not settled science. Evolution is theory, not fact.
 - (a) Comment: Commenters stated that evolution is not settled science.

Commenters stated that evolution is not a scientific idea.

Commenters stated that evolution is only a theory and is not a fact.

Commenters stated that the teaching of evolution misleads students.

Commenters stated that there is not a consensus within the scientific community regarding evolution as the primary mechanism to explain the diversity of organisms.

A commenter stated that the theory of evolution is the result of the logical fallacy of inductive reasoning because history has not been witnessed.

A commenter stated that evolution is not settled science because it cannot be expressed as a formula, such as work.

A commenter stated that the fossil record does not support the idea of evolution and that the fossil record delights creationists and causes headaches for evolutionists.

A commenter objected to the idea of scientific consensus, and referred to scientific consensus as fact by popular vote.

A commenter stated that the authors of the Next Generation Science Standards are either misleading or are underprepared and underinformed.

A commenter stated that the standards are a curriculum that favors the theory of evolution over creation and that evolution is not a fact.

Those speaking or offering written comments that evolution is not settled science, and is not fact, were: Todd Belcher (Citizen), Matt Singleton (Citizen), Dena Steward-Gore (Citizen), Adrian Gilbert (Citizen), Dr. Don Patton (Arkansas resident), Valerie O'Rear (Citizen) Steve Shreeve (Citizen), Tim Whalen (Citizen), Sarah Reddick (Citizen), Ann Kidder (Citizen), Brian Jackson (Citizen), Kathy Strauss (Citizen), Lydia Lynne Coates Fuller, (Citizen), Naomi Hodges (Citizen), Glenda Grace (Citizen), Virgil Ridings (Citizen), Joel Woltz (Citizen), Donna Hazelwood (Citizen), Samantha Tucker (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Angela Rankins (Citizen), Jeff Whittinghill (Citizen), Joan Tighe (Citizen), Edward Prigge (Citizen), Ronnie Trogden (Citizen), Candace Granstaff (Citizen), Allan Smith (Citizen), Jim Nation (Citizen), Sarah Grayson (Citizen), R. Wesley Pace (Citizen), Joe Armstrong (Citizen), Bridgett Reed (Citizen), Amanda Bifone (Citizen), William Bishop (Citizen), Randall Lamb (Citizen), John Rice (Citizen), Stephen Secchio (Citizen), Brian Slone (Citizen), Pam Yancy (Citizen), Sherian Tingle (Citizen), Mike Alexander (Citizen), Genevieve Apodaca (Citizen), Claudia Hargrove (Citizen), Jacqueline Burchett (Citizen), Colleen Crigler (Citizen), Teddy Williams (Citizen), Teresa Smith (Citizen), Spencer Skaats (Citizen), Angela Armato (Citizen), Craig Newman (Citizen), Jerome Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Ramsey (Citizen), David Foushee (Citizen), Patrick McCamish (Citizen), Amy Meadors (Citizen), Danny Fletcher (Citizen), Dennis Stafford (Citizen), James Roark (Citizen), Judy Roark (Citizen), Billie Stafford (Citizen), Linda Rose (Citizen), Helen Bloodsworth (Citizen), Naomi Webb

(Citizen), Anna Reeder (Citizen), Ella Lonas (Citizen), Becky Schmidt (Citizen), Tammy Skaats (Citizen), Cheryl Sadler (Citizen), Angie Christensen (Citizen), Jay Bond, Sr. (Citizen), Diana Diggles (Citizen), Linda Bryant (Citizen), Charlotte Purcell (Citizen), Regina Eckle (Citizen), Donald F. Inks, Jr. (Citizen), Rita Isham (Citizen), Erin Seaman (Citizen), Jay Dargan (Citizen), Jim McHale (Citizen), Tim Boll (Citizen), Sherry Gaines (Citizen), Brenda Kabler (Citizen), Steve Flinchum (Citizen), William Marvel (Citizen), Gary Rogers (Citizen), Randy Riblet (Citizen), Johnny E. Evans (Citizen), Debra Smith (Citizen), Marvin Oliver (Citizen), Terry Sears (Citizen), John Sparks (Citizen), Eileen Serke (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Mary McClendon (Citizen), Gary Buckley (Citizen), Beverly Buckey (Citizen), Roberta Dorsey (Citizen), Velma Newsom (Citizen), Steve Rudy (Citizen), Ken Collins (Citizen), JoeAnn Collins (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Elsie R. Hall (Citizen), Esther Whitley (Citizen), Florence Molnar (Citizen), Regina Smith (Citizen), Bobby Alexander (Citizen), Steve Lorimer (Citizen), JoAnn Davis (Citizen), Kimberly (Citizen), Rob Jones (Citizen), James Champ (Citizen), Ralph Hawkins (Citizen), Stephan Schick Sr. (Citizen), Linda Horback (Citizen), Colin Bruner (Citizen), David Bartsch (Citizen), Shirley Mayrand (Citizen), Aaron (Chad) Erhardt (Citizen), Herman Cummings (Georgia resident), Michelle Truitt (Citizen), RR (Citizen), RP (Citizen), Misty Pack (Citizen), Shannon Alexander (Citizen), and Paul Aud (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments that evolution is not settled science or a fact. The agency has determined that, in the scientific and science education communities, a theory is a statement of general ideas that explains many observations of the natural world. In the scientific and science education communities, the word "theory" is a very precise term that identifies a concept that has great utility in explaining phenomena in the natural world. Ideas only rise to the level of scientific theories if they have withstood scrutiny and are exceptionally useful in explaining a wide variety of independent observations. Any scientific theory can be altered or replaced if the theory cannot adequately explain new observations or new scientific evidence.

In the field of science, facts do not become theories. Rather, theories *explain* facts. No theory is immune from revision or replacement in the face of new facts. There is a substantial difference between the everyday and conversational meaning of the word "theory," and the scientific meaning of the word. In everyday conversation, an idea is often labeled a theory for the purpose of painting it as little more than a guess. As explained above, the scientific meaning of the term is much narrower. The Next Generation Science Standards employ the scientific meaning of "theory." Referring to biological evolution as a theory, for the purpose of contesting it, does not weaken the acceptance of biological evolution within the scientific and science education communities.

There is no significant ongoing debate within the scientific community regarding the legitimacy of evolution as a scientific idea. Inconsistencies and unknown details exist in all areas of scientific research and knowledge. The existence of inconsistencies and unknown factors does not negate the dramatically larger body of evidence supporting the prevailing theories in those areas of research.

The agency has determined that professional scientific bodies and organizations supporting the legitimacy of the concept of biological evolution as a cornerstone of the science of biology include:

Alabama Academy of Science

American Anthropological Association

American Association for the Advancement of Science

American Association of Physical Anthropologists

American Astronomical Society

American Chemical Society

American Geological Institute

American Geophysical Union

American Institute of Biological Sciences

American Physical Society

American Psychological Association

American Society of Biological Chemists

American Society of Parasitologists

American Sociological Association

Association of College and University Biology Educators

Association of Southeastern Biologists

Association for Women Geoscientists

Australian Academy of Science

Biophysical Society

Botanical Society of America

California Academy of Sciences

Committee for the Anthropology of Science, Technology, and Computing

Committee for Scientific Investigation of Claims of the Paranormal

Ecological Society of America

Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology

Genetics Society of America

Geological Society of America

Society of Australia

Georgia Academy of Science

History of Science Society

Idaho Scientists for Quality Science Education

InterAcademy Panel

Iowa Academy of Science

Kansas Academy of Science

Kentucky Academy of Science

Kentucky Paleontological Society

Louisiana Academy of Sciences

National Academy of Sciences

New Mexico Academy of Science

New Orleans Geological Society

New York Academy of Sciences

North American Benthological Society

North Carolina Academy of Science

Ohio Academy of Science

Ohio Math and Science Coalition

The Paleontological Society

Pennsylvania Academy of Science

Pennsylvania Council of Professional Geologists

Philosophy of Science Association

Research! America

Royal Astronomical Society of Canada - Ottawa Centre

Royal Society

Royal Society of Canada

Royal Society of Canada, Academy of Science

Sigma Xi, Louisiana State University Chapter

Society for Amateur Scientists

Society for Integrative and Comparative Biology

Society for Neuroscience

Society of Physics Students

Society for the Study of Evolution

Society of Systematic Biologists

Society of Vertebrate Paleontology

Society of Vertebrate Paleontology

Southern Anthropological Society

Tallahassee Scientific Society

Tennessee Darwin Coalition

Virginia Academy of Science

West Virginia Academy of Science

Educational organizations supporting the legitimacy of the concept of biological evolution as a cornerstone of the science of biology include:

American Association of Physics Teachers

American Association of University Professors

American Association of University Women

Arkansas Science Teachers Association

Association of College and University Biology Educators

Association of Pennsylvania State College and University Biologists

Auburn University Faculty Senate

Authors of Biology Textbooks

Biological Sciences Curriculum Study

California Science Teachers Association

Empire State Association of Two Year College Biologists

Georgia Citizens' Educational Coalition

Idaho Science Teachers Association

Illinois Community College Faculty Association Delegate Assembly

Inter-University Council of Ohio

Page **112** of **140**

Iowa Council of Science Supervisors

Iowa Department of Public Instruction

Maryland Association of Science Teachers

Michigan Science Teachers Association

Michigan State Board of Education

National Association of Biology Teachers

National Council for the Social Studies

National Education Association

National Science Education Leadership Association

National Science Teachers Association

New Mexico Coalition for Excellence in Science and Math Education

New York State Education Department

New York State Science Supervisors Association

North Carolina Science Teachers Association

Oklahoma Science Teachers Association

Oklahoma State University Department of Zoology

Science Museum of Minnesota

Science Teachers Association of New York State

Society for College Science Teachers

Syracuse Parent-Teacher Association

University of Alabama at Huntsville Faculty Senate

University of California Academic Senate

University of New Mexico History Department

University of Oklahoma Department of Zoology

University of Queensland (Australia) Board of the Faculty of Science

University System of Georgia Biology Academic Advisory Committee

Utah Science Teachers Association

Utah State Board of Education

Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction

In light of the wide, and deep, support for the teaching of biological evolution, the agency has determined that biological evolution should remain an element of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science.

The agency reiterates that the standards are not a curriculum. Nothing in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science discusses or requires certain curricula.

- (8) Subject Matter: Non-religious objection to the theory of evolution
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated there are non-religious objections to evolution, and cited the works of Cambridge biochemist Douglas Axe, Moeller and Newman, epigenetics, the work of the Altenberg 16, University of San Francisco paleontologist Paul Chien, and others. He asked that students be taught alternative scientific explanations to evolution and to reject the proposed standards related to evolution.

Those speaking or offering written comments regarding non-religious objections to the inclusion of the theory of evolution in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science were: Todd Belcher (Citizen).

(b) No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency has determined that the ideas of evolution, included in the standards, reflect the consensus of the overwhelming majority of scientists. There is no longer scientifically significant debate on the role of evolution in the modern study of biology. This is evidenced by the omission of the suggested ideas from the *Framework for K-12 Science Education*, published by the National Research Council of the National Academy of Science. The *Framework* represents core knowledge in the biological sciences. The exclusion of the suggested theories is evidence that those theories are not components of core biological knowledge, and are peripheral to science education.

The Next Generation Science Standards include only ideas that are widely supported within the scientific and science education communities and represent core disciplinary ideas that have wide utility for students. The agency has determined that many of the ideas proposed for inclusion are not widely recognized. If those ideas gain wide support within the scientific and scientific education communities, it is more likely that they will be included in future revisions of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science.

- (9) Subject Matter: Opposition to the teaching of climate change through the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that standards overemphasize global warming, to the neglect of other concepts.

A commenter noted the omission of scientific terms such as "hormone" and "kinesis" in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards.

A commenter stated that she opposes teaching climate change as "settled" science because there is ongoing debate, and more scientists are coming out against it.

A commenter stated that carbon dioxide is not the most common greenhouse gas, and suggested that Climategate and the global carbon tax be studied by the agency.

Commenters questioned the emphasis on climate change in the Next Generation Science Standards, based on the frequency with which the word "climate" appears.

A commenter stated that climate change is junk science.

A commenter stated that theories about manmade global warming are imposed upon children from kindergarten.

A commenter stated that a few decades ago, many thought the earth was cooling, illustrating how quickly the assumptions of men can change.

Speaking or offering written comments in opposition to the teaching of climate change were: Annice Milliner (Citizen), William Hardy (Citizen), Robert Hall (Citizen), Valerie O'Rear (Citizen), Aaron (Chad) Erhardt (Citizen), Martin Cothran (Citizen), Greg Cordier (Citizen), and Kimberly Wood (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency has determined that global climate research is increasing in prominence and importance within the scientific and science education communities. Including climate research as part of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science accurately reflects the current state of scientific thought. The Framework for K-12 Science Education includes the study of climate as one of the foundational concepts of the Next Generation Science Standards.

The agency has determined that the basic ideas of climate science, as included in the Next Generation Science Standards, have been described as a scientific consensus by a number of scientific bodies, including:

American Association for the Advancement of Science **American Chemical Society** American Geophysical Union American Institute of Biological Sciences American Meteorological Society American Society of Agronomy American Society of Plant Biologists American Statistical Association Association of Ecosystem Research Centers **Botanical Society of America** Crop Science Society of America **Ecological Society of America** Natural Science Collections Alliance Organization of Biological Field Stations Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics Society of Systematic Biologists

University Corporation for Atmospheric Research

Soil Science Society of America

The Next Generation Science Standards do not advocate any particular public response, policy change, or civic action regarding climate change. Instead, the standards ask students to consider the evidence for the factors influencing climate change. The standards do not require students to engage in any sort of civic or legal course of action. While such lessons might be included in individual school or district curriculum, such curriculum decisions are under local control. In fact, such curricula could be taught under the current set of standards if individual schools and teachers so desire. The agency has determined that, given its prominence in current scientific research, climate change is possibly already the topic of lessons in science classrooms across the Commonwealth.

Some comments specifically objected to a perceived overemphasis on climate science, based on the number of standards addressing climate change as opposed to other areas of science. The agency suspects that these comments were based upon a simple word search of the science standards, rather than a count of actual performance expectations (standards). Words such as "global", "warming", and "climate" may appear in the standards in isolated uses that are not related to the concept of climate change. The agency has also determined that there may be a misperception that every standard addressing weather or climate is related to climate *change*. The study of weather, and the factors influencing weather, has been included in science standards for many years, predating the present study of climate change. The agency has determined that comments asserting a heavy weighting toward climate science, to the exclusion of other disciplines, are not supported by a careful examination of the standards themselves.

Political matters, such as a global carbon tax and Climategate are beyond the scope of this regulation.

- (10) Subject Matter: Support for the inclusion of climate change/global warming concepts in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that, while not he is not a climate scientist, he has intensively studied hundreds of peer-reviewed research articles on climate science, has attended three scientific conferences on climate change, and has found that mainstream climate scientists practice the same scientific methods as any community of scientists he has been associated with in 35 years.

A commenter stated that the scientific community is not having any debate about the climate change standards included in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science; that climate change is addressed in respected college texts, and would not be in the absence of consensus in the science community; and that the existence of a human impact on climate change is accepted in mainstream science.

A commenter stated that climate science is a mature science that has existed for more than 150 years, and that scientific data indicates the earth is continuing to warm.

A commenter stated that climate change education is needed because present energy production schemes are irreversibly altering the climate.

A comment stated that Kentucky student deserve the most up-to-date science education, including learning about climate change.

A commenter stated that he was pleased to see the inclusion of standards related to climate and weather because they are needed to help prepare for increasingly severe weather events.

Those speaking or offering written supporting the inclusion of climate change/global warming concepts in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science were: Paul Vincelli, (Ph.D), Rick Clewett (Climate Parents), Robert Bevins (Kentuckians for Science Education), Joseph Straley (University of Kentucky), Donnie Wilkerson (Citizen), and Sheila Anderson (Citizen) who submitted comments in the form of a petition signed by three thousand eight hundred and ninety-four (3,894) individuals.

- (b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments supporting the inclusion of standards relating to climate change and global warming.
- (11) Subject Matter: Criticisms of the content and rigor of the Next Generation Science Standards, including criticisms made in the Thomas B. Fordham Foundation Report
 - (a) Comment: Commenters stated that a report by the Fordham Foundation assigned the Next Generation Science Standards a grade of "C", and cited the Fordham Foundation report.

A commenter stated that the concerns expressed in the Fordham Foundation Report should delay adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science.

A commenter cited the Fordham Foundation Report, stated that the Next Generation Science Standards blur the true meaning of engineering, and stated that the Standards do not expect much math from students.

A commenter stated that the standards take a process-over-content approach, while SB 1 (2009) requires that the standards be based on evidence-based research.

A commenter stated that there is an imbalance in the presentation and emphasis of subjects such as climate change, as determined by the number of times certain words appear.

A commenter stated that there is not enough emphasis on topics such as Universal Gas Law, current flow in closed electrical circuits, or other physical science content in the high school curriculum. The commenter stated that it would be impossible to derive a high school physics or chemistry course from the standards.

A commenter stated that the proposed standards are not content-driven but are processand skill-driven. The commenter stated that Senate Bill 1 requires that standards cover academic content.

A commenter stated that the standards are not as rigorous as Kentuckians desire and that a complete rejection of the 2013 standards is needed.

A commenter addressed objections raised by the Fordham Foundation Report and stated that standards and curriculum are misunderstood. The commenter stated that standards

are not detailed and filled with vocabulary words. Standards are the wrong place to look for this detail.

Those speaking or offering written comments supporting concerns raised by the Fordham Foundation Report were: Annice Milliner (Citizen), Adrian Gilbert (Citizen), Valerie O'Rear (Citizen), Richard G. Innes (Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions), Martin Cothran (Citizen), Cindy Rausch (Citizen), Maureen Carman (Attorney), and Sandra Stotsky (Professor).

Those speaking or offering written comments in opposition to concerns raised by the Fordham Foundation were: Robert Bevins (Kentuckians for Science Education).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to criticisms of the content and rigor of the Next Generation Science Standards, including those published by the Thomas B. Fordham Foundation. The agency has determined that, historically, the Fordham grades of science standards have not successfully predicted how well students perform on a common assessment of science proficiency. In a comparison between 2011 8th grade National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) scores and Fordham 2012 science standards grades as reported in their publication *The State of State Science Standards* 2012:

The two **highest scoring states** on the NAEP (North Dakota and Montana) received a grade of **F** from Fordham on their state science standards.

The **lowest scoring state** on the NAEP (District of Columbia) received a grade of **A** from Fordham on their state science standards. Six of the top 10 highest scoring states received a grade of D (Maine, Colorado, and New Hampshire) or F (North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana). The remaining four received two C's (Vermont and Minnesota), one B (Utah), and a single A (Massachusetts).

The five lowest scoring states on the NAEP received two A's (District of Columbia and California), two D's (Alabama and Hawaii), and one C (Mississippi).

The agency has concluded that the examples above indicate that Fordham's scores have limited predictive reliability as regards student achievement in science.

The agency notes that the Fordham review grade of "C" for the Next Generation Science Standards represents an improvement over the grade of "D" that Fordham assigned to Kentucky's present science standards.

The agency has determined that the Fordham report does not accurately evaluate the Next Generation Science Standards. The Fordham report represents the opinion of nine (9) individuals. The review judged the standards in comparison to a set of content expectations created by Fordham and used in their previous reviews of state science standards. These content expectations are very narrowly focused upon content detail.

Such a narrowly-focused set of criteria are not well suited to evaluate content standards that were written to give as much emphasis to the *processes* and *concepts* of science as they give to the *content*.

The absence of specific scientific terms from the standards does not imply their absence from the science curricula of individual schools and districts. Science is not a list of vocabulary words and formulas to be memorized. Facts and formulas can be retrieved instantly in our information-rich society, but they are only valuable when students have an understanding of how to use those facts and formulas to solve meaningful scientific problems.

Standards and curricula are written to different levels of detail. Schools and districts will continue to control curriculum development despite the adoption of revised science standards. Many of the foundational ideas behind concepts detailed in the standards will continue to appear in daily lesson plans at the discretion of the teachers writing and implementing those plans.

It is not the purpose of science standards to define individual course curricula, especially for courses such as chemistry and physics. The standards describe expectations of every student, not just those students wishing to pursue careers in science or Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) fields. Course requirements for graduation are a matter of local curriculum. Therefore, chemistry and physics are not required for graduation. The current science standards also do not define the curriculum of a complete high school chemistry or physics course. Those curriculum decisions are left to individual schools and districts under Kentucky law.

The agency has learned that the Division of Chemical Education of the American Chemical Society and the American Physical Society endorse the Next Generation Science Standards. These professional groups advocate for the advancement of chemistry and physics in the United States. Their statements of support are below:

The Division of Chemical Education recognizes the achievement that is present in the Next Generation Science Standards, including their basis in research on teaching and learning, their formulation as performance standards, and their basis in the NRC framework and its dimensions of Science and Engineering Practices, Disciplinary Core Ideas, and Cross Cutting Concepts. We endorse the Standards as a document that is broadly applicable as a basis for K-12 science instruction and call upon the Division to develop innovative programming to support the implementation of the Standards.

The American Physical Society Committee on Education endorses the physics content of the Next Generation Science Standards. The Committee recognizes that the Next Generation Science Standards are intended to promote broad science literacy, and urges K-12 education policy-makers in all states to adopt these standards and implement the necessary teacher support to attain them.

These statements of support should be balanced against comments critical of the physical science content of the standards. The agency has determined that the opinions of these professional organizations should be given greater weight based on their preeminence in their respective fields, and the esteem in which practitioners of the sciences hold them.

The agency notes that every topic page of the Next Generation Science Standards is correlated with the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Mathematics. The experts who reviewed the Next Generation Science Standards have stated that great attention was paid to ensure continuity with the mathematics standards. The Fordham Foundation final report, dated June 13, 2013, acknowledged that Fordham has not yet thoroughly reviewed the new and clearly more extensive Next Generation Science Standards appendix. (Appendix L: Connections to CCSS-Mathematics). As noted above, the absence of specific mathematical concepts from the standards does not imply that those concepts will be absent from curricula developed from those standards. Curricula provide a greater level of content specificity than is included in the standards.

The agency has studied the comment attributing to the Fordham Report criticism that the Next Generation Science Standards blur the true meaning of engineering. This statement was published on Fordham's Edexcellence.net website on February 6, 2013, in response to the January 2013 NGSS public draft. The agency was unable to locate a similar comment in the June 13, 2013 Fordham report that was based on the final released version of the proposed standards. Because there was significant revision of the Next Generation Science Standards between the January 2013 public draft and the final released version, and because this particular criticism appears not to have survived the editing of the Fordham final Report, the agency assumes that the revision of the Next Generation Science Standards satisfied Fordham's concerns, and this comment, regarding the true meaning of engineering.

Kentucky's 2009 Senate Bill 1, codified as KRS 158.6453, mandated revision of all content standards and a number of criteria by which those standards were to be developed or selected. Pursuant to Section 2(b), revisions to the content standards shall:

- 1. Focus on critical knowledge, skills, and capacities needed for success in the global economy;
- 2. Result in fewer but more in-depth standards to facilitate mastery learning:
- 3. Communicate expectations more clearly and concisely to teachers, parents, students, and citizens;
- 4. Be based on evidence-based research;
- 5. Consider international benchmarks: and
- 6. Ensure that the standards are aligned from elementary to high school to postsecondary education so that students can be successful at each education level.

A number of concepts were removed from Next Generation Science Standards to meet the requirements of SB1 (2009), and new standards were required to address critical knowledge, skills and capacities. The narrowly defined and discrete content requirements used by Fordham in their review conflicts with the requirements of SB1.

A commenter asserted that SB1 (2009) requires a focus on academic content, but this term is absent from the statute. The statute requires that the standards focus on "critical knowledge, skills, and capacities needed for success in the global economy." The agency has determined that the proposed science standards fully meet the requirements of SB 1 (2009), as enacted.

The agency is unable to identify a mechanism that would quantify the degree of rigor desired by Kentuckians. However, the overwhelming ratio of supporters to detractors offering public comments on the standards suggests that Kentuckians approve of the level of rigor contained in the Next Generation Science Standards.

Inclusion of the concepts in the Next Generation Science Standards was guided by the foundational document from which they were created, the *Framework for K-12 Science Education*. The *Framework* was published by the National Research Council of the National Academy of Science and provides a sound, evidence-based foundation for standards by drawing on current scientific research—including research on the ways students learn science effectively—and identifies the science all K–12 students should know.

The opinion that the Next Generation Science Standards emphasize practices over content is subjective. The agency notes that the developers of the Next Generation Science Standards assert that process and content, as a result of extensive research, are intentionally given equal prominence. The agency has learned that Achieve (Achieve, Inc., an independent, bi-partisan, non-profit education reform organization led by a Board of Directors consisting of governors and business leaders) cited seventy-seven (77) papers and research studies in support of the three dimensional structure (practices, core ideas and cross cutting concepts) of the Next Generation Science Standards, and finds that the standards appropriately attend to process and content.

- (12) Subject Matter: Discussion of the scientific process and scientific method
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that the standards do not sufficiently address the scientific process.

A commenter stated that the term "scientific method" does not appear in the standards and that it appears that the Next Generation Science Standards completely overlooked the first, but fundamentally important, introductory chapter of the book on science.

A commenter questioned whether training in scientific reasoning should have less of a role in the proposed science standards than climate science.

Those speaking or offering written comments about the scientific process and the scientific method were: Richard G. Innes (Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions), Martin Cothran (Citizen), and Valerie O'Rear (Retired Colonel/Parent).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency has determined that, in scientific fields, there is no single definition of the term 'scientific method'. Accordingly, textbooks that introduce 'the' scientific method as a rigidly defined series of rote steps do not accurately reflect the nature of science as it is most frequently practiced.

The scientific method is not universally defined. The scientific method is often presented as exclusively consisting of five steps, usually including (1) defining the problem, (2) forming a hypothesis, (3) making observations, (4) testing the hypothesis, and (5) drawing conclusions. In the practice, and teaching, of science, observation may be the first step. The scientific method is a fluid process that does not necessarily employ each of the five steps listed above, nor dictate the order in which the steps should be applied. The agency recognizes that science professionals and teachers may validly employ other models of scientific practice.

The agency has determined that the proposed standards instill the practices of science (including scientific reasoning) and engineering through performance expectations, rather than separating them into a set of steps to be memorized, tested, and then forgotten. This approach asks students to employ the practices of science every day. One of the three dimensions of the proposed science standards, Science and Engineering Practices, exemplifies the critical attributes of scientific reasoning. These Practices are included in every performance expectation contained in the proposed standards.

The comment that inquired whether training in scientific reasoning should have less of a role in the proposed science standards than climate science poses a question, and not a comment upon the regulation, and no agency response is required.

- (13) Subject Matter: The adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards will impact college and career readiness:
 - (a) Comment: Commenters expressed support for the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards and stated that the Standards will help improve the college and career readiness of Kentucky students.

A commenter expressed confidence that the adoption of the standards will lead to scientifically literate graduates who are ready for college and careers and will understand how science impacts their lives.

Commenters stated that the new standards will increase the likelihood that students entering college science classes will be better prepared than current graduates who are now entering Kentucky's universities.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards are not about high quality national education standards, but are rather about how to lower the level of academic achievement required for high school diplomas and for admission to public colleges.

Commenters stated that the new standards will result in more Kentucky students being able to enter science, technology, engineering, and mathematics-related career fields.

A commenter stated that the standards will lead to students who are ready to enter the workforce immediately upon graduation.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards will help students see the connection between their actions and the world, in tangible ways, and will prepare them for 21st Century jobs.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards are supported by strong research and that Kentucky must embrace 21st Century science if we expect our students to compete in an international job market.

Those speaking or offering written comments that the adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards will impact college and career readiness were: Blaine Ferrell (Kentucky Academy of Science), Tom Tretter (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Daniel Phelps (Kentucky Paleontological Society), Trent Garrison (American Institute of Professional Geologists, Kentucky Section), Rick Clewett (Climate Parents), David Robinson (citizen), Joseph Straley (Professor), Elizabeth Schmidt (Kentucky Environmental Education Council), Elizabeth Power (Citizen), Roberta Burns (Educator and parent), Sandra Stotsky (Professor) and Ashley Hoffman (Kentucky Association for Environmental Education).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments of support. The agency agrees that the proposed Kentucky Core Academic Standards for science will increase the college and career readiness of Kentucky graduates by giving them a grounding in the skills of scientific literacy needed to enter science, technology, engineering, and mathematics-related preparatory programs and rigorous college coursework.

No changes have been made in response to the comment that the purpose of the Next Generation Science Standards is to lower the academic requirements of high school graduation and college admission. The agency has determined that this comment represents a conclusory statement of opinion and not a critique of the regulation to which a response can be made.

- (14) Subject Matter: The adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science will impact the economy in a positive way.
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that Kentucky has a biology-based economy and that students need to understand biology or Kentucky will be left behind economically. The commenter stated that industries will go elsewhere if Kentucky does not adopt the Next Generation Science Standards.

A commenter stated the Next Generation Science Standards should be adopted to help produce the number and quality of scientists needed to sustain this country and its economy.

Commenters stated that the focus on science education exemplified by the Next Generation Science Standards can raise the public's scientific understanding and help areas of the state that are in deep poverty.

A commenter stated that in order to keep pace with the rest of the country and give them [students] the best opportunity for their future, the new science standards should be adopted.

A commenter stated that the approach of the Next Generation Science Standards will have a beneficial impact on the Commonwealth, preparing students for science, technology, engineering, and mathematics fields in industry and manufacturing, boosting the economy, and supplying much-needed jobs to students who are ready to enter the workforce immediately upon graduation.

A commenter stated that adoption of the Next Generation Science Standards will help Kentucky be more economically competitive in the future by attracting high-tech industries.

Those speaking or offering written comments on the positive economic impact of the Next Generation Science Standards were David Robinson (Citizen), Rick Clewett (Citizen), Ryan Lawson (Citizen), Haley Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Evitts (Citizen), Elizabeth Schmidt (Kentucky Environmental Education Council), and Keith L. Hautala (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these supportive comments. The agency agrees that failure to implement the Next Generation Science Standards as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science will place Kentucky at an economic disadvantage with states that adopt and implement the Standards.

The agency notes that in 2007 a Carnegie Foundation commission of distinguished researchers and public and private leaders concluded that the nation's capacity to innovate for economic growth and the ability of American workers to thrive in the modern workforce depend on a broad foundation of math and science learning, as do hopes for preserving a vibrant democracy and the promise of social mobility that lie at

the heart of the American dream. The Carnegie Foundation noted, however, that the U.S. system of science and mathematics education is performing far below par and, if left unattended, will leave millions of young Americans unprepared to succeed in a global economy.

These findings bolster the agency's commitment to the high quality education that Kentucky's students deserve, and the embodiment of that commitment through appropriate education standards.

- (15) Subject Matter: Race to the Top funds and Common Core Standards.
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that Kentuckians ought to be embarrassed that their political leaders were so easily bribed by the current federal administration to sell their rights to control local curriculum. The commenter also stated that Secretary of Education Arne Duncan used the Race to the Top funds to get states to adopt common core standards because of the "hodgepodge" of state standards.

Those speaking or providing written comments regarding Race to the Top and common core standards were: Annice Milliner (Citizen)

b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. Kentucky did not adopt new English/language arts and mathematics standards to compete for Race to the Top funds, but instead due to the mandates of SB 1 (2009). Kentucky had already adopted standards for English/language arts and mathematics before the Race to the Top Competition started. SB 1 (2009) required the revision of all content area standards, but did not include a budget allocation for the mandated work. SB 1 (2009) required the agency to consider standards that had been adopted by national content advisory groups and professional education consortia. SB 1 (2009) also required dissemination and training on the standards for all teachers, administrators, and higher education faculty. Kentucky voluntarily submitted an application to support the implementation of the standards, not for development and adoption, as was the case in some other states that competed for Race to the Top funds.

A goal of the state-led Common Core Initiative is to establish rigorous standards that are consistent across states and that are aligned to college-and-career readiness goals. The purpose of standardization is to avoid a "hodgepodge" of standards. Students moving from state to state would experience inconsistencies in standards. This variance in standards also does not support students' ability to compete nationally and globally.

- (16) Subject Matter: Opposition to the use of the Common Core State Standards, adopted as Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics.
 - (a) Comment: Commenters stated there have been numerous articles and experts talking about the Common Core Standards.

Commenters stated that the Common Core Standards are not good for our students.

Commenters stated that the Common Core Standards are a way of dumbing down Kentucky's students and asked that no Common Core Standards be used in Kentucky Schools.

A commenter stated that the Common Core Standards are not rigorous, and lack a research base, international comparisons, and credible authors.

A commenter stated that the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics were not field-tested and were not endorsed by two of the twenty-nine members of the validation committee.

A commenter stated that the content in the Common Core Standards was too complex. The commenter stated that his young child has Asperger Syndrome, and when asked what he was studying, the child reported that he was study protagonists and thesis statements.

A commenter stated that the Common Core Standards do not allow for innovation by students, and used the China as an example of a country with common standards but that lacks innovation among students.

Commenters stated that the cost of implementation of the Common Core is unsustainable.

A commenter stated that the Common Core was created by the big business elite, including Bill and Melinda Gates.

A commenter stated that the Common Core Standards were a fascist method, used by the government to control students.

A commenter stated that the social studies standards do not include the important term "republic," even though the United States is a republic.

Those speaking or submitting written comments of opposition to the Common Core State Standards, adopted as Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics, were: Sarah Reddick (Citizen), Ann Kidder (Citizen), Brian Jackson (Citizen), Kathy Strauss (Citizen), Lydia Lynne Coates Fuller, (Citizen), Naomi Hodges (Citizen), Glenda Grace (Citizen), Virgil Ridings (Citizen), Joel Woltz (Citizen), Donna Hazelwood (Citizen), Samantha Tucker (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Angela Rankins (Citizen), Jeff Whittinghill (Citizen), Joan Tighe (Citizen), Edward Prigge (Citizen), Ronnie Trogden (Citizen), Candace Granstaff (Citizen), Allan Smith (Citizen), Jim Nation (Citizen), Sarah Grayson (Citizen), R. Wesley Pace (Citizen), Joe Armstrong (Citizen), Bridgett Reed (Citizen), Amanda Bifone (Citizen), William Bishop (Citizen), Randall Lamb (Citizen), John Rice (Citizen), Stephen Secchio (Citizen), Brian Slone (Citizen), Pam Yancy (Citizen), Sherian Tingle (Citizen), Mike Alexander (Citizen), Genevieve Apodaca (Citizen), Claudia Hargrove (Citizen), Jacqueline Burchett (Citizen), Colleen Crigler (Citizen), Teddy Williams (Citizen), Teresa Smith (Citizen), Spencer

Skaats (Citizen), Angela Armato (Citizen), Craig Newman (Citizen), Jerome Lawson (Citizen), Stephanie Ramsey (Citizen), David Foushee (Citizen), Patrick McCamish (Citizen), Amy Meadors (Citizen), Danny Fletcher (Citizen), Dennis Stafford (Citizen), James Roark (Citizen), Judy Roark (Citizen), Billie Stafford (Citizen), Linda Rose (Citizen), Helen Bloodsworth (Citizen), Naomi Webb (Citizen), Anna Reeder (Citizen), Ella Lonas (Citizen), Becky Schmidt (Citizen), Tammy Skaats (Citizen), Cheryl Sadler (Citizen), Angie Christensen (Citizen), Jay Bond, Sr. (Citizen), Diana Diggles (Citizen), Linda Bryant (Citizen), Charlotte Purcell (Citizen), Regina Eckle (Citizen), Donald F. Inks, Jr. (Citizen), Rita Isham (Citizen), Erin Seaman (Citizen), Jay Dargan (Citizen), Jim McHale (Citizen), Tim Boll (Citizen), Sherry Gaines (Citizen), Brenda Kabler (Citizen), Steve Flinchum (Citizen), William Marvel (Citizen), Gary Rogers (Citizen), Randy Riblet (Citizen), Johnny E. Evans (Citizen), Debra Smith (Citizen), Marvin Oliver (Citizen), Terry Sears (Citizen), John Sparks (Citizen), Eileen Serke (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Mary McClendon (Citizen), Gary Buckley (Citizen), Beverly Buckey (Citizen), Roberta Dorsey (Citizen), Velma Newsom (Citizen), Steve Rudy (Citizen), Ken Collins (Citizen), JoeAnn Collins (Citizen), Vickie Hatton (Citizen), Elsie R. Hall (Citizen), Esther Whitley (Citizen), Florence Molnar (Citizen), Regina Smith (Citizen), Bobby Alexander (Citizen), Steve Lorimer (Citizen), JoAnn Davis (Citizen), Kimberly Wood (Citizen), Glenda M. Cogan (Citizen), Frank Simon (Citizen), Sharon Almquist (Citizen), Rob Jones (Citizen), James Champ (Citizen), Ralph Hawkins (Citizen), Stephan Schick Sr. (Citizen), Linda Horback (Citizen), Colin Bruner (Citizen), David Bartsch (Citizen), Shirley Mayrand (Citizen), Michelle Truitt, (Citizen), Karl and Jennifer Dolson (Citizens), Maureen Carman (Citizen), Valerie O'Rear (Retired Colonel and mother), Steve Shreeve (Parent), Shannon Buzard (Parent), Matt Singleton (Citizen), Sandra Stotsky (Professor), Elsie Hall (Citizen), and Glenda Cogan (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The Kentucky Board of Education reaffirmed its support of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics at its April 2013 meeting.

The agency has determined that the federal government played no role in the development of the Common Core State Standards and does not govern the Common Core State Standards initiative. The Common Core State Standards are not a curriculum. They are a clear set of expectations for the knowledge and skills will help students succeed. Nothing in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards discusses or requires curriculum. In Kentucky, the state determines academic standards, or the goals for what each child should know and be able to do by the end of each grade level. Curriculum is set at the local level. Local school districts determine the best curriculum to help the teachers in their schools meet these academic standards. It remains up to each local school district, not the state or federal government, to select curriculum.

The agency notes that states do not field-test standards. Standards are goals and cannot be field-tested. The agency has been unable to locate scholarly research on the viability of, or mechanism for, field testing educational standards.

The agency has determined that the twenty-five member validation committee referenced in a comment was composed of those leading the field of standards development. The members of the validation committee were selected by six governors and chief state school officers, based on nominations. All selected members had demonstrated experience in national and international standards development, or had a reputation of expertise in English/language arts, mathematics, or a related field such as special education, English language learners, assessments, or curriculum development. The validation committee's charge was to validate the process used to develop the standards and assess the evidence-base for the standards. Twenty-three of the twenty-five members validated the development and evidentiary basis of the standards. The agency has determined that the ninety-two percent (92%) agreement rate among the members of the validation committee is sufficient to grant weight to the conclusions of the committee.

The agency notes that the National Governors Association and the Council of Chief State School Officers accepted applications, from across the nation, of content experts to serve on the standards drafting team. While no Kentuckians were selected to serve on the drafting team for the standards, during the drafting process Kentucky teachers, administrators, higher education officials, education partners, the public, and the staffs of the three participating agencies (Council on Postsecondary Education, Education Professional Standards Board, the Kentucky Department of Education) had several opportunities to provide feedback on drafts of the standards. Subsequent drafts reflected the feedback provided by Kentuckians. Several versions of the standards were publicized for teacher and public feedback. Kentucky teachers were very positive about the standards and expressed that their collective voices had been heard.

The agency has determined that the Common Core Standards, adopted in Kentucky as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics, are considerably more rigorous than Kentucky's previous standards. An independent study by the Thomas B. Fordham Institute gives the Kentucky Core Academic Standards considerably better grades in content, rigor, clarity, and specificity than previous standards that it called "among the worst in the country." Kentucky's colleges and universities and the business community have advised the agency that students who graduate from high school with mastery of these standards will be prepared for the rigors of postsecondary education and the workforce. These standards were developed to be comparable with those of any other state in the nation and with the standards of any other country in the world.

Comments regarding the rigor of the standards were inconsistent. While some commenters stated that the standards are dumbing down students, others indicated concern that the standards are too complex. Given the wide range of opinions, the agency is unable to reconcile these opposing comments and chooses to rely upon the expertise of the content specialists involved in the development of the content standards.

Innovation may be a part of the classroom experience for every student, irrespective of the standards adopted at the state level. Curriculum decisions and teacher attitudes and behaviors have far more impact on innovation than state standards. Since curriculum

decisions are made at the local, not state, level, the agency has determined that the proposed standards will not have a negative impact on student innovation. Recent Districts of Innovation legislation supports local districts in providing innovation opportunities for their students, as well.

The agency notes that the Common Core Standards are now in their third year of implementation. While early results have shown lower test scores in the elementary grades, as the material being taught and tested has become more rigorous, the college readiness of high school graduates entering postsecondary education in Kentucky has increased dramatically.

The first year the Kentucky Core Academic Standards were implemented in Kentucky schools, the percentage of students prepared to take credit-bearing college courses increased more than six percent, as measured on the ACT college entrance exam. In *Education Week's* 2012 "Quality Counts" report on key education indicators, policy efforts and outcomes, Kentucky ranked 10th in the nation—moving up from 34th place in 2010.

The current social studies standards have not been revised since 2006, and are not part of the Common Core Standards or the Next Generation Science Standards, both adopted as Kentucky Core Academic Standards. The current social studies standards are being amended at this time. "Republic" is specifically mentioned in the standards at the 6th grade level.

- (17) Subject Matter: Sharing personal student information:
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated a concern about the sharing of a child's personal information through the Individual Learning Plan (ILP). The commenter stated that the ILP is used to plan for course offerings, and contains personal information about a child's academic progress that should not be shared. The commenter has indicated these concerns to the child's school. The commenter expressed concern about the credits required of students, including electives connected to the ILP. The commenter also expressed concern about the protection of the student's health information because HIPPA does not allow access to that information. The commenter stated that schools are not medical institutions, but that schools need medical information when a student registers.

A commenter stated that he was against using a P-20 data system to conduct "surveillance" on students.

Those speaking or submitting written comments on sharing personal student information were: Shannon Buzard (Parent), Steve Shreeve (Parent), Maureen Carman (Attorney), and Kim Houlihan (Parent).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency has determined that the Next Generation Science Standards, to be adopted as the

Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science, do not address the collection of personal information on students, but confine themselves to content standards.

No new data collection is required as part of the standards initiative and standards are not tied to data collection at the state or local level. Neither the agency nor local school districts have collected data, for example, on religious affiliation. Neither the agency nor local school districts have the technology to collect biometric data on students. Student data are highly protected, and agency efforts around student data systems fully comply with the law by adopting data privacy and security protections that meet the highest industry standards, exceed federal (Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act or FERPA) requirements, and are designed to ensure that student data are used only for agreed-upon education purposes and not further disclosed. In no case would student data be sold. The data is owned by school districts, and the agency protects data in compliance with federal and state laws.

Personal information about an individual student (including identifying information, assessment results, interests, and abilities) in the Kentucky Individual Learning Plan (ILP) is only visible viewed by the student, the parent(s), the student's advisor, the ILP coordinator at the school, and the ILP coordinator at the district level. No individual student data is reported publicly for the ILP. The "Invite Others Option" of the ILP allows a student to invite colleges, scholarship opportunity providers, or potential employers to view selected portions of the ILP for a limited amount of time. However, parents may choose to disable this option for their student.

Safety and confidentiality are very important to the agency, which will continue to protect all student information.

- (18) Subject Matter: The development and adoption process for the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science
 - (a) Comment: Commenters referred specifically to the development and adoption process for the Next Generation Science Standards, adopted as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science, stated that they had confidence in the process used to develop the standards, and thought that the adoption process was strong.

A commenter stated that the adoption process allowed the standards to be well-vetted by those knowledgeable in content, and recommended that the Next Generation Science Standards be adopted, as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science, in their entirety.

A commenter supported the introduction of science concepts in early grade levels, and stated that the standards should be adopted and implemented as written.

One commenter stated that Kentucky should invite input on the standards from Kentucky post-secondary institutions.

A commenter stated that development and adoption of all academic standards needs to be done slowly, and standards that have been adopted need to be revisited.

A commenter stated that the adoption of the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science was rushed and the standards were not available long enough for independent review.

A commenter stated that the Next Generation Science Standards were not created through the process outlined in Senate Bill 1 (2009) and did not involve Kentucky educators and parent in any meaningful way because the proposed standards were developed at the national level.

Those speaking or offering written comments on the development and adoption process were: Blaine Ferrell (Kentucky Academy of Science), Tom Tretter (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Daniel Phelps (Kentucky Paleontological Society), James Donaldson (Citizen), Maureen Carman (Citizen), Valerie O'Rear (Citizen), and Richard Innes (Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions), Martin Cothran (Citizen), Cindy Rausch (Citizen), Sandra Stotsky (Professor), Nick Brooks (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Amanda Underwood (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), David Helm (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), Sherry Fox (Kentucky Science Teachers Association), and Rita Jane Shelton (Kentucky Science Teachers Association).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The Common Core Standards, adopted as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics, went through a rigorous drafting and review process.

The agency notes that the National Governors Association and the Council of Chief State School Officers accepted applications, from across the nation, of content experts to serve on the standards drafting team. While no Kentuckians were selected to serve on the drafting team for the standards, during the drafting process Kentucky teachers, administrators, higher education officials, education partners, the public, and the staffs of the three participating agencies (Council on Postsecondary Education, Education Professional Standards Board, the Kentucky Department of Education) had several opportunities to provide feedback on standards drafts. Subsequent drafts reflected the feedback provided by Kentuckians. Several versions of the standards were publicized for teacher and public feedback. Kentucky teachers were very positive about the standards and expressed that their collective voices had been heard.

The agency has determined that the Common Core Standards, adopted in Kentucky as the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics, are considerably more rigorous than Kentucky's previous standards. An independent study by the Thomas B. Fordham Institute gives the Kentucky Core Academic Standards considerably better grades in content, rigor, clarity, and specificity than previous standards which it called "among the worst in the country." Kentucky's colleges and universities and the business community have advised the agency that students who

graduate from high school with mastery of these standards will be prepared for the rigors of postsecondary education and the workforce. These standards were developed to be comparable with those of any other state in the nation and with the standards of any other country in the world.

The National Research Council (NRC), the staff arm of the National Academy of Sciences, began the drafting of the Next Generation Science Standards by developing the *Framework for K–12 Science Education*. The *Framework* was a critical first step because it is grounded in the most current research on science and science learning and identified the science all K–12 students should know. To undertake this effort, the NRC convened a committee of 18 individuals nationally and internationally known in their respective fields. The committee was composed of practicing scientists, including two Nobel laureates, cognitive scientists, science education researchers, and science education standards and policy experts. In addition, the NRC used four design teams to develop the *Framework*. These design teams, in physical science, life science, earth/space science, and engineering, developed the framework for their respective disciplinary area. A public draft was released in July of 2010. The NRC reviewed comments and considered all feedback prior to releasing the final *Framework* on July 19, 2011.

In a process managed by Achieve, states led the development of K–12 science standards, rich in content and practice, arranged in a coherent manner across disciplines and grades to provide all students an internationally-benchmarked science education. The Next Generation Science Standards are based on the *Framework* and will prepare students for college and careers. The Next Generation Science Standards were developed collaboratively with states and other stakeholders in science, science education, higher education and industry. Additional review and guidance was provided by advisory committees composed of nationally-recognized leaders in science and science education as well as business and industry. As part of the development process, the standards underwent multiple reviews, including two public drafts, allowing all who have a stake in science education an opportunity to inform the development of the standards. The standards underwent significant revision based upon the feedback received. According to Achieve, Kentucky residents responded to the first public draft at the highest percentage rate of any state, and were in the top 15% of states in responding to the second public release.

Kentucky was one of the 26 states that partnered in this collaborative state-led drafting process. About 40 Kentuckians, including P-12 science teachers and (including teachers specifically representing the Kentucky Education Association and Kentucky Science Teachers Association), state science and policy staff, higher education faculty, scientists and engineers were involved in multiple reviews of draft documents over the course of the standards development process.

The agency has determined that standards were developed slowly and thoughtfully, with input from stakeholders, and that the development and adoption process has been transparent and thorough.

- (19) Subject Matter: Role of state and local district in standards and curriculum decisions
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that Senate Bill One did not authorize educational standards. The same commenter stated that Section 2 of the Kentucky Constitution requires the legislature to vote upon standards, and that Federal Law Section 1905 forbids federal control of curriculum.

A commenter indicated that he contacted his local school about curriculum so that he could see how the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for English/language arts and mathematics were being taught.

Commenters stated that vocabulary should play an important role in a student's instruction and that they were surprised to not see certain vocabulary words in the standards.

A commenter expressed concern about the absence of famous scientists and the history of science from the Next Generation Science Standards.

Commenters stated that parents should have a voice in the curriculum that is taught in their schools and that curriculum had led to the decision to homeschool their children.

A commenter stated that Kentucky law (KRS 156.438) provides a statutory right to challenge curriculum errors.

A commenter stated that, if the new curriculum is adopted, parents should pull their children out of public school.

A commenter stated that, based upon the commenter's review of the minutes of the March 22, 1999 Education and Assessment and Accountability Review Subcommittee ,and the indication in those minutes that an agency employee stated that if core content was adopted in regulation form, it would be a violation of law for a teacher not to teach in the classroom, a legal concept known as "Fair Notice" probably means that subjects omitted from the Next Generation Science Standards cannot be tested in any Kentucky high school assessments.

Those speaking or providing written comments regarding the role of the state and local school districts in standards and curriculum decisions were: Steve Shreeve (Parent), Sharron Buzard (Parent), Kim Houlihan (Parent), Aaron (Chad) Erhardt (Citizen), Adrien Gilbert (Citizen), Maureen Carman (Citizen), Richard G. Innes (Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions), and Martin Cothran (Citizen).

(b) Response: No change has been made in response to these comments. SB 1 (2009) amended KRS 158.6453. Section (2) (a) directed the Kentucky Department of Education, within thirty (30) days of March 25, 2009, to plan and implement a comprehensive

process for revising the academic content standards in science. Section (2) (b) compels the Kentucky Department of Education to revise content standards to:

- Focus on critical knowledge, skills, and capacities needed for success in the global economy;
- Result in fewer but more in-depth standards to facilitate mastery learning;
- Communicate expectations more clearly and concisely to teachers, parents, students, and citizens;
- Be based on evidence-based research;
- Consider international benchmarks; and
- Ensure that the standards are aligned from elementary to high school to postsecondary education so that students can be successful at each education level.

Because SB 1 (2009) both authorizes and expressly compels the revision of science content standards, the agency has determined that, contrary to comment, the proposed regulation fully complies with the letter and intent of the authorizing statute.

Section Two of the Kentucky Constitution states as follows: *Absolute and arbitrary power over the lives, liberty and property of freemen exists nowhere in a republic, not even in the largest majority.* In promulgating this administrative regulation, the agency has complied with the directives of the legislative branch of government as memorialized in KRS 158.6453. The agency's compliance with statutory mandate does not constitute the exercise of absolute or arbitrary power as contemplated by Section Two of the Kentucky Constitution. The commenter may, through other means, challenge the constitutional validity of KRS 158.6453, the enabling statute, upon which the agency has relied in promulgating this regulation.

The agency has determined that the comment regarding a prohibition against federal control of curriculum regards 20 USC § 6575, which states: Nothing in this title shall be construed to authorize an officer or employee of the Federal Government to mandate, direct, or control a State, local educational agency, or school's specific instructional content, academic achievement standards and assessments, curriculum, or program of instruction.

The standards are not a curriculum. The standards are a clear set of expectations for what knowledge and skills will help students succeed. Nothing in the Kentucky Core Academic Standards discusses or requires certain curriculum. In Kentucky, the state sets academic standards, or the goals for what each child should know and be able to do by the end of each grade level. Curriculum is set at the local level. This division between goals and curriculum remains in place under these standards. Local school districts determine the best curriculum to help the teachers in their schools meet these academic standards. Decisions about curriculum at the school level are made by the School Based Decision Making (SBDM) Council. KRS 160.345 gives the SBDM council control of the curriculum of the school and the council must be composed of three (3) teachers, two (2) parents, and one administrator. The control of curriculum rests with the council.

Regarding the process of correcting claims of factual errors in curriculum, KRS 156.438 directs the Kentucky Board of Education to promulgate administrative regulations to establish procedures for reviewing and resolving claims of factual errors found in textbooks after adoption by the State Textbook Commission. This 2011 statute provides an opportunity for an individual to file notice of what is believed to be a factual error, or factual errors, in a textbook that has been adopted by the Kentucky Textbook Commission. The proposed regulation does not involve adopted textbooks, and the procedure cited by the commenter does not apply to the proposed regulation.

The agency has carefully considered the comment regarding "fair notice" and relating to assessment, which is outside the scope of this regulation. 704 KAR 3:303 relates entirely to academic standards and not to assessment. The commenter cited the minutes of the March 22, 1999 Education and Assessment and Accountability Review Subcommittee as binding legal precedent that controls the Next Generation Science Standards and the Kentucky Core Academic Standards for Science. The agency does not agree. While KRS 61.835 provides that the minutes of action taken at every meeting of a public agency, such as the Education and Assessment and Accountability Review Subcommittee, set forth an accurate record of votes and actions at such meetings, the agency is unaware of any authority for the proposition that such minutes set forth an accurate record of responses given in answer to questions posed by representatives. In other words, the minutes do not pretend to serve as an official transcript of all statements made during subcommittee meetings. Regardless, the commenter suggested that a statement made by an employee of the agency, regarding regulation in existence in 1999, binds present action by the agency.

Legal authority on "fair notice" is normally applied in the context of criminal prosecutions. The Due Process provisions of the Fifth Amendment to the United States Constitution require that citizens be afforded fair notice of precisely what conduct is prohibited. See, for example, <u>U.S. v. Blaszak</u>, 349 F.3d 881 (6th Cir. 2003.) The comment suggests a novel application of constitutional due process protections.

In any event, 704 KAR 3:303 has been amended repeatedly in past fourteen years, and the agency is obligated to honor the directives imposed upon it by the legislature as the legislature has also amended the statutes from which the agency's regulatory authority is drawn. The agency is compelled to adhere to present law and does so in promulgating this regulation. While the 1999 legislative record has historic value, it does not constrain the agency's obligations under present law.

- (20) Subject Matter: Religious neutrality of the Next Generation Science Standards.
 - (a) A commenter stated that the standards promote evolution as faith rather than the fact of creationism.

A commenter stated the standards employ the rule of methodological naturalism. The commenter asserted that it is the goal of the Framework that children develop a

materialistic/atheistic religious worldview and that the Framework usurps the religious rights of parents, students and taxpayers.

A commenter stated that atheists dominate the field of science and proselytize for atheism as a religion using public funds. The commenter stated that atheism is a religion of a denial of reality, teaching that there is no other entity greater than self.

A commenter stated that the standards are not religiously neutral but that they promote the religious viewpoint of human secularism. The commenter cited the case of McCowan and Maryland for the proposition that there can be both theistic and atheistic religions.

Those speaking or offering written comments on the religious neutrality of the Next Generation Science Standards were: Adrian Gilbert (Citizen), Valerie O'Rear (Citizen), Robert P. Lattimer, Ph.D (Citizens for Objective Public Education), and Herman Cummings (Georgia resident).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to comments regarding the religious neutrality of the Next Generation Science Standards. Evolution is long established as a scientific theory and not a religious doctrine. The wide acceptance of the idea of evolution is the result of the consideration of physical and observational evidence. The acceptance of a set of religious beliefs is based largely on faith. There is no conflict between holding faith-based religious beliefs and also accepting the evidence supporting biological evolution. This is evidenced by the fact that practitioners of many different religious faiths are also biologists who study and apply the ideas of evolution in their everyday professional practice.

Case law establishes that evolution is not a religion and that teaching evolution does not violate the Establishment Clause. Epperson v. Arkansas, 393 U.S. 97 (1968). In McGowan v. Maryland, 366 U.S. 420 (1961), the United States Supreme Court held that laws with religious origins are not unconstitutional if they have secular purpose. Subsequent United States Supreme Court jurisprudence (Epperson, supra, Edwards v. Aguillard, 482 U.S. 578 (1987)) invalidated laws that, respectively, prohibited the teaching of evolution and required that creation science be taught in public schools. As noted in Edwards, the Establishment Clause forbids the enactment of any law "respecting an establishment of religion." Id. at 582. A three-pronged test determines whether legislation comports with the Establishment Clause. First, the legislature must have adopted the law with a secular purpose. Second, the statute's principal or primary effect must be one that neither advances nor inhibits religion. Third, the statute must not result in an excessive entanglement of government with religion. Id. at 583. State action violates the Establishment Clause if it fails to satisfy any of these prongs. Id. The

comment that the Next Generation Science Standards present a constitutionally impermissible human secularism represents a conclusion of law, rather than a comment upon the content of the standards, and no change has been made in response.

- (21) Subject Matter: Impact of the Next Generation Science Standards on the SAT
 - (a) Comment: A commenter asked how the standards being considered impact the SAT Those speaking or providing written comments on the impact of the SAT were: Susan Buzard (Citizen).
 - (b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. Science is not a component of the Scholastic Achievement Test. The Scholastic Achievement Test is a product of the College Board. The inherent nature of the proposed science standards, with their focus on science and engineering practices aligned to literacy practices, should result in increased performance on any test used to predict college success.
- (22) Subject Matter: Impact of standards revision on students with disabilities
 - (a) Comment: A commenter stated that parents of children with disabilities who have trouble with science and math will object to the standards because the standards will marginalize these students.

A commenter stated that the standards will benefit students who struggle with disabilities because they will be able to engage with science as it moves from abstract paper and pencil concepts into exploration.

Those speaking or providing written comments regarding the impact of standards revision on students with disabilities were: Dena Stewart-Gore (citizen), Steve Shreeve (citizen), and Elizabeth Schmitz (Kentucky Environmental Education Council).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. Standards exist for all students without regard to disabilities. It is the responsibility of all teachers of students with disabilities to provide appropriate modifications and accommodations based on the child's specific disability and the child's Individual Education Plan.

The agency agrees that the Next Generation Science Standards will benefit all students, regardless of their disability status. Appendix D of the Next Generation Science Standards contains case studies illustrating how the standards can be effectively implemented with diverse students, including those with disabilities.

- (23) Subject Matter: General Comments Related to Assessment
 - (a) Comments: A commenter said that the people writing the assessments are communists.

Commenters posed questions regarding assessment under the Next Generation Science Standards.

Those speaking or offering written comments were: Richard G Innes (Bluegrass Institute for Public Policy Solutions), Elsie Hall (Citizen), Maureen Carman (Attorney), and Cindy Rausch (Citizen).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency has not investigated the political beliefs of the drafters of assessment tools and so cannot respond to the factual allegation regarding communism. The proposed regulation relates entirely to academic standards, and not to assessment, so no response to this comment is required.

(24) Subject Matter: General Regulation Changes

(a) Comment: Commenters requested four (4) changes to the document incorporated into this regulation (by reference) to ensure alignment with recent changes to 704 KAR 3:305.

Speaking or offering written comments requesting changes to the terms contained in the regulation were: Malicia T. Hitch (Protection and Advocacy).

(b) Response: No changes have been made in response to these comments. The agency agrees that these comments are well taken and the changes to the document incorporated by reference should be made, although it is most efficient to change the document incorporated by reference after all standards have been revised, as mandated by SB 1 (2009), rather than making such changes piecemeal, upon the revision of each set of standards.

Summary of Statement of Consideration and Action Taken by Promulgating Administrative Body

The agency has received significant comment related on 704 KAR 3:303, Required Academic Standards. Comments may be broadly categorized as: 1) general support for the science standards, 2) statements related to the continued inclusion of evolution, 3) statements related to the inclusion of climate change, 4) college and career readiness and economic impact, and 5) the lack of clarity regarding the roles of standards versus curriculum in education and implications of local control in curriculum decisions.

The agency received overwhelming support for the proposed science standards. A petition with 3700 names was submitted in support of the standards. Statements of support were

received from organizations such as the National Science Teachers Association, the Kentucky Science Teachers Association, the Kentucky Academy of Sciences, the Council of State Science Supervisors, the Kentucky Environmental Education Council, the Kentucky Section of the American Institute of Professional Geologists, and the Kentucky Association for Environmental Education. Supportive comments were also received from individual citizens. Common reasons cited in support of the standards included: positive economic impacts, improved college and career readiness, improved scientific literacy, and the need to foster the skills required to compete in the 21st Century.

The agency also received statements of support related to the inclusion of particular science topics such as climate change and evolution, stating that meaningful scientific debate on the validity of evolution and climate science has ceased. Proponents of the continued inclusion of evolution pointed to the overwhelming acceptance of evolution in the biological science community. Proponents of the inclusion of climate change education contend that Kentucky students deserve the most up to date science education, which includes climate change.

The agency also received comments in opposition. Over one hundred substantially identical emails were received stating an opposition to the continued inclusion of evolution in the proposed standards, characterizing evolution as a theory and not a fact. These commenters asked that intelligent design be added to the standards. Other commenters questioned the scientific validity of evolution. The agency also received several comments specific to the inclusion of climate change in the proposed standards, including concerns that climate change science was overemphasized to the neglect of other science concepts or that climate change is not a settled issue in the scientific community.

Some commenters cited a Thomas B. Fordham Institute report as a basis for opposing the adoption of the proposed science standards, claiming insufficient rigor for high school science courses. Some commenters expressed concern that the proposed standards will exclude many students with disabilities due to the standards' complexity. Conversely, other commenters expressed confidence that the standards will lead to scientifically literate graduates that will be better prepared than current graduates who are beginning post secondary experiences and will contribute meaningfully to Kentucky's economy as members of a better prepared workforce.

Some comments reflected a lack of familiarity with the distinction between curriculum and standards, and the role of local district control of curriculum. Commenters suggested the inclusion of specific scientific topics that were not in the proposed standards. Several comments were not within the scope of this regulation.

The agency received comments in opposition to the Common Core standards. Those standards were adopted by the Kentucky Board of Education in 2010 and are not the focus of this regulation revision. The agency received comments on these standards because they are included in the document incorporated by reference in this regulation. Commenters in opposition to the Common Core claimed the Common Core standards are not rigorous, were developed by the federal government, have not been field tested, are not evidence-based, will be excessively costly to implement and were not validated by the entire validation

committee. Some commenters said the Common Core allow personal information to be collected on students.

The agency, having given thoughtful consideration to all comments submitted by the public, has made no changes to the proposed regulation.